

INVOLVEMENT OF INFORMAL ACTORS IN PARKING MANAGEMENT AT PASAR ANYAR TANGERANG

Mahduni Dhanu Masyahid

¹ Ilmu Pemerintahan Universitas Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa, Serang, Indonesia
mahdun221@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Keywords:

Flower
Bouquet,
Strategy,
Creativity

Article Info:

Submitted:
30/05/2025

Revised:
2/08/2025

Published:
7/09/2025

This research writing analyzes the involvement of informal actors in parking management at Pasar Anyar Tangerang and explains the contestation of power of the involvement of informal actors outside formal institutions. Using a qualitative research method according to Cresswell with one of the phenomenological approaches to provide an understanding of the meaning of the experience of life justice of the involvement of informal actors in the inconsistency of parking management rules at Pasar Anyar Tangerang. The results of the study describe that the involvement of informal actors such as illegal parking attendants, local thugs, and community organizations is not just a violation of the law, but also a response to the weakness of supervision and the absence of the state in the Pasar Anyar Tangerang area. Parking management becomes an arena for power contestation between PT. Tangerang Nusantara Global (PT. TNG) as the official manager with local informal actors. Using Robert Cribb's theory of the exception system with three indicators of state weakness, disconnection between law and moral values, and a fragile social contract. This study recommends the integration of informal actors into the official parking system and strengthening of participatory governance for long-term solutions in sustainable parking management.

INTRODUCTION

Urban governance in Indonesia is often characterized by the coexistence and contestation between formal state structures and informal social practices, especially in sectors such as street-level parking. In densely populated and economically vital public areas like traditional markets, state apparatus frequently fails to enforce regulations effectively, leaving room for alternative governance structures to emerge. Pasar Anyar in Tangerang

City exemplifies this condition. As one of the busiest traditional markets in Banten Province, the area draws thousands of vehicles daily, generating intense demand for parking space and turning the site into a locus of contestation over public authority (Febryano et al., 2015; Priyanto, 2017; Syafiuddin, 2018).

Urban planning observer Nirwono Yoga, argues that illegal parking has emerged and mushroomed along with high community mobility, in the implication that the government is unable to provide parking space and the government is still experiencing weak law enforcement on parking management (BBC News Indonesia, 2024). The government's inability to address the shortcomings in parking management has resulted in the presence of substitutes for the role of the community who become illegal parking attendants.

The emergence of the problem of illegal parking attendants is often related to the initiative of several community members or community organizations (Ormas) who use their land as a parking lot, the existence of a certain large or crowded activity in a public space, not to mention the celebration of big days which often violate the rules of the law on parking fees which are quite high, to the existence of an illegal parking collector from parking attendants who are affiliated with informal government parties to deposit parking fees so that the implementation and supervision of parking management regulations are problematic (Sahri, 2023).

Legally, the parking system in Pasar Anyar is managed by PT. Tangerang Nusantara Global (PT. TNG), a municipally owned company (BUMD) operating under the regional transportation policy. PT. TNG implements both electronic and manual gate systems and sets standardized tariffs as mandated by local regulations. However, based on field observations and interview data, formal management is limited only to certain entry gates and central points, leaving the majority of side roads and peripheral zones unregulated. In these unmanaged areas, informal actors—such as unauthorized parking attendants, local thugs, and members of community-based organizations—take control. As one respondent from PT. TNG admitted, “PT. TNG hanya memiliki kekuatan regulasi... untuk menertibkan para juru parkir liar menjadi tugas wewenang Satpol PP, Dinas Perhubungan dan juga Kepolisian Daerah” (Wawancara dengan Bapak Ferdy Firman Kepala Bidang Perparkiran PT. TNG, 24 Oktober 2024).

This governance gap leads to exploitative practices such as double charging, where users are forced to pay twice—once at the official gate, and again to informal attendants

inside the market. For instance, one visitor stated: “Saya sudah membayar di gerbang pintu masuk sebesar Rp2.000,-, tapi di dalam diminta lagi oleh juru parkir Rp4.000,- tanpa karcis resmi” (Putra, 2023). The formal parking ticket thus holds little authority, especially in areas dominated by informal groups. These groups justify their actions through claims of daily service, presence, and contribution to local order.

