The Effect Of Education And Training (Diklat) On The Performance Of State Civil Servants (ASN) In Indonesia: A Comparative Review Based On Empirical Studies

Anna Qomariyah [1*], Nur Wening [2]

[1] Master's Degree in Management Postgraduate Program, Yogyakarta University of Technology, Yogyakarta, Indonesia
*Email correspondence: anna.6240111003@student.uty.ac.id

Abstract

Background. The effectiveness of bureaucracy and public services depends on improving the performance of the State Civil Apparatus (ASN).

Aims. Education and training are considered strategic tools to achieve these goals. However, empirical research has found various findings regarding the direct influence of training on performance.

Methods. In an effort to study the relationship between training and ASN performance, a comparative review of a number of quantitative and qualitative studies was conducted from 2020 to 2025.

Result. The analysis reveals that, although many studies demonstrate a positive and significant influence of training, other studies have found that this influence is only partial. Additional variables, such as work discipline, competence, work environment, and leadership, are identified in this analysis as factors that moderate and mediate the relationship.

Conclusion. In summary, the success of training depends on the organizational context, the design of training programs, and collaboration with other components that support performance.

Keywords: ASN, ASN performance, Education and Training, Publish or Perish (PoP), Systematic Literature Review (SLR).

INTRODUCTION

In today's era, the existence of reliable human resources is very important for organizations. Human resources are the main asset and key variable in the implementation of the organization, including government agencies (Sunari & Hamizar, 2023). Employees are needed to achieve the vision. Employee performance is very important to improve and advance the company's business. Organizations need to put employees in the right position so

that their performance can be maximized. It is no less important to understand employee performance in order to increase organizational productivity.   (Ardiansyah et al., 2021)

The performance of the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) plays an important role in the administration of government and a good level of public services. The government consistently invests in human resource development through various programs. One of the main programs is education and training, which aims to improve the knowledge, skills, and attitudes (competencies) of civil servants so that they can carry out their duties and functions professionally and effectively.

For employees in an agency, education and training are very important. That the educational background of employees is greatly influenced by their training. Education is the basis for carrying out the tasks imposed on employees. Education and training can help with career development and improve employee knowledge. They can also build friendships with people from various agencies. During training, it can train employees to dare to speak about training materials.

Education and training is one of the tools to adjust tasks and jobs to the abilities, skills, or abilities and expertise of each employee and is an effort to improve employee performance. The training given to employees will encourage them to work harder. This is because employees who know their duties and responsibilities well will try to achieve a higher level of work morale.

Education and training are tailored to an individual's expertise and skills to meet their expectations and goals. This activity is designed to address problems promptly and effectively, thereby enhancing the performance of individual employees and the institution/agency as a whole. In Indonesia, the central government and decentralized municipal governments run education and training programs for the State Civil Apparatus.

Training is conceptually essential, but empirical evidence of their influence on performance often shows different outcomes. While other studies have found that the effect of training is insignificant when tested separately (partially), some studies have found a strong positive association. Due to this diversity of results, a more thorough analysis is necessary to understand the components that cause the difference.

This article aims to compare and synthesize various relevant research results in the last five years. By comparing the methodologies, samples, and main findings of these studies, this

Anna Qomariyah

review will outline the pattern of the relationship between training and ASN performance, as well as highlight the roles of intervening variables and other *antecedents*.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Education and Training

According to (Budiharjo, 2018), education is a conscious and planned effort to create a learning atmosphere and learning process so that students actively develop their potential to have religious spiritual strength, self-control, personality, intelligence, noble morals, and skills needed by themselves, society, nation and state. Education is a deliberate and organized effort to create a learning environment and process in which students can develop various aspects of themselves, such as intelligence, morality, spiritual potential, self-control, personality, and skills, which are essential for every person, society, nation, and country as a whole

According to Armstrong, as quoted by Hadiningrat in the book (Hadiningrat et al., 2023), training is the systematic development of the knowledge, skills, and attitudes required by a person to perform adequately in their tasks and jobs. Training is a systematic process in which individuals or groups are provided with new knowledge, skills, or understanding to enhance their performance in a specific field. Training can occur in various contexts, including formal education in schools or colleges, professional training in the workplace, or informal training in everyday life.

