

## ANGELIKA NEURWIRTH AND QUR'ĀNIC TEXTUAL ORIGINALITY (Epistemological Analysis of Emmanuel Kant's Perspective)

Khairun Niam<sup>1</sup>, Farida Nur 'Afifah<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup>Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia

### Article Info

#### Article history:

Received May 30, 2024

Revised Jul 18, 2024

Accepted Aug 1, 2024

Published Aug 27, 2024

#### Keywords:

Angelika Neuwirth

Epistemology

Originality of al-Qur'an Texts

### How to Cite

Niam, Khairun and Farida Nur 'Afifah. 2024. "Angelika Neuwirth And Qur'ānic Textual Originality (Epistemological Analysis of Emmanuel Kant's Perspective)". *Al Muhafidz: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir*, 4 (2), 201-212. <https://doi.org/10.57163/almuhafidz.v4i2.118>

### ABSTRACT

This paper reviews Neuwirth's thoughts regarding the originality of the Qur'anic text. According to Neuwirth, the texts of the Qur'an have been considered unoriginal because they have been influenced by Jewish and Christian traditions because the sources and methodologies used still have flaws. In reviewing Neuwirth's thoughts, this research focuses on the epistemology of Angelika Neuwirth's thoughts related to the originality of the Qur'anic text. Departing from the theory used, this paper discusses three questions. First, the sources used by Neuwirth, the methodology used, and how the validity of truth related to the originality of the Qur'anic text according to Neuwirth. This research uses a qualitative method by using *library research* data collection techniques. The data sources used are primary and secondary. Primary sources of the author get from Neuwirth's writings related to the Qur'an and secondary sources obtained from studies with the same object of study such as journals and books. The data that has been collected will be reduced as needed and analyzed using Emmanuel Kant's epistemology. As for the results of this study, *first*, Neuwirth uses text sources in the context of *late antiquity*. *Second*, Neuwirth uses an intertextuality-based pre-canonization method with a literary and historical approach. This research still has shortcomings, meaning that further research can be carried out related to the epistemology of Neuwirth's angelic thought such as the implications of Neuwirth's thinking for the study of the Qur'an in the West, especially in the scope of scholarship in Indonesia.

This is an open access article under the [CC BY](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) license.



### Corresponding Author:

Farida Nur 'Afifah

Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Jl. Laksda Adisucipto Papringan Caturtunggal Kec. Depok Kabupaten Sleman Darah Istimewa Yogyakarta, 55281, Indonesia

Email: [Faridanurafifah204@gmail.com](mailto:Faridanurafifah204@gmail.com)

## INTRODUCTION

The view of these orientalist states that the Qur'an is a product of "imitation" of biblical literature, apparently criticized by several modern western scholars, one of them Angelika Neuwirth. The assumption arises because there are several vocabularies in the Qur'an that are considered plagiarized from the previous book. Abraham Geiger, Teodor Noldeke, Alphonse Mingana, are some of the early generation orientalist who argue that the text of the Qur'an is heavily influenced by foreign languages such as Jewish, Aramaic, and Syriac.<sup>1</sup> In the methodology used by their predecessors, according to Neuwirth, they forgot the diachronic side of language development, because in the process a language will experience development from one time to another in different communities.<sup>2</sup> The process of language development from time to time cannot be a single argument to prove that the Qur'an is a product of imitation.

So far, existing studies related to the originality of the Qur'anic text tend to focus on two aspects. *First*, studies that focus on the influence of Jews and Christians on the text of the Qur'an include Sulaiman Ibrahim,<sup>3</sup> Khaeruddin Yusuf,<sup>4</sup> and Ulfiana.<sup>5</sup> This study views the Qur'an negatively that the Qur'an is heavily influenced by Jewish and Christian traditions.<sup>6</sup> The story in the Qur'an is considered an imitation of the bible and the language used is heavily influenced by Jewish, Hebrew, Aramaic and Syriac so that it comes to the conclusion that the Qur'an is not authentic. *Second*, studies that focus on the methodology of Angelika Neuwirth in studying the text of the Qur'an. Such as Adrika Fitrotul Aini and Asep Nahrul Musaddad,<sup>7</sup> and Ihwan Agustono.<sup>8</sup> Zayad Adb. Rahman,<sup>9</sup> Lien Iffah Naf'atu Fina<sup>10</sup> and Ulya Fikriyati. In looking at the relationship between the Qur'an and other books, Angelika uses Pre-Canonization and Intertextual.<sup>11</sup> It should be noted that according to Neuwirth, the Qur'an as a living communication text during the time of the Prophet Muhammad and the Qur'an which had become a mushaf after the Prophet Muhammad died have differences. This difference is one proof that the Qur'an is

<sup>1</sup> Khaeruddin Yusuf, "Orientalisme dan Duplikasi Bahasa al-Qur'an (Telaah dan Sanggahan atas Karya Christoph Luxenberg)," *Hunafa: Jurnal Studia Islamika* 9, no. 1 (2012): 149-170.

<sup>2</sup> Adrika Fitrotul Aini dan Asep Nahrul Musaddad, "KONTEKS ANTIOKSIS DAN ANALISIS STRUKTUR MIKRO SEBAGAI PENOLAK SKEPTISISME ORISINALITAS TEKS AL-QUR'AN Refleksi Atas Pemikiran Angelika Neuwirth," *Suhuf* 10, no. 1 (2017): 173-192, <https://doi.org/10.22548/shf.v10i1.249>.

