



An Analysis of Cultural Words using Nababan's Accuracy and Gottlieb's Subtitling Strategies in Movie Subtitle *Penyalin Cahaya*

Dzaugy Alkafi¹

ugialkafi@gmail.com

English Literature Department, Faculty of Language and Arts,
Universitas Kristen Satya Wacana

Alkafi, D. (2025). An Analysis of Cultural Words using Nababan's Accuracy and Gottlieb's Subtitling Strategies in Movie Subtitle *Penyalin Cahaya*. *Journal of English Language and Literature*, 10(2), 243-254. Doi: 10.37110/jell.v10i2.286

Received: 25-04-2025

Accepted: 25-06-2025

Published: 02-09-2025

Abstract: This research analyzes the translation accuracy of cultural words in the Indonesian film *Penyalin Cahaya* (The Photocopier), using Newmark's theory of cultural categories, Nababan's accuracy assessment framework, and Gottlieb's subtitling strategies. Employing qualitative methods, the study identifies and classifies 40 cultural word data across five categories: social culture, material culture, customs and ideas, ecology, and gestures and habits. The findings reveal that social culture words are the most prevalent (52.5%), and paraphrase emerges as the dominant subtitling strategy (40%). Accuracy assessments show that while some cultural terms are conveyed effectively—such as *kebaya* and student protest—others like *Hari Kartini* and *rawon* are mistranslated, leading to cultural distortion. These results underscore the challenges of subtitle translation when dealing with culture-specific terms. The study concludes that an accurate and culturally aware translation not only preserves meaning but also enhances viewers' understanding across cultures. This research contributes to the advancement of audiovisual translation studies, especially in the context of Indonesian cinema, by highlighting the importance of integrating translation strategies with cultural sensitivity.

Keywords: *Translation, Cultural Word, Quality Assessment, Accuracy*

INTRODUCTION

In today's world, language is one of the crucial factors that need to be studied more deeply. Essentially, humans are social beings who need to communicate with one another. In translation, each language must convey information from one language to another with the same accuracy and meaning, which means that language is dynamic. In other words, a translator must ensure that the same connection and meaning are maintained so that the translation can be understood in literary works. The presence of translation in literary works helps build connections between people who speak different languages.

The urgency of the topic lies in the increasing global consumption of non-Western media, where subtitled films serve as a primary means of cultural exchange. However, subtitling is constrained by spatial and temporal limitations, which complicates the translator's task, especially when dealing with cultural words that lack direct equivalents in the target language. Improper translation may result in distorted meaning, loss of cultural nuance, or reduced audience engagement. Oktaviani and Nugroho (2022) highlight how inaccuracies in subtitle translation can weaken narrative integrity, while Setiawan et al. (2024) emphasize the need for appropriate subtitling

¹ Corresponding Author

Dzaugy Alkafi

An Analysis of Cultural Words using Nababan's Accuracy and Gottlieb's Subtitling Strategies in Movie Subtitle Penyalin Cahaya.

strategies in preserving meaning across cultures. Several previous studies have explored subtitling strategies and translation accuracy. Taqi and Wulandari (2024) examined Gottlieb's framework in the action film *Taken*, revealing that strategies like condensation and paraphrase are effective in overcoming time constraints. However, few studies specifically focus on the translation of cultural words in Indonesian films or examine how subtitling strategies intersect with quality assessment frameworks such as Nababan's accuracy model. This research addresses that gap by analyzing the subtitle translation of cultural words in the Indonesian film *Penyalin Cahaya* (The Photocopier), using Newmark's cultural categories, Gottlieb's subtitling strategies, and Nababan's accuracy assessment. While other studies focus on general subtitle quality or strategy usage, this research contributes by emphasizing the cultural dimension and evaluating how accurately cultural meaning is preserved. The novelty of this study lies in its integration of three theoretical frameworks and its in-depth focus on cultural word translation in Indonesian film subtitling—a field that remains underexplored.

According to Newmark, translation is "rendering the meaning of a text into another language in the way that the researcher intended the text" (Newmark, 1988, p. 5). Meanwhile, Larson stated that "translation is basically a change of form" (Larson, 1998). This means that translation is not only about converting one language into another but also about conveying the meaning of the text. Translation is not only the process of converting one language into another but also involves interpreting two different cultures. Newmark describes culture as a way of life and its expressions that are unique to a community using a specific language (Newmark, 1988, p. 94). This suggests that culture presents a challenge for translators, as there are no direct equivalents for certain cultural elements, perspectives and interpretations may vary, and it is crucial to maintain the authenticity of cultural information in the translated text. In other words, translation is about conveying both linguistic meaning and cultural significance. As a result, differences in cultural interpretations pose a challenge for translators to ensure accurate and effective translation.