Employee Performance

Performance shows how well a company or organization's goals are being achieved. According to Lijan Poltak Sinambela's Theory (2019), performance is the ability of an employee to perform a specific skill or expertise. A worker's performance helps determine their ability to complete tasks. According to Indonesian Government Regulation Number 30 of 2019 concerning the Performance of the State Civil Apparatus (ASN), the work performance of an ASN is the result of their work under an organization or unit that is under the objectives of ASN performance and work behavior. An ASN is also assigned a performance plan and annual targets, which must be achieved in the form of Employee Performance Targets (SKP).

Additionally, civil servants can utilize the Community Satisfaction Index (IKM) to evaluate how effectively their services align with community standards and expectations over a specified period. Performance is also the result of a person's work and responsibilities as

demonstrated by their actions. Therefore, the implementation of a sustainable reward and punishment system along with a strict supervision and control system significantly affects the performance and efficiency of civil servants in providing public services. (Sugiyanto   et al., 2025)

An organization, agency, or company is formed to achieve a specific goal. Organizational behavior and attitudes play a significant role in achieving these goals. Assessing employee performance, or their ability to complete tasks or roles assigned by the organization, is an everyday activity performed by organizations. According to the definition, employee performance is the result of work that includes the quality and quantity achieved by a person in carrying out their duties and responsibilities. Meanwhile, according to Knerja, the results achieved by a person in completing the assigned tasks are based on their ability, seriousness, and time. Performance consists of three crucial components: the worker's ability and interests, the acceptance of the explanation of tasks and roles, and the worker's level of motivation. (Falah & Ayuningtias, 2020)   (Suwati , 2013)   (Arianty , 2014)

By considering the various interpretations of the above data, it can be concluded that employee performance is defined as the amount of work assigned to employees under the set standards. Thus, the most vital element to achieve optimal performance is human resources. If workers are unqualified and unmotivated, good planning will be in vain. An employee's work must be able to make a significant contribution to the company, as assessed by the quality and quantity perceived by the company. The results of the work must be of great benefit to the company's current and future interests. (Jufrizen & Hadi, 2021)

METHODS

This research, which employs a Systematic Literature Review (SLR), begins by identifying the problem to be discussed. In addition, this study will investigate the impact of education and training on the performance of civil servants in Indonesia. Furthermore, the appropriate literature to discuss the problem is selected, taking into account the predetermined conditions. In this study, the Publish or Perish (PoP) application was used to search for literature journals. Once the literature has been collected, the next step is to review the details of the literature to gather information about the topic being sought.

The *Systematic Literature Review* (SLR) approach itself, proposed by Tranfield et al. (2003), aims to answer research questions comprehensively and thoroughly. Identification, research, evaluation, and interpretation of existing research are the methods used to apply this

Anna Qomariyah

approach. The researcher examined articles relevant to the research question. Due to its ability to provide rigorous, honest, and unbiased research reviews, SLR has become an increasingly popular method in the field of management and organizations. (Alifah et al., 2023) Applying pre-defined quality criteria, the SLR assesses all relevant studies and extracts findings that are deemed "good enough" quality (Van Rooyen et al., 2012). This rigorous process allows researchers to identify key scientific contributions in the area of research under review (Becheikh et al., 2006).