<sup>3</sup> Sulaiman Ibrahim, "Sejarah Teks Al-Qur'an: Sebuah Studi atas Pemikiran John Wansbrough," *Farabi* 13, no. 2 (2016): 187-207.

<sup>4</sup> Yusuf, "Orientalisme dan Duplikasi Bahasa Al-Qur'an (Telaah dan Sanggahan terhadap Karya Christoph Luxenberg)."

<sup>5</sup> Ulfiana Ulfiana, "Keaslian al-Qur'an dalam Perspektif John Wansbrough," *Ushuluna: Jurnal Ilmu Ushuluddin* 1, no. 2 (2020): 212-31, <https://doi.org/10.15408/ushuluna.v1i2.15343>.

<sup>6</sup> Yusuf, "Orientalisme dan Duplikasi Bahasa Al-Qur'an (Telaah dan Sanggahan terhadap Karya Christoph Luxenberg)."

<sup>7</sup> Adrika Fitrotul Aini dan Asep Nahrul Musaddad, "KONTEKS ANTIOKSIS DAN ANALISIS STRUKTUR MIKRO SEBAGAI PENOLAK SKEPTISISME ORISINALITAS TEKS AL-QUR'AN Refleksi Atas Pemikiran Angelika Neuwirth," *Suhuf* 10, no. 1 (2017): 173-192, <https://doi.org/10.22548/shf.v10i1.249>.

<sup>8</sup> Ihwan Agustono, "Potret Perkembangan Metodologi Kelompok Orientalis dalam Studi al-Qur'an," *Studia Quranika* 4, no. 2 (2020): 159, <https://doi.org/10.21111/studiquan.v4i2.3819>.

<sup>9</sup> Zayad Abd. Rahman, "Angelika Neuwirth: Kajian Intertekstualitas dalam QS. Al-Rahman dan Mazmur 136," *Jurnal Empirisma* 24, no. 1, Januari 2015.

<sup>10</sup> Lien Iffah Naf'atu Fina, "Membaca Metode Penafsiran Alquran Kontemporer di Kalangan Sarjana Barat Telaah atas Pemikiran Angelika Neuwirth," *Ulumuna* 18, no. 2 (2017): 269-286, <https://doi.org/10.20414/ujs.v18i2.854>.

<sup>11</sup> Angelika Neuwirth dan Pembacaan al-Qur'an Pra-kanonik Berbasis Surat dan Intertekstualitas," *Jurnal Nur El-Islam* 2, no. 2 (Oktober 2015).

different from other books such as the Bible.<sup>12</sup> Departing from the studies mentioned above, there is no study that discusses the epistemology of Angelika Neuwirth's thinking about the originality of the Qur'anic text.

Departing from previous literature, this paper aims to complement studies related to the Qur'an and Western scholarship, especially how the language of the Qur'an which is seen historically has a narrative closeness to post-biblical texts. This paper will show the originality of the Qur'anic texts through the approaches taken by Angelika Neuwirth. In relation to this, there are three questions raised by the author. *First*, how are Angelika Neuwirth's sources in studying the text of the Qur'an. The second problem is how the methodology used by Neuwirth to see the relationship of the Qur'anic texts that have a relationship with previous texts. *third*, to see the validity of the truth used in the study of the Qur'an.

Examining the thoughts of modern orientalist is important, especially in the study of the relationship between the texts of the Qur'an and the previous book. this departs from the methodology and approach used in the study of the Qur'an has undergone development. Angelika Neuwirth criticized many Western scholars who were not in accordance with her thoughts. Not only that, Muslim scholars who study the Qur'an are also not spared from criticism. Unlike her predecessor who had a "pessimistic" conclusion about the originality of the Qur'anic text. In this case Neuwirth actually has an "optimistic" school of thought towards the originality of the Qur'anic text that exists today by offering a new approach.

## METHODS

This research is a qualitative research in which the focus of the study is on character studies. The figure raised in this research is Angelika Neuwirth who will be studied in depth regarding original ideas and ideas as well as the context of the figure. This research is a type of library research, the formal object is epistemology, then the material object is Angelika Neuwirth, then the context of this research is the originality of the Qur'anic text. Neuwirth's writings related to her thoughts on the Qur'an are the primary sources in this research. The secondary sources are journals, books and theses.

The data that has been collected will then be reduced. At this stage the researcher sorts the data that has been obtained by selecting which data is interesting, important, useful and new. Data that is not needed will be removed. In this case, researchers will use Angelika Neuwirth's writings related to her thoughts on the Qur'an. The next stage is the selection process. At this stage the researcher outlines the focus of the data that has been reduced.<sup>13</sup> In this case, the researcher will use Emanuel Kant's epistemological theory to describe the epistemology of Angelika Neuwirth's thoughts related to the originality of the Qur'anic text. Beginning with describing the sources used, methodology, and finally the validity of truth.

---

<sup>12</sup> Muhammad Fajri, "Pemikiran Qur'ani Angelika Neuwirth tentang Struktur dan Komunitas Darurat", *Jurnal Al-Wajid* 2, no. 1 (Juni 2021): 307-308.

