

## HOW EFFECTIVE IS ECLECTIC METHOD TO TEACH ACADEMIC WRITING?

Benny Krisbiantoro<sup>1</sup>

*Program Studi Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris, Fakultas Ilmu Sosial, Universitas Harapan Bangsa, Indonesia*

Email: [bennykrisbiantoro@uhb.ac.id](mailto:bennykrisbiantoro@uhb.ac.id)

Tri Pujiani<sup>2</sup>

*Program Studi Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris, Fakultas Ilmu Sosial, Universitas Harapan Bangsa, Indonesia*

Email: [tripujiani@uhb.ac.id](mailto:tripujiani@uhb.ac.id)

### Abstract

The Eclectic Method is a combination of several learning methods to accommodate differences in students' various characteristics, such as learning styles or preferences, experiences, habits, background, and of course learning abilities.

The method employed in this research was a quasi-experimental research with post-test-only non-equivalent control group design. The result of the research findings led to the conclusion that eclectic method was more effective than scientific approach to teach writing for the eighth semester students of the Nursing Study Program, Faculty of Health, Harapan Bangsa University. It was proven that the mean score of the students' writing in experimental class was 78.19 while the mean score of the students' writing in control class was 72.14. The t-test result in the research was 2.32 and the t-table is 2.02. It meant that t-test score was higher than the t-table. Based on the research findings, it could be concluded that the use of eclectic method was effective to teach writing for the eighth semester students of the Nursing Department, Faculty of Health, Harapan Bangsa University.

Keywords: Writing, Experimental Research, Eclectic Method, Scientific Approach

This paper has been presented in an international conference on community health (ICCH) held by Harapan Bangsa University on October 8-9<sup>th</sup>, 2019 and has been published in a proceeding of ICCH; it can be accessed in <http://id/lppm.uhb.ac.id/proceeding/proceeding-2019/the-effectiveness-of-eclectic-method-and-scientific-approach-to-teach-academic-writing/>. However, the authors realized that the paper still has several shortcomings revealed after it has been presented and obtained some inquiries from the audiences as follows:

1. How to differentiate between eclectic method and blended learning method?
2. How to ensure the quality of the students' writing?
3. Because it is an academic writing, how did you help the students generate their ideas academically?

Those questions triggered the authors to write an additional explanation, information as well as solutions regarding the issues of the implementation of eclectic method to teach academic writing in the context of a tertiary educational level and all of them were clearly explained in the discussion of this paper.

## INTRODUCTION

In the history of the teaching profession, several teaching methods and strategies that have been developed by leading experts and scholars in education have proven effective when compared to traditional teaching methods. Some methods such as Grammar Translation Method, Direct Method, Audio-lingual Method, Communicative Method, Contextual Teaching and Learning Method, Cooperative Learning Method, etc. each has strengths and weaknesses (Al-Mamun & Jakir, 2014). Therefore, to cover the shortcomings and imperfections of each of these methods and strategies, a comprehensive approach or method is needed (Ullah, et. al., 2018). The eclectic approach was born out of the realization that each of the individual methods had strengths and weaknesses and that no one method was responsive to the dynamic classroom context (Mwanza, 2016). Method or approach that is capable of meeting various kinds of student needs and for making students rich and fluent in communication skills is very necessary (Brown, 2000). Method or approach that combines several methods, techniques, approaches, models, and strategies in teaching communication skills is eclectic method. According to Larsen-Freeman (2004), the eclectic method is a pluralistic, inclusive, comprehensive and comprehensive teaching approach where the best techniques and pieces of different teaching methods are systematically and logically combined and used eclectically with the aim of meeting the needs of diverse student needs.