To reduce bias and ensure that all relevant and quality studies are considered in this review, SLR is used in this study to provide an objective and comprehensive picture of the progress of research, implementation, and promising future research areas related to the topic to be discussed. This is crucial for enhancing the credibility and validity of the findings. Each process is reviewed in an organized and systematic manner by following the steps that have been determined. After that, the researcher conducts a thorough examination of the evaluated articles. (Triandini et al., 2019) *The Systematic Literature Review* uses five steps: (1) creating research questions; (2) identify and collect articles that are appropriate to the research question; (3) carry out inclusion, classification, and exclusion/evaluation by selecting articles that have been collected; (4) display and process data; and (5) interpret the results of the research in the article. (Nurfadilah et al., 2022) (Fitriani & Putra, 2022) .

The first step is to determine the theme to be studied. The theme of this research is to take the theme "The Influence of Education and Training on the Performance of the State Civil Apparatus (ASN): A Comparative Review Based on Empirical Studies to be used in the research. Literature study data collection was conducted by searching for Google Scholar articles using the Publish or Perish (PoP) application and *the keyword* "ASN Education and Training". The articles limit the number to 200 articles from 2019 to 2025. Then, it is filtered through the selection stages one by one based on the article's content. After analysis, 43 articles were identified as suitable, specifically those related to the system for implementing education and training in ASN. Furthermore, from 43 articles, the most relevant articles will be selected for the topic being researched. Out of 43 articles, 11 articles were selected that will be reviewed, analyzed, and reviewed in detail, and related to the theme studied. The following chart outlines the stages carried out by the researcher in conducting an SLR literature study using PoP.

DISCUSSION

From the results of the screening using the Publish or Perish (PoP) application, 11 journal articles related to the topic of the influence of education and training on the performance of civil servants in Indonesia were obtained.

Table 1. The Influence of Education and Training on the Performance of Civil Servants in Indonesia: A Comparative Review Based on Empirical Studies

Method	Author/Year	Heading	Purpose	Result
Approach: Quantitative Sample: 68 employees (saturated sample) Analysis: Multiple regression with *Statistical Package for the Social Sciences* (SPSS) 22	(Taba Muhammad Ihsan et al., 2021)	The Influence of Education, Training (Diklat), Discipline, and Leadership on the Performance of ASN at the Regional Personnel and Training Agency (BKPPD) of Selayar Islands Regency	1) Knowing and analyzing the influence of education, training, and discipline on the performance of ASN 2) Knowing and analyzing the influence of discipline on ASN performance 3) Knowing and analyzing the influence of leadership on the performance of ASN	1) Training, discipline, and leadership partially have a significant effect on the performance of ASN. 2) Education and training are the variables that have the most dominant influence on performance
Approach: Quantitative Sample: 37 ASN at Besuki Hospital (saturated sampling) Analysis: Structural Equation Model – Partial Least Square (PLS-SEM) with Smart PLS 3.0	(Marharani et al., 2022)	The Influence of Education and Training on ASN Performance Through Work Discipline as an Intervening Variable at Besuki Hospital, Situbondo Regency	Analyzing the influence of training on ASN Performance with Work Discipline as a mediation variable	1) Training has a significant positive effect on Work Discipline and ASN Performance. 2) Work Discipline has succeeded in mediating the influence of Training on ASN Performance.
Approach: Quantitative Sample: 32 people (saturated sampling) Analysis: Multiple Linear Regression Analysis	(Figures A. Fitri Sugi & M. Muhajir Sutina, 2023)	The Influence of Education and Training, Allowances, and Workload on ASN Performance	To find out the partial and simultaneous relationship between training, allowances, and workload on the performance of ASN at KPKNL Parepare.	1) Partially, Education and Training have no significant effect on performance. 2) Simultaneously, training (together with allowances and workload) has a significant effect on performance