<sup>13</sup> Sugiono, *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif Kualitatif dan R&D*, (Bandung: Alfabeta, 2013), pp. 19.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### General view of the term epistemology

The term epistemology comes from the Greek words, *episteme* which means information and *logos* which means word, reflection, or knowledge.<sup>14</sup> In line with that, epistemology is the science that talks about information and how to get it. In a different dialect, as Mohammad Adib points out, epistemology is a part of theory that highlights talking about methodologies, strategies or techniques for obtaining information and grants.<sup>15</sup> In Arabic, the term epistemology is referred to as *nazariyyah al-ma'rifah*. Epistemology is one of the branches of philosophy that discusses the nature, meaning, content, source and process of knowledge. As one of the sciences from the branch of philosophy so that epistemology is often associated with the concept of science, namely a knowledge that leads to understanding the truth so that it will discuss more about the origin, structure, method and validity of science.<sup>16</sup>

In connection with the above, epistemology is defined as the science that questions five main problems, namely; what truth is the knowledge, where is the source, what is its nature, whether the truth can be guaranteed, and how to know the knowledge is said to be true. So in general, epistemology can be understood as a science that studies the nature, origin, scope, structure, method and validity of knowledge.<sup>17</sup> How to work in epistemology to get information and science. Keith Lehrer argues that there are three forms of strategy in obtaining information. First, fanatical epistemology, which is a traditionalist method of managing epistemology. Second, basic epistemology is conveyed by Rene Descartes, which is a one-sided exchange of epistemology by asking what we can know before clarifying. Third, logos epistemology, the main question of this epistemology is what we really know and how we know it.

### Biography of Angelika Neuwrith

Angelika Neuwrith was born in 1943. She studied in Gottingen and Jerusalem in semiotics, Arabic, Islam and philology, and studied Persian language and literature in Theran. She completed her doctorate in 1972 at the University of Gottingen and her post-doctorate in 1977 in Munich. Anggelika was appointed as a flying professor in Munch, Cairo, and Bamberg before she joined the Freie Universitat in Berlin, Germany in 1991 in the discipline of Arabic Studies. In 2008 she received an honorary doctorate from the University of Bamberg. Angelika Neuwrith's research focuses on Arabic literature, both classical and modern, as well as the Qur'an from the perspective of Late Antiquity. Currently, Neuwrith is the chair of the Corpus Coranicum project which she started in 2005.<sup>18</sup>

<sup>14</sup> Parida Parida et al., "Kontruksi Epistimologi Ilmu Pengetahuan," *Indonesian Journal of Philosophy* 4, no. 3 (2021): 273–286, <https://doi.org/10.23887/jfi.v4i3.35503>.

<sup>15</sup> Parida et al.

<sup>16</sup> Abdi Syahril Harahap, "Epistemologi: Teori, Konsep dan Sumber Ilmu Pengetahuan dalam Tradisi Islam Sebuah Pengantar Abstrak," *Jurnal Dakwatul Islam* 5, no. 1 (2020): 14-30.

<sup>17</sup> Arif Rohman dkk, *Epistemologi dan Logika Filsafat untuk Pengembangan Pendidikan*, (Yogyakarta: Aswaja Pressindo, Cet. I, 2014), pp. 13.

<sup>18</sup> Corpus Coranicum merupakan salah satu contoh kerja sama antara para sarjana Muslim dan Barat dalam studi Al-Qur'an. Ulya Fikriyati, "Pembacaan dan Intertekstualitas Al-Qur'an Pra-kanonik Berbasis Surah," *Jurnal Nur El-Islam*, 2, no. 2 (2015): 128-129.

In particular, to see the originality of the Qur'an Angelika Neuwrith offers a new comprehensive approach, a wisdom that treats the Qur'anic text as itself.<sup>19</sup> Neuwrith's thinking about the Qur'an departs from her concept of pre-canonization and post-canonization. Pre-Canonization is the Qur'an that lived at the time of the prophet, and the second is the Qur'an that has been codified by the editors of the Qur'an to its current form.<sup>20</sup> The second approach offered by Neuwrith is Intertextuality. Intertextual studies were originally introduced by Julia Kristeva as a development of Mikhail Bakhtin's literary theory of dialogism.<sup>21</sup> According to Neuwrith, the Qur'an must be read intertextually in its position as a post-Biblical text that has narrative closeness to the Biblical.<sup>22</sup>

### Originality of Qur'anic Texts in the View of Orientalists

Originality in KBBI means authenticity or originality. If juxtaposed with the word al-Qur'an text, it means the purity of the Qur'an text. The purity in question is that the vocabulary text in the Qur'an is a pure Islamic product. However, the originality of the Qur'an is rejected by skeptical orientalists such as Abraham Geiger,<sup>23</sup> and Jhon Wansbrough. They argue that there is a Jewish-Christian influence in the Qur'an. In vocabulary for example. Arthur Jeffery also mentioned the same thing. He mentioned that the Qur'an is an Arabic book that is influenced by various foreign languages such as Ethiopic, Aramaic, Hebrew, Syriac, Persian Ancient Greek and other languages.<sup>24</sup> Hartwig Hirschfeld offers findings in the form of foreign vocabulary in the Qur'an which shows that Islam is not original.