AlJarrah et al. (2018) conducted a study entitled "The Eclectic Approach as a Therapy for Teaching English as a Foreign Language to the Arabic Students" and the results of his research showed that an eclectic approach gave students the opportunity to see different types of teaching techniques that were able to stop boredom / monotony. Jebiwot (2014) also conducted a study entitled "The Use of the Eclectic Method in Teaching and Learning in English Primary Schools: A Case for Selected Schools in Eldoret East District, Kenya" and found that the eclectic method made teaching English more practical because this could help students remember and build their confidence. Ula (2018) conducted a study entitled "The Implementation of the Eclectic Method in Teaching Writing Recount Text of the Eight Graders". The results of his research showed that teachers could apply eclectic methods successfully. The teacher can combine scientific methods, Peer Correction techniques and Grammar Translation Method in teaching writing. In addition, students can write very well, especially in developing content, compiling texts, composing sentences, choosing vocabulary and writing procedures.

There are some differences between the previous studies and the author's study. The author's study mainly focuses on the effectiveness of eclectic method and scientific approach to teach academic writing. On the contrary, the study of Al Jarrah, et. al was generally concerned about the use of Eclectic approach as the therapy to teach English to Arabic students. Their study did not mention specifically what language skill they

mainly focused on. Besides, the author study was conducted in the Indonesian nursing class which took English for Academic Purposes. Another research conducted by Jebiwot focused on the application of eclectic method to teach in English primary schools. On the other hand, the author's study paid attention to the implementation of eclectic method to teach writing to university students. In Ula's study, it was found that eclectic method was effective to teach writing. However, her research was conducted to the second year students of junior high school and it focused on the enhancement of the students' recount text writing. Meanwhile, the author's study focused on the use of eclectic method and scientific approach to teach academic writing specifically on the report text writing. Therefore, this study was seen as an innovative and recent research because there have not been any other studies which focused on the implementation of eclectic method to teach academic writing to the university students. In addition, it also employs the scientific approach to teach academic writing which requires the students' critical and analytical thinking.

Another approach that is widely used besides the eclectic method and recently the Indonesian government has used it is the scientific approach. The scientific approach is the approach used in the 2013 curriculum. This approach is considered as the right way to develop and improve students' attitudes, skills and knowledge. In addition, this approach in theoretical textbooks generally refers to methods for gaining knowledge where researchers

move inductively from their observations to hypotheses (Ary et al., 2010: 8). This approach then sets out the following steps: observing, questioning, gathering information / experimenting, associating, and communicating.

Writing skill is one of the basic academic trilogy skills in higher education, besides reading (book review) and talking (presentation and discussion). Students have difficulty participating in student reasoning activities that require one main skill, namely writing. The type of writing they have to master is academic writing. There are four types of academic writing, namely, report, analytic, persuasive and critical. Academic writing in the form of a report is the simplest type of academic writing. The purpose of the report's academic writing is to provide facts or information. In addition, this type of writing is usually presented in the form of an example summary of an article or report on trial / experiment results. The second type of academic writing is analytical writing. These analytical academic writings include descriptive elements in it but we can also rearrange the facts and information we describe into categories, groups, parts, types or relationships. The next type of academic writing is a type of persuasive. This type has all the features of analytical writing with our added viewpoint as the author of the text. And the last type of academic writing is critical type. In this type of writing, the author is required to present more than one point of view, namely the point of view of another person and the perspective of the author himself.

Given the work of writing gives great hope for the author to work, then the ideal of students must be able to make good and right academic writing. However, based on the result of researchers' interview with lecturers who taught writing material to the 8th semester students of S1 Nursing Science Study Program, Harapan Bangsa University, Purwokerto, the results of writing students' work were disappointing. To write a simple essay about yesterday's holiday experience, students have not been able to make writing correctly, especially well. The same thing they will experience when asked to write an academic writing / essay for example writing an academic essay report.

Writing an academic report that is taught to the 8th semester students of S1 Nursing Study Program at Harapan Bangsa University in Purwokerto is in the form of writing a report from a diagram / chart. This material is listed in the syllabus or description of the lectures on English for Nursing 4 (EFN) courses which focus on English for Academic Purposes taught in the even semester of the academic year of 2018/2019.