When translating, there are several important aspects a translator must consider, including the grammatical and cultural elements within the text. For example, a translator should know that a meatball in English is "Bakso" in Indonesia instead of bola daging. Sometimes, a translator may not be able to find a word or phrase in another language for something that simply cannot be translated, such as "batik" or "kebaya." It is often observed that when certain translations use the same word, it is because there is no direct equivalent word from the source language in the target language. These words are called cultural words. This is one of the challenges that a translator may face.

Meanwhile, Newmark distinguishes the translation of cultural language into 'universal' and 'personal' (Newmark, 1988, p. 94). Words like 'table' and 'lamp', translated as 'meja' and 'lampu', for example, there will be no issues during translation. These words can be easily translated without any need for further understanding of culture or additional information, which is referred to as 'universal language'. On the other hand, there are words that require deeper understanding or information because they are only familiar to certain people, and this is known as 'personal language'. Newmark, divides this section into five categories with examples as follows (Newmark, 1988, p. 95):

- 1) Ecology (Newmark, 1988, p. 96-97), related words are often unique to the geographical and environmental conditions of a region. These words may describe plants, animals, landscapes, and climatic conditions that don't exist elsewhere or that are perceived and named differently in other cultures. For example, Lotus, Savannah, monsoon.
- 2) Material Culture (Newmark, 1988, p. 97-98). In translation, due to its broad scope, food is often viewed as one of the most significant reflections of a country's culture. Meanwhile, aside from food, clothing also falls under cultural terms. If a generic noun or classifier is added, or if the specific item is of no particular interest, the generic word can simply replace it. For example, Soju, Kimono, Joglo.
- 3) Social Culture - work and leisure (Newmark, 1988, p. 98-99), refers more to

activities such as dance, music, and national sports. However, it can be categorized into two types: work and leisure. When dealing with social culture in translation, it's important to separate between denotative meaning and connotative meaning. For example, Kecak, Reggae, Rock.

- 4) Organization, custom, ideas (Newmark, 1988, p. 99-102), Refers to parts of a culture that are very important and closely tied to how people live and organize their society. These parts are often unique to one culture and might not have direct matches in other languages or cultures. For example, FBI, Karma
- 5) Gestures and habits (Newmark, 1988, p. 102). Gestures and habits are specific actions and routines that are typical of a particular culture. These can be physical movements, behavior, or regular practices that carry social or cultural significance. In certain situations, 'gestures and habits' can differ in terms of description and function, which may lead to *ambiguity*. They can also be interpreted differently across various cultures: thus, eye contact In Western cultures, maintaining eye contact is often a sign of confidence, while in some Asian cultures, prolonged eye contact may be considered disrespectful.

Subtitle translation requires specific strategies to ensure that meaning is effectively conveyed, the original tone is maintained, and cultural nuances resonate with the target audience. These strategies help translators overcome challenges such as text length limitations, timing constraints, and cultural differences that may not have direct equivalents in another language. Without these strategies, subtitles risk becoming awkward, confusing, or even misleading.

According to Gottlieb, the subtitle strategies framework identifies ten fundamental approaches that translators may utilize to facilitate the transfer of meaning from the source language to the target language. Each strategy is designed to address specific challenges inherent in the subtitling process, particularly in preserving the integrity of the original message while effectively adapting it to align with the linguistic and cultural norms of the target audience (Gottlieb, 1998). Henrik

Gottlieb identified ten commonly used subtitling strategies: transfer, imitation, transcription, expansion, paraphrase, dislocation, condensation, decimation, deletion, and resignation . These strategies provide a structured approach to adapting source material while preserving its essence. Rather than relying on direct word-for-word translation, which often results in unnatural or confusing subtitles, these strategies help ensure that the intended meaning is accurately conveyed.

The researcher selected the film *Penyalin Cahaya* (The Photocopier) as the data source for this study because the presence of cultural words in the film caught their attention. Set in Jakarta in 2019, the movie features a significant amount of regional language from Jakarta, Indonesia. The researcher identified several cultural words that are difficult to translate. Therefore, the research questions and objectives of this study will analyze the translation of cultural words and the subtitling strategies used by the translator, as well as assess the accuracy of the translations presented in the film. The study will examine the original cultural words spoken in the film (Source Language) and compare them to their English subtitle translations (Target Language). Since cultural words are one of the most critical and challenging aspects of translation, this research aims to gain insight into and analyze the accuracy of cultural word translation and subtitling strategies. Academically, this study seeks to contribute to the advancement of translation studies, particularly for those looking to deepen their understanding of translation techniques. Additionally, this study provides readers with a broader perspective on image analysis in literary texts.