Approach: Quantitative Sample: 55 ASN respondents (census) Analysis: Multiple regression with SPSS	(Suseno Agus et al., 2022)	The Influence of Education, Training, Competence, and Work Environment on the Performance of ASN of the Pasuruan Regency Livestock and Food Security Service	Knowing the influence of training, competence, and work environment on ASN performance	1) Training and Competence partially do not affect performance. 2) The Work Environment variable is the most dominant one that affects performance. 3) Simultaneously, all three variables have a significant effect on performance.
Approach: Quantitative Sample: 45 ASN officers Analysis: Multiple linear regression with SPSS	(Nas et al., 2023)	The Effect of Education and Training (Diklat) on the Work Performance of State Civil Apparatus Employees (ASN) at the Village Office in Minasatene District, Pangkep Regency	1) To find out the influence of education on the work performance of employees at the village office in Minasetene District, Pangkep Regency. 2) To find out the effect of training on employee work performance at the village office in Minasetene District, Pangkep Regency. 3) To find out the influence of simultaneous education and training on the work performance of employees at the village office in Minasetene District, Pangkep Regency	1) Education and Training partially have a positive and significant effect on work performance. 2) Simultaneously, both explain 37.3% variation in work performance.
Approach: Quantitative	(Marharani et al., 2022)	The Influence of Education and Training and	Knowing the relationship between training	1) Training has a positive and significant effect

		Discipline on the Performance of Civil Servants at the Education and Culture Office of Situbondo Regency	and discipline with the performance and job satisfaction of ASN	on job satisfaction 2) The relationship between training and discipline was found to be not interrelated in influencing performance
Sample: 106 ASN (saturated sample) Analysis: Smart PLS 3.0.				
Approach: Descriptive Qualitative Data Sources: Observations, interviews (5 speakers), and documentation	(Stuart & Scott, 2023)	Analysis of the Role of Education and Training in Improving the Professionalism of Performance and Communication of ASN BKPSDM Banyumas Regency.	Analyzing the role of training in improving professionalism, performance, and interpersonal communication of ASN	1) Training has a strategic role in developing the competence of ASN 2) Effective interpersonal communication is an important factor for organizational performance 3) Training Needs Analysis (AKD) is a crucial stage for designing effective and efficient training.
Approach: Descriptive Analytics Data Source: Literature Review	(Tursina Cicha Ramadani Siti Rahmah, 2024)	The Importance of Education and Training of State Civil Apparatus Towards the Smart Era ASN Proud to Serve	Identifying relevant training approaches to form *Smart ASN*	1) Training is a key component for the transformation towards *Smart ASN* with integrity, professionalism, global insight, and IT mastery 2) The development of ASN human resources must be based on three main aspects: talent, competence, and durability
Approach: Quantitative. Sample: 60 respondents (Tax Auditors who have received training), using *purposive sampling techniques*. Analysis: *Structural Equation Modeling* (SEM)	(Istiqomah et al., 2025)	The Influence of Education and Training on the Performance of Audit Employees at the Directorate General of Taxes	Knowing the influence of education and training (Diklat) on employee performance, with competence as a mediation variable	1) Training has a positive effect on Employee Performance, with a contribution of 65% 2) Employee competence also has a positive effect on performance, with a

				contribution of 48% 3) The indirect influence of training on performance through competence is 27%, with a total influence (direct and indirect) of 84%
Approach: Quantitative Descriptive. Sample: 56 people (the entire population of civil servants in the office) Analysis: Simple Linear Regression and t-test.	(Siswati et al., 2021)	The Influence of Education and Training (diklat) on the Performance of Civil Servants at the Batang Hari Regency Education and Culture Office	Knowing the influence of Education and Training (Diklat) on the Performance of Civil Servants at the Batanghari Regency Education and Culture Office	1) Education and Training (Diklat) has a significant effect on employee performance (t-calculated value 6,626 > t-table 1.67303) 2) The Education and Training variable contributed 44.8% to the Employee Performance variable, while the remaining 55.2% was influenced by other factors
Approach: Quantitative. Sample: 31 people (the entire population of civil servants in the service) used the saturated sampling technique. Analysis: Multiple linear regression with SPSS version 25	(Istiqomah et al., 2025)	The Influence of Education and Training on the Performance of Civil Servants (PNS)	Knowing the influence of education and training on the performance of civil servants at the Department of Industry, Trade and Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises of Paser Regency	1) Educational variables partially do not have a significant effect on performance 2) The training variable partially had a significant effect on performance (t-count 6.038 > t-table 2.04841) 3) Simultaneously (together), education and training affect performance by 70.7%