Jewish influence in the Qur'an in the form of foreign vocabulary is evidenced by several expressions. Alphonse Mingana, a Christian priest from Iraq, argues that there is 100% foreign language influence in the Qur'an. 5% Ethiopian, 10% Hebrew, 10% Greco-Roman, 5% Persian and 70% Syriac.<sup>25</sup> Besides Mingana, Abraham Geiger also mentioned that there are 14 vocabularies taken, adopted, influenced and constructed from Hebrew, namely the words *ark*, *sakinah*, *jannatu 'adn*, *taghut*, *taurat*, *Jahanna*, *ahbar*, *sabt*, *furqan*, *ma'un malakut*, *mathani*, *darasa*, and *rabhani*.<sup>26</sup> However, what is conveyed by orientalists regarding the existence of foreign vocabulary in the Qur'an is of course rejected by

<sup>19</sup> Ihwan Agustono, "Pendekatan Qur'anic Milieu dalam Studi al-Qur'an (Telaah atas Pemikiran Angelika Neuwrith dalam The Qur'an in Context: Investigasi Sejarah dan Sastra atas Milieu Qur'ani)," *Al-Hikmah* 8, no. 2 (2022): 202-213.

<sup>20</sup> Fina, "Membaca Metode Penafsiran Alquran Kontemporer di Kalangan Sarjana Barat dengan Menganalisis Pemikiran Angelika Neuwrith."

<sup>21</sup> Zayad Abd. Rahman, "Angelika Neuwrith: Kajian Intertekstualitas dalam QS. Al-Rahman dan Mazmur," *Jurnal Empirisma*, Vol. 24, No. 1 (Januari 2015): 136.

<sup>22</sup> Aini dan Musadad, "KONTEKS ANTIOKSIS DAN ANALISIS STRUKTUR MIKRO SEBAGAI PENANGKAL SANGKALAN TERHADAP SANGKAAN ORISINALITAS TEKS AL-QUR'AN Refleksi Pemikiran Angelika Neuwrith."

<sup>23</sup> Muhamad Mahfudin, "Muhammad dan Orisinalitas al-Qur'an dalam Pandangan Abraham Geiger," *MAGHA: Jurnal Ilmu-ilmu al-Qur'an dan Tafsir* 6, no. 1 (2021): 135-150, <https://doi.org/10.24090/maghza.v6i1.4547>.

<sup>24</sup> Moh. Khoeron, "Kajian Orientalis terhadap Teks dan Sejarah al-Qur'an," *Jurnal Suhuf* 3, no. 2 (2010): 235-249.

<sup>25</sup> Khaeruddin Yusuf, "Orientlisme dan Duplikasi Bahasa al-Qur'an (Tinjauan dan Sanggahan atas Karya Christoph Luxenberg)," *Jurnal Hunafa* 9, No. 1 (Juni 2012): 154.

<sup>26</sup> Umi Wasilah. Firdausiyah, "Pengaruh Bahasa Ibrani terhadap Teks al-Qur'an dalam Perspektif Abraham Geiger," *Al-Manar: Jurnal Studi Alquran dan Hadis* 7, no. 2 (2021): 43-60.

classical scholars. On the grounds that the Qur'an has clearly been revealed in Arabic according to what is said in the Qur'an.<sup>27</sup>

### References Angelika Neuwirth

Angelika Neuwirth was influenced by several western orientalist in some of her methodologies related to text originality, such as Abraham Geiger and Thodor Noldeke. Geiger's thought taken by Neuwirth is the study of intertext which according to Neuwirth is very important in the study of al-Qur'an studies both in terms of religion and language.<sup>28</sup> But on the other hand, Neuwirth also criticized Geiger regarding the intertext. Geiger uses intertext as a framework to cover the hidden meaning of the Qur'an which then the meaning is led with a pessimistic understanding of the authenticity of the Qur'an. As there are similarities between the stories in the Qur'an and the Bible.<sup>29</sup> As for Noldeke's thinking in the form of his analysis related to the chronology of the Qur'an which divides the revelation period into four periods.<sup>30</sup> However, according to Neuwirth, Noldeke only reaches the technical aspect and has not reached the deepest aspect of the letter, namely communication. Neuwirth considers that these two figures still have shortcomings. Therefore, Neuwirth adopted and codified their methodology.

Besides being influenced by previous orientalist, Neuwirth also reads the pre-canonization of the Qur'an. In this case, he explores the *late antique* texts that surrounded when the Qur'an was revealed, such as Jewish and Christian scriptures, Greek rhetoric and Arabic poetry. This method was carried out by Neuwirth as an effort to provide legitimacy that the Qur'an must be read together with other texts that surround it to get a more complete picture.<sup>31</sup> In this case the intertextuality approach finds its momentum, that in an effort to trace the historical text of the Qur'an must be approached with the texts around the Qur'an in the context of late antiquity. Therefore, it is important to link the texts of the Qur'an with previous traditions, especially Biblical literature must be raised.<sup>32</sup>

In addition, Neuwirth also traced the pre-canonization texts. This search can be done by tracing post-canonization texts. The development of Muhammad's da'wah process from Mecca to Medina seems to give a mark to the Qur'an including its literary structure. Historical data on the prophet's da'wah, historical data on the people involved in the birth of the Qur'an according to Neuwirth also need to be analyzed. Because according to Neuwirth, the Qur'an is indeed the holy book of Muslims after it was revealed. However, the birth of the Qur'an is a speech that involves many parties. Therefore, historical data including texts held by the community into discourse and

<sup>27</sup> There are ten verses in the Qur'an that explain that the Qur'an was revealed in Arabic, (QS. Yusuf: 12), al-Ra'ad 13: 7, al-Nahl, 17: 103, Taha 20: 113, al-Syu'ara' 26: 195, al-Zumar 39: 28, Fussilat 41: 3, al-Syuara 42: 7, al-Zuhuf 43: 3, and al-Ahqaf 46: 12. See, Yusuf, "Orientalis dan Duplikasi Bahasa-bahasa al-Qur'an (Sebuah Tinjauan dan Sanggahan terhadap Karya Christoph Luxenberg)."