METHODS

The type of research used in this study is qualitative research. According to Creswell, qualitative research provides a means for exploring and understanding the meaning individuals or groups ascribe to a social or human problem (Creswell, 2013). Qualitative research is a method of inquiry that aims to explore and understand the meanings that individuals or groups assign to social or human issues, emphasizing the process of understanding, interpreting, describing, and

Dzaugy Alkafi

An Analysis of Cultural Words using Nababan's Accuracy and Gottlieb's Subtitling Strategies in Movie Subtitle Penyalin Cahaya.

developing approaches to its subject matter. The cultural aspect is an important factor in translation because, fundamentally, every country and region has its own unique culture. As a result, a text may encounter obstacles and challenges when being translated within a cultural context. A good translator must understand how to translate a text, especially film subtitles, which appear on screen for a limited time and cannot be reread like text in a book. This highlights the importance of translation strategies in subtitles. The five categories of cultural words, ten subtitle strategies, and translation quality assessment, particularly accuracy, will serve as the framework for this research paper.

In this research, qualitative methods are used to address the research questions by examining the quality of the translation of cultural words, utilizing translation subtitling strategies as tools to assess the accuracy of the subtitles in the movie *Penyalin Cahaya* (The Photocopier). The researcher will also analyze the responses from interviewees who are knowledgeable about translation, and from there, the researcher will evaluate the quality assessment grading in terms of the accuracy of the translation of cultural words.

Research Instruments

Close reading

The researcher will conduct close reading by examining the source and target language subtitles in the movie to collect data on the translation of cultural words. Once the data is collected, the researcher will identify and classify the cultural words found, categorizing them into cultural word types along with the subtitle strategies used by the translator.

Questionnaire

Identified data will proceed to the questionnaire phase, where more detailed information about the translation results from the observation data will be gathered. The questionnaire will play a crucial role in this study. Information obtained from the questionnaire will help answer the

research question, serving as a primary focus of the study. Participants will be asked questions that assess the quality of the translation, specifically how well it translates cultural words, whether it is understandable, and to what extent it accurately conveys meaning.

Data Collection

The data collection method for this research is identification. The researcher identifies the subtitles of the original Indonesian film titled *Penyalin Cahaya*. The data collected by the researcher will be further analyzed through a survey to determine the accuracy of the translation. To collect data, the researcher follows several steps to conduct the study. The quality of the translation can be seen from how well the translation meets the three criteria of translation quality aspects. The quality of translation is crucial, as it should express the text in a different language while preserving the original meaning and context. To determine qualitative parameters for accuracy, an accuracy test will be conducted through a survey of several individuals who must meet certain criteria, such as an understanding of grammar, familiarity with translation processes, and knowledge or awareness of the terms relevant to the accuracy test. The respondents involved in this research are English literature students from Universitas Kristen Satya Wacana who have knowledge of translation, specifically focused on cultural words, and have also passed grammar classes with a minimum grade of B. The survey will include an option for participants to rate the translated text on a scale of 1 to 3.

Data Analysis

This research is a qualitative study. To collect data, the researcher follows several steps to conduct the study. The quality of the translation can be seen from how well the translation meets the three criteria of translation quality aspects. However, this research focuses only on assessing the accuracy of primary data to evaluate translation quality.

Category	Score	Qualitative Parameter
Accurate	3	The meanings of words in the source language texts are transferred to the target language with complete accuracy, ensuring that there are no distortions in meaning.
Less Accurate	2	The words' meanings have been correctly translated, but some distortions remain, like ambiguities or missing details, which can affect clarity.
Inaccurate	3	The meanings of words in the source language text are not accurately conveyed in the target language and have been deliberately omitted.

Based on Nababan's accuracy quality assessment table, a translation is regarded as good if it conveys the information from the source language accurately, without omitting words or meaning. If the translation reduces or changes the intended meaning, it's considered inaccurate. The quality of translation is crucial, as it should express the text in a different language while preserving the original meaning and context.