A large number of studies provide strong empirical evidence of a positive and significant relationship between training and ASN performance. These findings directly support the *Human Capital Theory*, which posits that investing in an individual's knowledge, skills, and abilities will directly enhance their productivity and performance. The study by Taba et al. even placed education and training as the variable with the most dominant influence on the performance of ASN in Selayar Islands Regency. Quantitative support is also clearly evident in the research of Hesti Umiyati et al., who found that training makes a direct contribution of 65% to the performance of tax audit employees. Similarly, research by Etty Siswati et al. found that training had a significant impact on the performance of civil servants at the Education and Culture Office of Batang Hari Regency, accounting for a 44.8% contribution. At the same time, Nas et al. found that training partially had a positive and significant effect on the work performance of employees in Minasatene District.

This evidence collectively shows that practical training serves as a tool to accumulate human capital for civil servants, which in turn translates into better work outcomes. This is in line with the highest level in Kirkpatrick's training evaluation model, "Results", where the impact of training is measured at the organizational level, including performance improvement.

While there is much positive evidence, few studies present an interesting paradox. Research by Sugi Angka, Sutina, and Suseno et al. found that, to some extent, training did not have a significant effect on performance. Interestingly, these two studies still found that when tested together (simultaneously) with other variables (such as benefits, workload, competence, and work environment), training also had a significant influence on performance. This suggests that training may not be a single driver, but rather part of an ecosystem of factors that collectively enhance performance.

This phenomenon can be well explained through *Contingency Theory*. This theory states that there is no one *best way* to manage, and that the effectiveness of a practice (in this case, training) depends on situational or contextual factors. The above findings provide a clear example of this theory in practice. Training does not operate in a vacuum. The effect on performance depends on the presence or absence of supporting factors.

The AMO (Ability, Motivation, Opportunity) framework is also relevant here.

- Ability: The training directly aims to improve the capabilities of ASN.

- Motivation: Factors such as allowances (researched by Sugi Angka & Sutina) and a positive work environment (researched by Suseno et al., 2022) play a role as motivational drivers.
- Opportunity: A supportive work environment and a reasonable workload provide opportunities for ASN to apply new skills acquired from training.

Without motivation and opportunity, improving skills through training will not be enough to produce a significant increase in performance. This explains why the effect of training only appears when analyzed together with these variables. The studies analyzed provide important clues to the psychological and behavioral processes that mediate these relationships.

Research by Hesti Umiyati et al. explicitly measured the role of competency mediation, finding that the indirect influence of training on performance through competence was 27%. This suggests that the primary path of impact of training is first to build relevant competencies. A study by Marharani et al. shows that Work Discipline successfully mediates the influence of Training on performance. This means that training forms disciplinary attitudes and behaviors that, in turn, encourage better performance. However, complexity remains, because Anita Sarri et al. found that the relationship between Training and Discipline is not interrelated in influencing performance in the context of their research.

Interestingly, Anita Sari et al. found that training has a significant effect on job satisfaction. This is an important affective (emotional) outcome. Meanwhile, Suseno et al. even found that the work environment was the most dominant variable affecting performance, exceeding training. This suggests that context factors may have a more substantial influence than the training intervention itself.

The discussion will not be complete without looking at the strategic aspect. The success of training is not only determined by its implementation, but starts far from the design stage. Qualitative research by Pamungkas & Nawawi emphasizes that the Training Needs Analysis (AKD) is a crucial stage in designing effective and efficient training. This aligns closely with standard instructional design models, such as ADDIE (Analysis, Design, Development, Implementation, Evaluation), where the needs analysis phase serves as the foundation for the entire program. Without a proper diagnosis of needs, training will only become a routine activity that consumes the budget without a clear impact.