Informal actors gain legitimacy through consistent physical presence and perceived functionality. As Bang Diki, an informal attendant, stated, “Kalau hari biasa, jarang banget kelihatan petugas. Kita yang ngatur kendaraan dan jagain biar aman” (Wawancara Bang Diki Juru Parkir Liar Pasar Anyar Tangerang, 2 Mei 2025). His comments reflect a broader public sentiment that the state, through PT. TNG, is symbolically present but materially absent. Meanwhile, actors like Bang Ayub openly acknowledged their arrangements with formal institutions: “Saya sendiri setiap hari setor ke pihak PT. TNG sebanyak Rp200.000 untuk motor dan Rp200.000 untuk mobil, supaya aktivitas jalan terus tanpa gangguan” (Wawancara Bang Ayub Tokoh Premanisme Pasar Anyar Tangerang, 30 April 2025). This tacit negotiation suggests a form of co-governance based on informal compromise rather than legal clarity.

As a result, Pasar Anyar becomes a battleground, where multiple layers of authority and legitimacy compete over the same public space. While PT. TNG holds legal mandate, informal actors assert control through social embeddedness, economic necessity, and informal networks. Their persistence is not solely due to defiance but stems from functional responses to state inefficiency and local socio-economic realities. This condition can be analyzed using the System of Exemptions framework proposed by Robert Cribb, which explains how illegal practices are normalized when the state fails to enforce its own laws, particularly when these practices fill governance vacuums effectively.

Cribb (Aspinall & van Klinken, 2011) outlines three indicators of such a system: (1) weak state capacity, as reflected in limited monitoring and regulation; (2) disconnection between formal law and social morality, where legality lacks moral legitimacy; and (3) a fragile social contract, where citizens disengage from state authority due to broken public trust. In Pasar Anyar, these elements manifest clearly. Therefore, this study investigates how informal parking governance is produced, legitimized, and sustained in Pasar Anyar Tangerang. Using Cribb’s framework, this paper aims to provide a critical analysis of the embeddedness of informality in public service, and how state failure contributes to the normalization of non-state governance in Indonesian urban settings.

METHOD

The approach used in this research is a qualitative research method with a case study approach. Creswell defines qualitative research as a kind of study that tries to find and understand the significance in the experiences of a number of individuals or groups of people who have been affected by social problems (Creswell, 2012). With a phenomenological approach, researchers seek experiences regarding the meaning of justice in the involvement of informal actors in the non-compliance of parking regulations at Pasar Anyar Tangerang. Data were collected through in-depth interviews, field observations, and document analysis. Informants were selected using purposive sampling, comprising parking attendants (both formal and informal), PT. TNG officials, market vendors, visitors, and local organization members (e.g., Karang Taruna and Pemuda Pancasila).

The primary method of data collection was semi-structured interviews, allowing flexibility to explore deeper dynamics. Observations focused on parking locations, the behavior of attendants, and payment practices. Documents reviewed included local regulations, operational SOPs from PT. TNG, and government reports. All data were analyzed thematically, guided by Robert Cribb's System of Exemptions, particularly focusing on the three indicators: state weakness, disconnection between law and social values, and fragility of the social contract.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Parking management at Pasar Anyar Tangerang has its complexities. The Pasar Anyar Tangerang area is one of the traditional markets in the Tangerang City area. A traditional market has a common thread of formal and informal parties with their own characteristics. The market area is an arena where various mobilities meet in fulfilling clothing, food and shelter. Of course, there must be management of space that is intended for the public, one of which is parking management as a reflection in it (Alfaraz, 2022; Kusumawati, 2017; Soge, 2019)

Parking management at Pasar Anyar Tangerang is officially the task and authority of the government whose authority is mandated to the Regional-Owned Enterprise (BUMD) named PT. Tangerang Nusantara Global (PT. TNG). In a fairly strategic area as a traditional market, it is closely linked to significant social mobility. One of them is getting in and out of vehicles as one way to reach access to the Pasar Anyar area, there is often a misalignment of the rules with what should be carried out. These roles are usually carried out by various informal actors outside the official authority who should be responsible for the parking

system in Pasar Anyar Tangerang. The emergence of informal actors in parking is commonly known as illegal parking attendants. This cannot be separated from the lack of supervision of official parking officers and the economic needs of the surrounding community.