To determine qualitative parameters for accuracy, an accuracy test will be conducted through a survey of several individuals who must meet certain criteria, such as an understanding of grammar, familiarity with translation processes, and knowledge or awareness of the terms relevant to the accuracy test. The survey will include an option for participants to rate the translated text on a scale of 1 to 3. In addition to scoring, the survey also invites suggestions from participants on how the translation could be improved.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Research Findings

This research identified 40 data points categorized into five types of cultural words: ecology, material culture, socialculture, customs and ideas, and gestures and habits. Examples of the data found are as follows: Ecology: *Milky Way*. According to Newmark (1988, p. 96-97), cultural words like this fall into the ecology category because they relate to unique geographical or environmental conditions.

Material Culture: *Kimono, Kebaya*. Food and clothing are considered some of the most

widely recognized cultural words when discussing the material culture category (Newmark, 1988, p. 97-98).

Social Culture – Work and Leisure: *Dangdut music*. According to Newmark, this category should be distinguished between connotative and denotative meanings. Social culture can also encompass elements such as dance, music, and national sports.

Social Organization, Custom, and Ideas: *Assalamualaikum, Waalaikumsalam*. This category has various meanings and types. If discussing political and administrative organizations, these words fall under the Social Organization category. Meanwhile, if they pertain to historical terms, international terms, or religious terms, they are categorized under Social Custom and Ideas (Newmark, 1988, p. 99-102).

Gesture and Habits: *Mewek*. This category focuses on specific actions and routines that depend on particular cultures. Gesture and habit also differ between description and function, often leading to ambiguity in translation (Newmark, 1988, p. 102).

Out of the 40 data points analyzed, the distribution across categories is as follows: Social Culture: 21 data (52.5%),

Material Culture: 10 data (25%),
 Social Custom and Ideas: 6 data (15%),
 Ecology: 2 data (5%),

Gesture and Habit: 1 data (2.5%). Meanwhile, the subtitle strategies applied in the cultural words translations are as follows: Paraphrase: 16 data (40%),

Transfer: 10 data (25%),
 Expansion: 8 data (20%),

Dzaugy Alkafi

An Analysis of Cultural Words using Nababan's Accuracy and Gottlieb's Subtitling Strategies in Movie Subtitle Penyalin Cahaya.

Condensation: 3 data (7.5%),

Imitation: 2 data (5%),

Deletion: 1 data (2.5%).

Furthermore, 10 data points will be analyzed for translation quality using the translation quality assessment of accuracy.

Discussion

1. Ecology

1.a

SL : Cupang laci bawah

TL : The fish in the drawer

Cultural Categories : Ecology - Fauna

Subtitle Strategy : Transfer

Score :

A) 2

B) 2

C) 3

Average Score : 2,3

"Cupang laci bawah" was translated as "The fish in the drawer", which falls under the category of Ecology according to Newmark. This translation can be confusing if read without understanding the context. In the scene where this phrase appears, "Cupang laci bawah" refers to illegal goods hidden in a drawer beneath betta fish. The phrase serves as a code used by buyers when purchasing those illegal items. One issue with the translation is the rendering of "cupang" as simply "the fish." The correct translation of "cupang" is "betta fish", a species well-known in Indonesia for its beauty. Betta fish are popular among people of all ages, from children to the elderly, who enjoy keeping them as pets. In Indonesia, it is also common for children to engage in betta fish fights as a pastime. However, outside of Indonesia, betta fish are not as widely recognized, which could lead to misunderstandings. Despite this, the issue can be resolved by considering the context. If the dialogue does not specifically refer to betta fish, then the translation is still acceptable and considered accurate by respondents.

The translator used the subtitle strategy of Transfer to render the text. This choice was appropriate because "cupang" can only be translated as "betta fish" or simply "fish." The translation received an average score of 2,3,

indicating that it is less accurate. However, most respondents noted that the inaccuracy only arises when the reader is unaware of the original context.

1.b

SL : Yang saya foto adalah debu-debu bintang. Milkyway

TL : Those are night skies. Milkyway

Cultural Categories : Ecology - Flora Subtitle Strategy : Paraphrase

Score :

A) 2

B) 3

C) 3

Average Score : 2,6

The translation of "Yang saya foto adalah debu-debu bintang. Milkyway" into "Those are night skies. Milkyway" falls under the category of Ecology - Fauna, according to Newmark. This translation does not create significant issues, though some word choices may not be entirely precise. The majority of respondents agreed that the translation is accurate, but one respondent pointed out that "debu-debu bintang" could mean more than just "night skies." "Night skies" refers only to the night sky, while the dialogue's context is about a photographer searching for and capturing stars, not just the sky itself. However, the translation remains understandable, as the film's subsequent context clarifies the meaning of "night skies."