Furthermore, training should be viewed as a means to achieve a broader organizational vision. The concept proposed by Siti Rahmah Tursina (2024) regarding the role of training in

forming "Smart ASN" who possess integrity, professionalism, and mastery of IT is an example of Strategic HR Management. In this framework, training is not an isolated activity, but rather an integrated component designed to build organizational capabilities to achieve long-term goals. According to him, training is a "key component" to achieve this goal, with a focus on human resource development on three main aspects: talent, competence, and endurance. In conclusion, to be effective, training must be relevant to needs, supported by a conducive environment, and aligned with the organization's strategic vision.

CONCLUSIONS

Based on a comparative analysis of a series of studies, it can be concluded that the relationship between Education and Training (Diklat) and the performance of the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) is complex and multifaceted. In general, there is strong evidence to support that training has a positive and significant influence on performance. However, these influences are not always direct and absolute. The effectiveness of training can be reduced or even rendered statistically insignificant if tested separately without considering other contextual factors. Variables such as work discipline, employee competence, and a conducive work environment have been shown to play a vital role, both as mediators and as dominant factors that affect performance.

IMPLICATION

The implication for government organizations is that merely organizing training is insufficient. In order for investment in training to provide optimal results, the program must:

1. Designed based on a careful Training Needs Analysis (AKD) to ensure its relevance.
2. Implemented in a supportive organizational ecosystem, characterized by strong leadership, a positive work environment, and discipline enforcement.
3. It is directed to explicitly build specific competencies needed for performance improvement.

Thus, training should be seen not as a single solution, but as an integral part of a comprehensive human resource management strategy.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Alifah, H. N., Virgianti, U., Sarin, M. I. Z., Hasan, D. A., Fakhriyah, F., & Ismaya, E. A. (2023). Systematic Literature Review: The Influence of Digital Learning Media on Thematic Learning on Elementary School Students' Learning Outcomes. *Journal of Scientific and Student Papers*, *1*(3), 103–115. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.54066/jikma-itb.v1i3.463

Numbers A. Fitri Sugi, & M. Muhajir Sutina. (2023). The Influence of Education and Training, Allowances, and Workload on ASN Performance. *LP2M Institute of Social Sciences and Business Andi Sapada*, *Vol 1 No 2*. https://doi.org/10.62861/jimat%20amsir.v1i2.223

Ardiansyah, O. R., Edward, E., & Rosita, S. (2021). The Effect of Talent Management and Employee Attachment on Employee Performance at Pt. Telkom Indonesia (Persero) Tbk – Witel Jambi. *Magenta*, *10*(1), 33–41.

Arianty, N. (2014). The Influence of Organizational Culture on Employee Performance. *Journal of Management & Business*, *14*(02), 144–150. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.30596/jimb.v14i2.189

Budiharjo. (2018). Education Management (Cet.1). Yogyakarta: Blue Ocean

Falah, A. M., & Ayuningtias, H. G. (2020). The Effect of Work Motivation on the Performance of Employees of PT. XYZ. *Journal of Management Partners (JMM Online), 4*(6), 990–1001. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.52160/ejmm.v4i6.417

Fitriani, D., & Putra, A. (2022). Systematic Literature Review (SLR): An Ethnomathematical Exploration of Traditional Foods. *Journal of Mathematics Education and Learning*, *2*(1), 18–26. https://doi.org/10.19184/jomeal.v2i1.29093

Istiqomah, Shifi Fauziah, & Alifatul Husna. (2025). The Influence of Education and Training on the Performance of Civil Servants (PNS). *Journal of Accounting and Accounting*.

Jufrizen, J., & Hadi, F. P. (2021). The Influence of Work Facilities and Work Discipline on Employee Performance Through Work Motivation. *Journal of Management Science*, *7*(1), 35–54.