<sup>28</sup> Lien Iffah Naf'atu Fina, *Pre-Canonical Reading Of The Qur'an (Studi atas Metode Angelika Neuwirth dalam menganalisa Teks-teks al-Qur'an Berbasis Surah dan Intertekstualitas)*, Tesis UIN Sunan Kalijaga, 2011. 132.

<sup>29</sup> Zayd Abd. Rahman, 115.

<sup>30</sup> Zunaidi Nur, "Chronology of the The

<sup>31</sup> M Fajri, "JurnalAl-Wajid Struktur dan Kegentingan Masyarakat Jurnal Al-Wajid," *JurnalAl-Wajid* 2, no. 1 (2021): 303-318.

<sup>32</sup> Aini dan Musadad, "KONTEKS ANTIOKSIS DAN ANALISIS STRUKTUR MIKRO SEBAGAI PENOLAK SANGKALAN TERHADAP SIKAP ORISINALITAS TEKS AL-QUR'AN Refleksi Pemikiran Angelika Neuwirth."

practices involved in that time are needed to see the whole picture of the journey of the Qur'an.<sup>33</sup>

The influence of Neuwrith's thinking with his predecessor comes in the context of criticizing, because Neuwrith saw that his predecessor actually made quite far leaps in looking at the text of the Qur'an. In this context Neuwrith looks quite serious in exploring the texts of the Qur'an. This is evidenced by the search he did on pre-canonization texts which he considered to be very important data. The pre-canonization texts that Neuwrith refers to here are not only scriptural texts, but various texts that have links and involvement with the events of the descent of the Qur'an.

### **Angelika Neuwrith's Methodology for Reading Qur'anic Originality**

In seeing the originality of the Qur'an, Neuwrith did a Pre-canonical reading. Pre-Canonical reading is an application of the concept of separating the meaning of the Qur'an as a quran and as a mushaf. There are three steps in Neuwrith's pre-canonical reading. *First*, looking for cohesion and coherence between verses in one letter to determine the most dominant central theme. This step is applied by dividing one surah into several groups of verses based on stylistic and thematic considerations to see the main theme of a surah. *Second*, tracing the *nucleus text* in the letters that have been revealed before or after. This is important to observe the growth of the text and the emergence of a community.<sup>34</sup> In other words, Neuwrith argues that the canonization process was actually born along with the birth of the community. This is done to revive the post-canonization Qur'an in the spirit of pre-canonization.<sup>35</sup>

The third step is to place the microstructure of the Qur'an that has been analyzed in the second step together with the texts in *late antiquity* that surround it, including in the prophet's sirah.<sup>36</sup> Because at that time the Qur'an was born at a time of idolaters, Christians, Zoroastrian Jews and also the proliferation of religions in the Arabian Peninsula, Syria with cultural traditions, the cult of each adherent, the pre-canonization reading for Neuwrith occupies a very important position as an effort to find what really happened.<sup>37</sup> The step taken to rebuild the historicity of the text with the aim that the texts can be traced asbab an-nuzul of a verse in the context of communication as it appears. After the three steps have been taken, the next step is to interpret the micro unit of the Qur'an with an intertextuality approach.

The steps in the pre-canonical above indicate the two approaches used by Neuwrith, namely the literary and historical approaches. Neuwrith chose these two approaches because he tried to provide an offer by combining these two tendencies that are often divorced. Neuwrith's pre-canonical in microstructure analysis is included in the diachronic study of the Qur'an with text units, namely letters in which there are independent texts. Then, each surah is read in terms of the process when he was present at the time of the prophet. However, the texts studied are not the entire text in the Qur'an.

<sup>33</sup> Lien Iffah Naf'atu Fina, Thesis UIN Sunan Kalijaga, pp. 151.

<sup>34</sup> Fikriyati, "Angelika Neuwrith dan Pembacaan Al-Qur'an Pra-Kanonik Berbasis Surat dan Intertekstualitas."

<sup>35</sup> Lien Iffah Naf'atu Fina, "Angelika, Catatan Kritis Pra-Kanonisasi, Al-Qur'an," *Nun* 2, no. Januari 2016 (2016): 57-80.

<sup>36</sup> Fikriyati, "Angelika Neuwrith dan Pembacaan Al-Qur'an Pra-Kanonik dan Intertekstualitas."

<sup>37</sup> Aini dan Musadad, "KONTEKS "LATE ANTIQUITY DAN ANALISIS STRUKTUR MIKRO SEBAGAI PENOLAK SANGKALAN TERHADAP SIKAP ORISINALITAS TEKS AL-QUR'AN Refleksi Atas Pemikiran Angelika Neuwrith."