This translation received an average score of 2.6, indicating that while it can be considered accurate, it still presents minor issues upon analysis. The translator used the paraphrase strategy, rewording the phrase to convey the essence of the image being described rather than providing a direct translation. The phrase was adapted to focus on the broader visual concept of "night skies," which includes the "Milky Way." However, "debu-debu bintang" could have been translated as "stardust" to provide a more precise meaning. This choice might have better conveyed the original intent and transferred the meaning more accurately. Additionally, the translator applied the transfer strategy for "Milky Way" as it is a widely recognized term



in both languages, making direct transfer the most appropriate approach.

2. Material Culture

2.a

SL : Nasi, sate ati ampela, sayur tumis kangkung

TL : So rice, liver satay, and sauteed kale
Cultural Categories : Material Culture - Food
Subtitle Strategy : Transfer

Score :

- A) 2
- B) 3
- C) 3

Average Score : 2,6

The phrase "Nasi, sate ati ampela, tumis kangkung" falls under the category of material culture, specifically food, according to Newmark's theory. In the film's setting, which takes place in Indonesia, these dishes are commonly found in local restaurants. The translation of "sate ati ampela" creates a slightly unfamiliar phrase because, outside of Indonesia, it is uncommon to prepare satay using chicken liver, gizzards, or other organ meats. In Western countries, for example, people typically discard animal innards such as intestines, liver, and heads. However, in Indonesia, it is a common cultural practice to cook and consume various internal organs of animals, not just the meat. Since the original text does not use any specialized or unique names for the dishes, the translator applied the transfer subtitling strategy to translate the cultural terms. The food items were translated directly, with slight adaptations to align with English culinary terminology.

The translation of "Nasi, sate ati ampela, tumis kangkung" into "Rice, liver satay, sauteed kale" is considered accurate, receiving an average score of 2.6. The use of the transfer subtitling strategy was an appropriate choice for this translation, as the selected words effectively convey and transfer the intended meaning to the audience. However, some phrases might still feel unfamiliar to viewers due to cultural differences.

2.b

SL : Kamu kenapa pake Kebaya?

TL : Why are you wearing Kebaya?

Cultural Categories : Material Culture - Clothes

Subtitle Strategy : Transfer

Score :

- A) 3
- B) 3
- C) 3

Average Score : 3

The term "Kebaya" falls under the material culture category, specifically clothing, according to Newmark's theory. A kebaya is a traditional garment worn by women in Southeast Asia, particularly in Indonesia, Malaysia, Brunei, and other neighboring countries. It is commonly worn for special occasions that incorporate cultural and traditional elements, such as weddings. However, a kebaya is not strictly reserved for formal events, it can be worn at any time. In fact, several Southeast Asian airlines, such as Garuda Indonesia and Singapore Airlines, use kebaya as the official uniform for their female flight attendants.

The translation of "Kebaya" by retaining the original term presents no issues in the translation process. The translator applied the transfer subtitling strategy, keeping the word "Kebaya" as it specifically refers to a distinct cultural attire.

This translation received an average accuracy score of 3. The use of the transfer strategy was the right choice because Kebaya is a cultural icon of Southeast Asia, making it irreplaceable by any other term. The translation does not introduce any errors, and the meaning, along with its cultural significance, is conveyed accurately.

The translation of "Rawon" into "beef-nutmeg soup" is categorized as material culture according to Newmark's theory. Rawon is a traditional Indonesian dish that has existed for thousands of years. While translating "Rawon" as "beef-nutmeg soup" does not create ambiguity, it feels somewhat inaccurate upon closer inspection. This is because Rawon is essentially a beef soup

Dzaugy Alkafi

An Analysis of Cultural Words using Nababan's Accuracy and Gottlieb's Subtitling Strategies in Movie Subtitle Penyalin Cahaya.

(typically made with beef) distinguished by its black broth, which comes from a unique spice called kluwek (*pangium edule*). However, the translation "beef-nutmeg soup" misleadingly highlights nutmeg, which is not the defining ingredient of Rawon. By emphasizing "nutmeg," the translation misrepresents the soup's true essence. Rawon has a deep, earthy, slightly bitter, and rich flavor, very different from the warm, slightly sweet taste typically associated with nutmeg.

Therefore, translating "Rawon" as "beef-nutmeg soup" is inaccurate due to cultural misalignment. The translator had a good idea by using the expansion strategy to explain "Rawon" in more detail, but in doing so, they altered the dish's cultural authenticity. A better approach would be to expand the translation while preserving the essence of Rawon. For instance, instead of "beef-nutmeg soup," a more accurate translation could be: "I brought this black-beef soup..." or "I brought this Rawon..." (which keeps the original term intact).