The emergence of informal actors in parking management in the Pasar Anyar Tangerang area is a direct reaction to the failure of the formal regulatory system in adjusting to existing social conditions. Such as the inconsistency of regulations with existing practices in the field, the inaccessibility of all parking service points, and creating opportunities for economic fulfillment from the community who see a gap that can be filled from the lack of government supervision.

Pasar Anyar Tangerang is one of the oldest and largest traditional market categories in the Tangerang City area which is a legendary icon and pride of the Tangerang community. Historically, Pasar Anyar Tangerang was established in 1967 which has become one of the parts of fulfilling the needs of clothing, food and shelter for the Tangerang City community. Over time, the management mandate of Pasar Anyar Tangerang was given authority to the Tangerang Market Regional Company in 2003 with the legal umbrella of Tangerang City Regional Regulation No. 3 of 2003 as an asset of the Tangerang City government which is separated and managed by the Tangerang City Market Regional Company (Perusahaan Daerah Pasar Kota Tangerang, 2017).

From the economic side, Pasar Anyar plays a role in the economy of the Tangerang community, the capacity of Pasar Anyar Tangerang accommodates at least 2,500 traders with various types of trade ranging from basic necessities, textiles, jewelry, electronics, to Tangerang culinary specialties, with an estimated transaction reaching IDR 8-10 billion per day (Perusahaan Daerah Pasar Kota Tangerang, 2024). At least the transaction value and number of traders show the economic interaction and also the social complexity of Pasar Anyar Tangerang.

1. The Weakness of the State in Public Space Control

The findings confirm that the state's institutional limitations are central to the persistence of informal parking actors in Pasar Anyar. While PT. TNG is legally appointed as the parking manager, their operational presence is minimal. As noted in the interview with PT. TNG official Ferdy Firman, "PT. TNG tetap harus meminta bantuan Satpol PP, Dinas Perhubungan dan juga Kepolisian Daerah dengan mekanisme birokrasi persuratan

serta berjenjang” (Wawancara, 24 Oktober 2024). This bureaucratic bottleneck reduces enforcement efficiency and creates governance gaps.

In the absence of consistent enforcement, informal actors have seized control. Areas unmonitored by PT. TNG are “diisi oleh orang-orang kita karena nggak ada petugas yang jaga,” explained Bang Ayub, an informal coordinator (Wawancara, 30 April 2025). These actors create their own sub-regulations and territory boundaries, often operating without fear of penalty due to tacit agreements or selective enforcement.

2. Legitimacy Conflict: Formal Law vs. Social Morality

While the law classifies these informal parking practices as illegal, many community members perceive them as legitimate. The moral legitimacy of informal actors stems from their daily visibility and service provision. Bang Diki emphasized, “Kalau bukan kita yang jaga, kendaraan bisa rawan hilang. Kita nongkrong terus di lapangan” (Wawancara, 2 Mei 2025). This reflects a disconnection between formal legal authority and public trust.

Moral legitimacy is further reinforced when formal systems fail to deliver equitable services. Many market users complained about being charged twice once officially and once by informal attendants. “Saya pegang karcis parkir PT. TNG Rp2.000,-, tapi diminta lagi Rp4.000,- di dalam oleh orang yang ngaku pengatur parkir,” a visitor noted. In such cases, the formal system is not only untrusted but also seen as complicit in enabling informal operations.

3. Fragility of the Social Contract

A key consequence of overlapping formal-informal control is the erosion of the public’s trust in the state. The parking system, as it operates in Pasar Anyar, reflects a broken social contract citizens fulfill obligations (such as paying formal fees) but do not receive services or protection in return. This creates a sense of betrayal, particularly when informal actors openly admit to revenue-sharing with formal authorities. As Bang Ayub stated, “Setoran ke pihak TNG itu rutin. Biar nggak diganggu dan kita bisa tetap narik di titik itu” (Wawancara, 30 April 2025).

This dual system also disadvantages those who lack access to informal networks. Bang Ucok lamented, “Yang punya akses ke petugas resmi bisa lebih diuntungkan, sementara yang jaga lapangan tiap hari kadang malah dianggap liar” (Wawancara, 27 April 2025). Here, the concept of justice becomes relative, shaped by informal access and not legal fairness.