This analysis is used to reveal how the reception of the recipient of the Qur'an at that time.  
38

### **The Validity of Qur'anic Originality from the Perspective of Emanuel Kant's Epistemology**

The reason for the unoriginality of the Qur'an in the view of skeptical and revisionist orientalists.<sup>39</sup> because of the problematic sources that are influenced by Jewish and Christian traditions in the Qur'an.<sup>40</sup> However, the validity of the truth related to the sources used according to Angelika Neuwrith as she used in the "Corpus Coranicum" project is using sources written in Ethiopic, Greek, Hebrew and Suryani, in addition to Arabic. Of course, by collecting various ancient Qur'anic manuscripts and documentation of oral transmission against the background of the Judeo-Christian climate and Arabic verses as reinforcement.<sup>41</sup> To understand and study the texts of the Qur'an, it is necessary to read with a broader framework in the context of the Middle Eastern regions before the emergence of Islam, known as "*late antiquity*". Through this framework, it will affect traditional perspectives on important issues, such as the nature of the text and the chronology of the Qur'an.<sup>42</sup>

Related to the methodology used by Neuwrith to see the originality of the text is the method of Pre-canonicity and Intertextuality. Neuwrith needs to distinguish between the Qur'an as a living communication text at the time of the prophet Muhammad and the Qur'an that has become a mushaf. According to Neuwrith, the mushaf that was produced was not at all arranged based on chronological or theological criteria but was arranged based on technical considerations from the *ijtihad* of the companions. Therefore, Neuwrith divides the structure of the surah into three periods. First, the Early Makkah text period. Second, the Middle and Late Makkah text structure. Third, the text structure of the Medina period.<sup>43</sup> Based on Neuwrith's classification of the structure of the letter is based on the grammatical and theme of the letter. Departing from that to see the originality of the Qur'an text, Neuwrith uses a letter-based method in reading the pre-canonization Qur'an.

Based on the sources and methodology offered by Neuwrith, the concept of truth in seeing the Qur'anic text is by seeing the text as an intermediary medium that reflects a communication process. The texts of the Qur'an must be seen again in the context of *Late Antiquity* culture. In the context of *late antiquity*, Neuwrith's intertextuality approach finds its momentum. That in an effort to trace the historical text of the Qur'an must be approached with intertextuality tools with texts around the Qur'an. In operating the intertextual Neuwrith positions the Qur'an as a post-Biblical text. The emergence of the

<sup>38</sup> Lien Iffah Naf'atu Fina, Pembacaan al-Qur'an Pra-Kanonik (Studi atas Metode Angelika Neuwrith dalam menganalisa Teks al-Qur'an Berbasis Surah dan Intertekstualitas), Tesis UIN Sunan Kalijaga, 2011. 154.

<sup>39</sup> A group of scholars who have always doubted and questioned Muslims' claims to the truth of Islamic traditions with strong evidence, Yusuf Rahman, "Tren Studi al-Qur'an di Barat," Jurnal Studi Insania 1, no. 1 (2013): 1, <https://doi.org/10.18592/jsi.v1i1.1076>.

<sup>40</sup> M. Muzayyin, "Al-Qur'an Menurut Pandangan Orientalis", Jurnal Studi Al-Qur'an dan Hadis 16, no. 2 (2015): 203-221.

<sup>41</sup> Mun'im Sirry, *Merekonstruksi Islam Historis dalam Pergulatan Kesarjanaan Mutakhir*, (Yogyakarta: Suka Press 2021), pp. 41.

<sup>42</sup> Mun'im Sirry, *Kemunculan Islam dalam Kesarjanaan Revisionis*, (Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2017), pp. 124.

<sup>43</sup> Fajri, "Struktur Jurnal Al-Wajid dan Keadaan Darurat Jurnal Al-Wajid."



Qur'anic text must be seen in a discursive context that occurs between the Qur'anic communities that have interacted.<sup>44</sup>

### **A Critical Analysis of Qur'anic Originality in the View of Angelika Neuwrith**

Departing from the view of orientalist scholars who have stated that the Qur'an is a product of "imitation" of biblical literature, it turns out to get a critical response from several modern Western scholars, one of whom is Angelika Neuwrith. Interestingly, the criticism made by Neuwrith actually departs from the thoughts of Abraham Geiger and Theodor Noldeke regarding the methodology of intertext and chronology of the Qur'an. Because the methodology used by the two figures above according to Neuwrith still has shortcomings, so to fill the gaps in Geiger and Noldeke's methodology, Neuwrith reads the pre-canonization al-Qur'an in the form of extracting *Late Antique* texts such as Jewish, Christian scriptures, Greek rhetoric and Arabic poetry. At this *late Antique* stage, Neuwrith's intertextuality approach finds the right momentum.

Emanuel Kant's epistemology cannot be separated from the two major schools of knowledge, namely rationalism and empiricism. From these two great schools, Kant's epistemology position is in the middle as a bridge between these two schools.<sup>45</sup> The view of rationalism begins with the assumption that knowledge can only be obtained through the work of the mind that is already available in the human mind in the form of innate ideas that are universal. Kant's empiricism begins with the process of sensory perception which will produce a picture of the object as it is.<sup>46</sup> Kant's empiricism has a synthesis-aposteriori nature that is conditional truth, depending on how the world is as it is. Here, Angelika Neuwrith as a modern orientalist falls into the category of empiricism with synthetic properties because here Neuwrith is able to provide new knowledge in the form of pre-canonization and intertext approaches in viewing the Qur'anic text.

Kant's Critical Epistemology is a response to the advantages and disadvantages that exist in empiricism and rationalism. According to Kant, both have not succeeded in guiding humans to obtain knowledge that is certain, generally applicable and clearly proven.<sup>47</sup> Departing from this uncertain knowledge, the study of the Qur'an eventually developed to a more objective phase.<sup>48</sup> Angelika Neuwrith with her methodology and approach to the text of the Qur'an which tends to be more objective brings brightness in the academic scope of the study of the Qur'an in Western scholarship. Therefore, in studying the texts of the Qur'an, it is necessary to use more in-depth sources related to the text of the Qur'an. Here it is not only the pre-Qur'anic scriptures as a single source. However, *late antiquity* texts can help in studying the texts of the Qur'an so as to get a more objective understanding.