This translation received an average accuracy score of 1,3, indicating that it is inaccurate. While using the expansion strategy was a reasonable choice, the poor word selection led to a loss of cultural authenticity.

3. Social Culture

2.c

SL : Ada titipan rawon dan sedikit uang jajan buat anak saya.

TL : I brought this beff-nutmeg soup and some money for my daughter

Cultural Categories : Material Culture - Food

Subtitle Strategy : Expansion

Score :

A) 1

B) 2

C) 1

Average Score : 1,3

3.a

SL : Mending kalo dipecat, misalnya diarak?

TL : Getting fired is nothing. What if they shame us on public?

Cultural Categories : Social Culture

Subtitle Strategy : Paraphrase

Score :

A) 2

B) 2

C) 2

Average Score : 2

The cultural word "diarak" being translated as "Shame us on public" belongs to social culture category according to Newmark's theory. Since *diarak* is a term that is not commonly heard, even among Indonesians, this translation can cause confusion. A good translator should carefully choose words that accurately convey the meaning and essence of *diarak* without altering its significance. In essence, *diarak* refers to being publicly humiliated for committing a wrongdoing. For example, in Indonesia, there are cases where thieves or criminals are caught and then paraded around (*diarak*) and shamed in public before being handed over to the authorities. However, *diarak* is not limited to criminals, it can also happen in everyday situations. For instance, if someone does something embarrassing at school and their classmates publicly humiliate them, this can also be considered *diarak*.

The translator applied the paraphrase subtitling strategy, which was a reasonable choice, but the translation "shame us on public" is less accurate due to improper word selection. One respondent pointed out that "shame us on public" is somewhat ambiguous, it could lead viewers to think that "public" refers to online spaces, such as social media, whereas in Indonesia, *diarak* always involves public humiliation in a physical space, right in the area where the incident occurs.

This translation received an average accuracy score of 2, indicating that it is less accurate. While the paraphrase strategy correctly focuses on the consequence of *diarak* rather than a literal translation, the choice of words does not fully capture the original meaning.

A better translation with clearer context could be: "Getting fired is nothing. What if they parade us through the streets to shame us?" This version maintains the paraphrase

approach while incorporating a more literal element ("parade us through the streets") to better reflect the visual and cultural meaning of *diarak*, making it easier for audiences unfamiliar with the term to understand.

3.b

SL : Katanya mau ada demo, ya?

TL : I heard there's gonna be a student protest?

Cultural Categories : Social Culture

Subtitle Strategy : Paraphrase

Score :

A) 3

B) 3

C) 3

Average Score : 3

The translation of "*Katanya mau ada demo, ya?*" into "I heard there's gonna be a student protest?" is categorized as social culture category, using the paraphrase subtitling strategy. In Indonesia, "*demo*" is widely understood as a form of political expression within a community, particularly student protests against the government. However, "*demo*" is not exclusive to students, it can refer to any form of protest in different contexts and countries. In the film, the setting is within a university environment, which is why the translator added "student" to specify that the protest involves students. While "*demo*" could have been directly translated as "protest" using the transfer strategy, the rest of the sentence required more than just a simple word-for-word conversion. The paraphrase strategy, combined with contextualization, was a better choice. The phrase was reworded to sound more natural in English while preserving the original meaning (a rumored protest). Additionally, the inclusion of "student" clarifies the context for English-speaking audiences, as this detail is implied in Indonesian but might not be immediately understood in English. The translator rendered this translation without losing the original meaning and message of the source text.

This translation received an average accuracy score of 3, indicating that it is accurate, as it successfully conveys the

student-related context in line with the film's university setting.

4. Social Custom, and Ideas

4.a

SL : Emang ini hari Kartini?