Marharani, D., Abdurachman Saleh Situbondo Muhammad Yahya Arief, U., Abdurachman Saleh Situbondo Riska Ayu Pramesti, U., & Abdurachman Saleh Situbondo, U. (2022). The Effect Of Education And Training On The Performance Of Asn Through Work Discipline As An Intervening Variable At Besuki Hospital, Situbondo Regency. *Journal of Entrepreneur Students (JME) FEB UNARS, 1*(9), 1939–1950.

Nas, W. St. Sukmawati. S. N. H. D. T. A. H. M., Daeng Toto, H., & Hadi, A. (2023). The Influence of Education and Training (Diklat) on the Work Performance of State Civil Apparatus Employees (ASN) at the Village Office in Minasatene District, Pangkep Regency. *SEIKO: Journal of Management & Business*, *6*(2), 342–350.

Nurfadilah, A., Hakim, A. R., & Nurropidah, R. (2022). Systematic Literature Review: Learning Mathematics on Wide and Circular Triangle Materials. *Polynomials: Journal of Mathematics Education*, *1*(1), 1–13. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.56916/jp.v1i1.33

The End of the Story, and the Ending. (2023). Analysis Of The Role Of Education And Training In Improving The Professionalism Of The Performance And Communication Of Asn Bkpsdm Banyumas Regency. *Journal of Islamic Guidance, Counseling, and Counseling*, *Vol. 6, No. 2*, 129–148. https://alisyraq.pabki.org/index.php/alisyraq/

Siswati, E., Fauzani, E., & Sinaga, R. H. (2021). The Influence of Education and Training (DIKLAT) on the Performance of Civil Servants at the Batang Hari Regency Education and Culture Office. *Scientific Journal of Batanghari University of Jambi*, *21*(1), 430. https://doi.org/10.33087/jiubj.v21i1.1343

Sugiyanto, S., Rahmawati, R., & Suarman, A. (2025). Performance Assessment of State Civil Apparatus (ASN) in Improving the Quality of Population Administration Services in Cibinong District. *JEMSI: Journal of Information Systems Management Economics*, *6*(4), 2788–2799. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.38035/jemsi.v6i4

Sunari, S., & Hamizar, A. (2023). Implementation of transformative management strategies in the development of capabilities based on employee talent management. *Advantage: Journal of Management and Business*, *1*(2), 69–80. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.61971/advantage.v1i2.22

Suseno Agus, Willy Tri Hardianto, & Muhamad Rifai. (2022). The Effect Of Education, Training, Competency And Work Environment On The Performance Of Asn Of The Pasuruan Regency Livestock And Food Security Office. *Journal of Public Administration Sciences*, *Vol. 10 No. 2*, 145–162.

Suwati, Y. (2013). The Effect of Compensation and Work Motivation on Employee Performance at PT . Ocean Green Shoots. *Journal of Business Administration Sciences*, *1*(1), 41–55.

Taba Muhammad Ihsan, Maryadi, & Harlindah Harniati. (2021). The Influence Of Education, Training (Diklat), Discipline And Leadership On The Performance Of Asn At The Regional Personnel And Training Agency (Bkppd) Of Selayar Islands Regency. *Journal of Management & Entrepreneurship Applications Massaro*. https://e-jurnal.stienobel-indonesia.ac.id/index.php/massaro/index | 106

Triandini, E., Jayanatha, S., Indrawan, A., Putra, G. W., & Iswara, B. (2019). Systematic Literature Review Method for Identification of Information System Development Platforms and Methods in Indonesia. *Indonesian Journal of Information Systems (IJIS)*, *1*(2), 63–77. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24002/ijis.v1i2.1916

Tursina Cicha Ramadani Siti Rahmah. (2024). The Importance of Education and Training of State Civil Apparatus Towards the Smart Era of Proud ASN to Serve. In *Jupawan Journal of Pancasila and National Insight* (Vol. 1, Issue 3).