This research seeks to see how Angelika Neuwrith's criticism responds to the study of the Qur'an in the early orientalist period. To see this criticism, the author uses epistemology as an analytical knife by describing what sources are used, methodology and validity of truth according to Neuwrith regarding the originality of the Qur'anic text.

---

<sup>44</sup> Aini dan Musadad, "KONTEKS ANTIOKSIS DAN ANALISIS STRUKTUR MIKRO SEBAGAI PENANGKAL SANGKALAN TERHADAP SANGKAAN ORISINALITAS TEKS AL-QUR'AN Refleksi Atas Pemikiran Angelika Neuwrith".

<sup>45</sup> Syaiful Dinata, "Epistimologi Kritis Immanuel Kant," *Kanz Philosophia Jurnal Filsafat dan Mistisisme Islam* 7, no. 2 (2021): 217–236, <https://doi.org/10.20871/kpjipm.v7i2.183>.

<sup>46</sup> Lailiy Muthmainnah, "Sebuah Tinjauan Kritis atas Epistemologi Immanuel Kant (1724-1804)," *Jurnal Filsafat* 28, no. 1 (2018): 74, <https://doi.org/10.22146/jf.31549>.

<sup>47</sup> Dinata, "Epistimologi Kritis Immanuel Kant".

<sup>48</sup> Syukri Al Fauzi Harlis Yurnalis, "Studi Orientalis tentang Islam: Dorongan dan Tujuan," *Jurnal Al-Aqidah* 11, no. 1 (2019): 63–75, <https://doi.org/10.15548/ja.v11i1.909>.

When compared with previous research, this research seems somewhat different in terms of the approach used. In previous studies, the study of Neuwirth's thought focused more on methodology and his criticisms of Western and Muslim scholarship.

Research related to Angelika Neuwirth's thought has indeed been studied with various approaches, one of which is this research which summarizes Neuwirth's thought in the frame of Immanuel Kant's epistemology. Future research related to Angelika Neuwirth's thought can be developed in the form of applying different theoretical frameworks so that different results can be found. In addition, a critical analysis of the methodology built by Angelika Neuwirth can also be done, seeing that in academic studies there is always methodological and theoretical development.

The method used by Angelika Neuwirth in seeing the originality of the Qur'an text is a counter in criticizing orientalists who say that the Qur'an is a product of imitation of the biblical book. *Late Antiquity*, as well as its intertextual approach shows that texts and other texts have a parallel relationship when viewed from a historical context.<sup>49</sup> By looking at the epistemology of Angelika Neuwirth's thought using an epistemological approach, it can be seen that at least taking a single conclusion in seeing the originality of the Qur'anic text is not a final argument. This means that the texts of the Qur'an can be seen with a wider range not only based on the percentage of similarities with other holy books.

## CONCLUSIONS

Angelika Neuwirth criticizes orientalist thought that considers the Qur'an as a plagiarized product of the previous book. The new methodology she offers to see the originality of the Qur'anic text with the pre-canonization method and the intertextuality approach through literary and historical approaches in the context of *late antiquity* in the form of Jewish, Christian scriptures, Greek rhetoric and Arabic poetry besides that she also uses sources written in Ethiopian, Greek, Hebrew and Suryani, in addition to Arabic. Neuwirth also collected various ancient Qur'anic manuscripts and oral transmission documentation against the background of the Judeo-Christian climate and Arabic poetry. This epistemological study of sources, methods and validity strengthens Neuwirth's critique of previous orientalists.

Before this research was written, the author had conducted a search related to the existing literature related to Angelika Neuwirth's thought. The position of this research compared to the previous literature cannot be said to be very new, but as a complement to previous research. Based on this epistemological analysis, Angelika Neuwirth tries to show that the similarity of texts or traditions between the Qur'an and previous holy books does not end in the conclusion that the Qur'an is an "imitation" product. This argument is strengthened by her pre-canonization method using literary and historical approaches.

As the author has said before that this study is present as a complement to the previous study. This means that the study of Angelika Neuwirth's epistemology related to the originality of the Qur'anic text can still be discussed more broadly, because this study is only limited to the sources, methodology and validity of Angelika Neuwirth's perspective. Departing from the epistemology of this thought, further research can be done in the form of how the implications of Neuwirth's thinking on the study of the Qur'an in the West, especially in Indonesia.

---

<sup>49</sup> Aini and Musadad, "KONTEKS ANTIOKSIS DAN ANALISIS STRUKTUR MIKRO SEBAGAI TOLAK BALIK TERHADAP SKEPTISISME ORISINALITAS TEKS AL-QUR'AN Refleksi Atas Pemikiran Angelika Neuwirth"