TL : It's not Women's day

Cultural Categories : Custom and Ideas

Subtitle Strategy : Paraphrase

Score :

A) 1

B) 1

C) 1

Average Score : 1

"*Emang ini Hari Kartini?*" was translated as "It's not Women's Day" which falls under social customs and ideas, according to Newmark. This translation is highly critical, as a translator's fundamental role is to convey meaning and context accurately from one language to another without omitting or altering essential details. Below is an explanation of what Kartini Day is and why this translation received a score of 1, deeming it inaccurate. Kartini Day is an Indonesian national holiday celebrated annually on April 21st, honoring the birth of Raden Adjeng Kartini, a key figure in women's emancipation and education in Indonesian history. She is recognized for her advocacy for gender equality and her efforts to improve educational opportunities for women in the late 19th and early 20th centuries. Several key mistakes in the translation make it inaccurate. First, the translator attempted to translate the concept of "*Hari Kartini*" into English as "Women's Day". While Kartini Day can be seen as an Indonesian equivalent of Women's Day, the term "Women's Day" internationally refers to International Women's Day (March 8th), a globally recognized event. Therefore, equating Kartini Day with Women's Day in translation causes cultural confusion by blending two distinct observances into one. Second, the translator used a paraphrase strategy, but the translation is highly inaccurate. The original phrase "*Emang ini Hari Kartini?*" is a question, while the English translation "It's not Women's Day" is a statement. In the film

Dzaugy Alkafi

An Analysis of Cultural Words using Nababan's Accuracy and Gottlieb's Subtitling Strategies in Movie Subtitle Penyalin Cahaya.

scene where this dialogue appears, the question is asked because someone is seen wearing traditional attire, which is typically worn on Kartini Day. The subtitle should have maintained the interrogative form to reflect the original meaning correctly.

Instead, the translation completely misinterprets the source text, failing to preserve both meaning and cultural context. This translation received a score of 1, indicating inaccuracy. The translator failed to properly transfer the cultural element into English and also changed the sentence structure in a way that distorted the intended message. A better approach would have been to use the transfer strategy while keeping the reference to Kartini Day intact, resulting in a more accurate translation like: "Is this Kartini Day?".

Cultural Categories : Custom and Ideas

Subtitle Strategy : Paraphrase

Score :

A) 1

B) 3

C) 2

Average Score : 2

"Rezeki gua seret entar" was translated as "I don't want any dirty money", which falls under the category of social customs and ideas, according to Newmark. "Rezeki gua seret entar" is an informal Indonesian expression. "Rezeki" can be translated as fortune or blessings, while "seret" means difficult or slow. The phrase suggests a belief that someone fears struggling to earn money in the future. In Indonesia, people often say this as a reminder to avoid unethical financial actions, ensuring their fortune remains steady and unhindered. This translation received an average score of 2, indicating that the translation is less accurate. Some respondents agreed with this translation, however, the translation "dirty money" raised concerns in discussions with some respondents. In Indonesia, "dirty money" typically refers to illegally obtained or unethical money (commonly known as uang haram). One respondent pointed out that translating "rezeki seret" as "dirty money" is inaccurate because rezeki seret refers to

financial hardship rather than money obtained through illegal means. This translation uses the subtitle strategy of paraphrase. The translator shifted the meaning of "rezeki gua seret entar" to "I don't want any dirty money" because "rezeki" is a culturally specific concept less familiar in other languages. However, the translator could have retained the essence of "rezeki" with options like: "I don't want to taint my fortune." This conveys the speaker's concern about their actions affecting their future financial success. "I don't want to block my blessings." Directly translates "rezeki" as "blessings", preserving its positive connotation. However, it might require more context to fully convey the meaning

5. Gesture and habits

4.b

SL : Rezeki gua seret entar

TL : I Don't want any dirty money

5.a

SL : Daripada mewek

TL : Uh, I'm a teary mess

Cultural Categories : Gesture and habits

Subtitle Strategy : Paraphrase

Score :

A) 2

B) 2

C) 2

Average Score : 2

The translation of "Daripada mewek" into "Uh, I'm a teary mess" falls under the category of gestures, according to Newmark. While the translation conveys the general sentiment, it is not entirely accurate. In the Indonesian context, "mewek" refers to an emotional expression of sadness where someone begins to cry or shed tears. According to the Indonesian dictionary (KBBI), "mewek" specifically means "starting to cry." However, the English phrase "teary mess" implies a more intense state of someone who is not just tearing up but has already been crying heavily, possibly looking disheveled due to their tears and sadness. Most respondents disagreed with this translation. However, since "mewek" is a term more commonly used in Indonesian

culture, they could understand why the translator chose this phrase, as it attempts to convey a similar emotional expression in English. Still, the translation is considered less accurate. Respondents also suggested alternative translations that they felt would be more precise.

The translator used the paraphrase strategy to reword "mewek" with a different phrase in English. This translation received an average score of 2, indicating that it is less accurate. "Uh, I'm a teary mess" is not necessarily a poor translation, as it captures part of the intended emotion. However, more direct translations such as "Instead of crying" may be more appropriate, as they align more closely with the literal meaning of the original phrase.