The empirical findings affirm Robert Cribb's theory that illegalities can become institutionally normalized when the state is weak and law loses moral force. The case of Pasar Anyar demonstrates how informal power networks can replicate the structure of governance complete with fee systems, territorial divisions, and negotiated legitimacy creating a hybrid order that challenges the state's exclusive authority.

CONCLUSION

The case of Pasar Anyar in Tangerang illustrates how informal actors emerge and persist not simply as lawbreakers, but as alternatives to state failure. Weak enforcement, bureaucratic fragmentation, and the absence of consistent field presence allow informal actors to fill functional gaps left by formal institutions. Over time, this leads to a legitimacy crisis, where informal governance is socially accepted and even preferred by market users.

Applying Cribb's System of Exemptions reveals that the normalization of informal parking in Pasar Anyar reflects three key failures of urban governance: (1) the state's inability to implement and enforce its own rules, (2) the public's rejection of laws that do not reflect local moral expectations, and (3) the erosion of mutual obligations between state and citizen. To restore public trust and authority, the state must not only enforce rules but also acknowledge and integrate local actors into a transparent, inclusive, and fair system of urban public service delivery.

REFERENCES

- Alfaraz, M. N. (2022). Implementasi Tarif Retribusi Parkir Berdasarkan Peraturan Daerah Kota Tangerang Nomor 3 Tahun 2014 tentang Retribusi Jasa Usaha. *Jurnal Hukum Adigama*, 5(1), 1471.
- Aspinall, E., & Klinken, G. van. (2011). *The State and Illegality In Indonesia*. KITLV is an institute of the Royal Netherlands Academy of Arts and Sciences (KNAW).
- BBC News Indonesia. (2024, May 18). Polemik penertiban parkir liar yang disebut tidak selesaikan akar persoalan, mengapa sulit diberantas? BBC.Com. <https://www.bbc.com/indonesia/articles/cjmk973lg8ko>
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). Penelitian Kualitatif & Desain Riset Memilih Diantara Lima Pendekatan. In *Public Administration* (Vol. 77, Issue 4). <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9299.00177>

- Febryano, I. G., Suharjito, D., Darusman, D., Kusmana, D., & Hidayat, A. (2015). Aktor Dan Relasi Kekuasaan Dalam Pengelolaan Mangrove Di Kabupaten Pesawaran, Provinsi Lampung, Indonesia (Actors and Power Relation in Mangrove Management in Pesawaran Regency, Lampung Province, Indonesia). *Jurnal Analisis Kebijakan Kehutanan*, 12(2), 125–142.
http://repository.lppm.unila.ac.id/38/1/Publikasi_Jurnal.pdf
- Kusumawati, T. (2017). Arena Kontestasi: Ekonomi Politik Pasar Tradisional di Perkotaan Jawa. *Jurnal Sosiologi Masyarakat*, 22(2), 195–212.
- Perusahaan Daerah Pasar Kota Tangerang. (2017). Selayang Pandang Perumda Pasar Kota Tangerang. Website Resmi Perum Pasar Kota Tangerang.
<https://perumdapasarkotatangerang.co.id/page/viewname/selayang-pandang>
- Perusahaan Daerah Pasar Kota Tangerang. (2024). Informasi Pasar Anyar. Website Resmi Perum Pasar Kota Tangerang.
<https://perumdapasarkotatangerang.co.id/market/information>
- Priyanto, J. (2017). Wacana, Kuasa Dan Agama Dalam Kontestasi Pilgub Jakarta Tinjauan Relasi Kuasa Dan Pengetahuan Foucault (Vol. 18, Issue 2).
- Putra, F. D. (2023). Lagi, Warga Resah Gegara Bayar Tarif Parkir Berkali-kali di Pasar Anyar Tangerang. *Tangerangnews.Com*.
- Sahri, S. (2023, December 5). Balada Tukang Parkir di Indonesia. *Omong- Omong.Com*.
<https://omong-omong.com/balada-tukang-parkir-di-indonesia/>
- Soge, A. V. (2019). Persepsi Masyarakat Tentang Keberadaan Juru Parkir Liar Di Pasar Segiri & Samarinda Square Kecamatan Samarinda Ulu. *EJournal Sosiatri-Sosiologi*, 7(1), 103–115.
- Syafiuddin, A. (2018). Pengaruh Kekuasaan Atas Pengetahuan (Memahami Teori Relasi Kuasa Michel Foucault).