## REFERENCES

- Agustono, Ihwan. "Pendekatan The Qur'anic Milieu Dalam Studi Alqur'an (Telaah Pemikiran Angelika Neuwirth Dalam The Qur'an in Context: Historical and Literary Investigations into the Qur'anic Milieu)." *Al- Hikmah* 8, no. 2 (2022): 202–213.
- . "Potret Perkembangan Metodologi Kelompok Orientalis Dalam Studi Al-Qur'an." *Studia Quranika* 4, no. 2 (2020): 159. <https://doi.org/10.21111/studiquran.v4i2.3819>.
- Aini, Adrika Fitrotul, and Asep Nahrul Musadad. "Konteks Late Antiquity dan Analisis Struktur Mikro sebagai Counter atas Skeptisisme Orisinalitas Teks Al-Qur'an." *SUHUF* 10.1 (2017): 173-192. <https://doi.org/10.22548/shf.v10i1.249>.
- Dinata, Syaiful. "Epistemologi Kritisisme Immanuel Kant." *Kanz Philosophia A Journal for Islamic Philosophy and Mysticism* 7, no. 2 (2021): 217–236. <https://doi.org/10.20871/kpjipm.v7i2.183>.
- Fajri, M. "Jurnal Al-Wajid Structure and the Emergency of Community Jurnal Al-Wajid." *Jurnal Al-Wajid* 2, no. 1 (2021): 303–318.
- Fikriyati, Ulya. "Angelika Neuwirth Dan Pembacaan Al-Qur'an Pre-Canonical Berbasis Surat Dan Intertekstualitas." *Nur El-Islam* Vol. 2, no. 2 (2015): 128–129.
- Fina, Lien Iffah Naf'atu. "Angelika, Catatan Kritis Pra-Kanonisasi, Alquran." *Nun* 2, no. Januari 2016 (2016): 57–80.
- . "Membaca Metode Penafsiran Al-Qur'an Kontemporer Di Kalangan Sarjana Barat Analisis Pemikiran Angelika Neuwirth." *Ulumuna* 18, no. 2 (2017): 269–286. <https://doi.org/10.20414/ujs.v18i2.854>.
- Fina, Lien Iffah Naf'atu Fin, Pree-Canonical Reading Of The Qur'an (Studi atas Metode Anggelika Neuwirth dalam analisis Teks al-Qur'an Berbasis Surat dan Intertekstualitas), Tesis UIN Sunan Kalijaga, 2011.
- Firdausiyah, Umi Wasilah. "Pengaruh Bahasa Ibrani Pada Teks Al-Qur'an Dalam Perspektif Abraham Geiger." *Al-Manar: Jurnal Kajian Alquran Dan Hadis* 7, no. 2 (2021): 43–60.
- Harahap, Abdi Syahrial. "Epistemologi : Teori , Konsep Dan Sumber-Sumber Ilmu Dalam Tradisi Islam Abstrak Pendahuluan." *Jurnal Dakwatul Islam* 5, no. 1 (2020): 14–30.
- Harlis Yurnalis, Syukri Al Fauzi. "Studi Orientalis Terhadap Islam: Dorongan Dan Tujuan." *Jurnal Al-Aqidah* 11, no. 1 (2019): 63–75. <https://doi.org/10.15548/ja.v11i1.909>.
- Ibrahim, Sulaiman. "Sejarah Teks Al-Qur'an : Studi Atas Pemikiran John Wansbrough." *Farabi* 13, no. 2 (2016): 187–207.
- M. Muzayyin. "Al-Qur'an Menurut Pandangan Orientalis." *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Hadis* 16, no. 2 (2015): 203–221.
- Mahfudin, Muhamad. "Muhammad Dan Orisinalitas Al-Quran Dalam Pandangan Abraham Geiger." *MAGHZA: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir* 6, no. 1 (2021): 135–150. <https://doi.org/10.24090/maghza.v6i1.4547>.

- Moh. Khoeron. "Kajian Orientalis Terhadap Teks Dan Sejarah Al-Qur ' An." *Jurnbal Suhuf* 3, no. 2 (2010): 235–249.
- Muthmainnah, Lailiy. "Tinjauan Kritis Terhadap Epistemologi Immanuel Kant (1724-1804)." *Jurnal Filsafat* 28, no. 1 (2018): 74. <https://doi.org/10.22146/jf.31549>.
- Nur, Zunaidi. "Kronologi Al-Qur ' an Periode Makkah ( Analisis Internal Teks Theodor Nöldeke ( 1836-1930 ) Dalam Penyusunan Kronologi Al- Qur ' an Periode Makkah )" 1, no. 12 (2023): 4536–4545.
- Parida, Parida, Ahmad Syukri, Badarussyamsi Badarussyamsi, and Ahmad Fadhil Rizki. "Kontruksi Epistimologi Ilmu Pengetahuan." *Jurnal Filsafat Indonesia* 4, no. 3 (2021): 273–286. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jfi.v4i3.35503>.
- Rahman, Yusuf. "Tren Kajian Al-Qur'an Di Dunia Barat." *Jurnal Studia Insania* 1, no. 1 (2013): 1. <https://doi.org/10.18592/jsi.v1i1.1076>.
- Sirry, Mun'im, *Rekonstruksi Islam Historis Pergumulan Kesarjanaan Mutakhir*, Yogyakarta: Suka Press 2021.
- Sirry, Mun'im, *Kemunculan Islam Dalam Kesarjanaan Revisionis*, Yogyakarta: Suka Press, 2017.
- Sugiono, *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif Kualitatif dan R&D*, Bandung: Alfabeta, 2013.
- Ulfiana, Ulfiana. "Otentisitas Al-Qur'an Perspektif John Wansbrough." *Ushuluna: Jurnal Ilmu Ushuluddin* 1, no. 2 (2020): 212–231. <https://doi.org/10.15408/ushuluna.v1i2.15343>.
- Yusuf, Khaeruddin. "Orientalis Dan Duplikasi Bahasa Alquran (Telaah Dan Sanggahan Atas Karya Christoph Luxenberg)." *Hunafa: Jurnal Studia Islamika* 9, no. 1 (2012): 149–170.