CONCLUSION

This research analyzed the translation of cultural words in the Indonesian film "Penyalin Cahaya" (The Photocopier) by examining 40 data points using Newmark's cultural word categories, Gottlieb's subtitling strategies, and Nababan's accuracy assessment framework. The findings revealed several significant patterns in the translation of cultural elements.

The analysis showed that social culture terms dominated the cultural words found in the film, comprising 52.5% of the data, followed by material culture (25%), social customs and ideas (15%), ecology (5%), and gestures and habits (2.5%). This distribution reflects the film's strong emphasis on social and cultural elements within its narrative.

Regarding subtitling strategies, paraphrase was the most frequently employed approach (40%), followed by transfer (25%), expansion (20%), condensation (7.5%), imitation (5%), and deletion (2.5%). The prevalence of paraphrase strategy suggests that many cultural terms required contextual adaptation rather than direct translation to effectively convey meaning to the target audience. The accuracy assessment of selected translations revealed varying degrees of success in cultural word translation. While some terms were accurately translated, maintaining both meaning and cultural context, others faced challenges in conveying cultural nuances. Notable examples include the translation of cultural-specific terms like "Rawon" and "Hari Kartini," where the chosen translations failed to capture the full cultural significance of the original terms.

The significance of subtitle translation in films extends beyond mere language conversion. In today's globalized world, subtitles serve as crucial bridges that enable audiences to access and appreciate cinematic content from different cultures. Quality subtitle translation is essential for preserving the artistic integrity of films while making them accessible to international audiences. Poor translation can lead to misunderstandings, loss of cultural context, and diminished viewer experience, potentially affecting the film's impact and reception in foreign markets.

Furthermore, the transfer of cultural information through accurate subtitle translation plays a vital role in cross-cultural understanding and appreciation. When cultural elements are properly translated, they can introduce viewers to new perspectives, traditions, and ways of life, fostering cultural awareness and empathy. This cultural exchange through film can help break down stereotypes, promote diversity, and create meaningful connections between different societies. The challenge lies in finding the right balance between maintaining cultural authenticity and ensuring comprehensibility for audiences unfamiliar with the source culture.

This study highlights the complexity of translating cultural words in audiovisual content and emphasizes the importance of maintaining cultural authenticity while ensuring comprehensibility for the target audience. The findings suggest that successful cultural word translation requires not only linguistic expertise but also deep cultural understanding and careful consideration of context-appropriate subtitling strategies.

For future research, it would be valuable to explore how different subtitling strategies might be optimized for specific categories of cultural words, particularly in the context of Indonesian films being translated for international audiences. Additionally, investigating audience reception of different translation approaches could provide valuable insights for improving the quality of cultural word translation in subtitling. Such research could contribute to developing more effective methods for preserving cultural nuances while making foreign films more accessible to global audiences.

Dzaugy Alkafi

An Analysis of Cultural Words using Nababan's Accuracy and Gottlieb's Subtitling Strategies in Movie Subtitle Penyalin Cahaya.

REFERENCES

- Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (3rd ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Gottlieb, H. (1994). Subtitling: Diagonal translation. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 2, 101–121.
- Larson, M. L. (1998). *Meaning-based translation: A guide to cross-language equivalence*. University Press of America.
- Nababan, M., Nuraeni, A., & Sumardiono. (2012). Pengembangan model penilaian kualitas terjemahan. *Kajian Linguistik dan Sastra*, 24, 39–57.
- Newmark, P. (1988). *A textbook of translation*. Prentice Hall International.
- Oktaviani, R. N., & Nugroho, R. A. (2022, April 1). CNN News Indonesia "Interview with Oprah Winfrey and Meghan Markle": The translation technique analysis on subtitles in television series *Victorious: Free shipping*. In *Undergraduate Conference on Language, Literature, and Culture* (Vol. 2, pp. 165–172).
- Setiawan, J., Budiasningrum, R. S., Efendi, A. S., & Suhardianto. (2024, May 5). An analysis of subtitling strategies in *Inside Out* movie based on Gottlieb's theory. *Jurnal Ilmiah Research Student*, 1(5), 119–125. <https://doi.org/10.61722/jirs.v1i5.1259>
- Taqi, Q. A., & Wulandari, D. (2024, April 1). Subtitling strategies in *Taken* movie based on Gottlieb's theory. *Jurnal Sosial Humaniora dan Pendidikan*, 3(1), 39–49. <https://doi.org/10.56127/jushpen.v3i1.1467>