Referring to the facts mentioned above, the researchers intend to find out the effectiveness of the eclectic method and scientific approach to teach writing academic writing type reports to 8th semester students of S1 Nursing study programs who are currently attending English for Nursing 4.

Every student wants to get a higher and better learning achievement. Even farther, every

student can surely create a text (both a fictive text and a non-fictive one) well and correctly. In order to create a correct and good text, it is truly needed a regular exercise, with particular time frequency, and immediately. The exercise of writing can be done by seeing or listening to something, then contemplated, and the result of the contemplation is written. In eclectic method, the teacher provides some teaching methods and learning models to make the students understand the materials well and quickly. The teacher digs out the students' interest and learning styles so that the teaching and learning process can work well and effectively. The methods used in this research are cooperative learning, problem-based learning, guided writing, and project-based learning. Those methods are combined together to teach writing a report text to the students of the eighth semester students of Nursing Department of Harapan Bangsa University. The students get interested in involving and interacting with other students in the classroom because there are many activities which promote them how to write a report text in a fun and interesting manner both individually and in group.

The objective of this research was to investigate whether the eclectic method was more effective than the scientific approach to teach academic writing to the eighth semester students of Bachelor of Nursing Department, Faculty of Health, Harapan Bangsa University in the academic year of 2018/2019.

The hypothesis of this research was that the eclectic method was more effective than the scientific

approach to teach academic writing to the eighth semester students of Bachelor of Nursing Department,

### **Eclectic Method**

#### **a. Definition of Eclectic Method**

The eclectic learning method was introduced in the early 1990s and became popular lately. Freeman (2000) and Mellow (2000) both used the eclecticism term to describe the desired, coherent pluralistic approach to teaching language learning. According to Floresar (2008), the eclectic method is a combination of different learning approaches. Ruth (2008) defined an eclectic method as something obtained from various sources. Based on these explanations, the eclectic method is a method that combines a variety of methods tailored to the learning objectives, the nature of the subject matter, the ability of students, even the condition of the teacher. Combining or merging here, of course, does not combine all the methods at once, but rather is patchy, meaning that a particular method is seen to overcome the shortcomings of other methods.

#### **b. Principles of Eclectic Method**

There are several principles of the eclectic method in language teaching, as follows:

- 1) Provide opportunities for teachers to choose different types of teaching techniques in each class period to achieve learning goals.
- 2) Flexibility in choosing aspects or methods that the teacher feels are suitable for teaching in the classroom.
- 3) Provide opportunities for students to see different types of teaching techniques.

Faculty of Health, Harapan Bangsa University in the academic year of 2018/2019.

4) Solve difficulties related to presenting language material in student textbooks.

5) Using a variety of different types of props that lead to better understanding.

#### **c. The strengths of the Eclectic Method**

The advantages of the eclectic method are as follows:

- 1) Teachers can make teaching more varied and interesting.
- 2) Problems of individual differences and less interesting learning environment material can be solved.
- 3) Teachers can be more confident and convincing in teaching language skills.
- 4) The students can be encouraged by the activeness in learning.
- 5) Teachers can deliver lesson material more quickly.
- 6) Teachers can revive the atmosphere of learning and teaching in the classroom.
- 7) Students are enthusiastic in learning / not easily saturated.
- 8) Can make students concentrate more on the lesson.

#### **d. The weaknesses of the Eclectic Method**

The weaknesses of the eclectic method are as follows:

- 1) Allocation of time, willingness of teachers and students should be well planned.
- 2) Not necessarily all teachers are able to use this method. Because the use of this method requires teachers to be energetic and versatile. Likewise,

on the student side, activities that are too varied can cause their own boredom.

3) It takes a long time compared to other methods. Even though the time for writing English text material is relatively very limited.

#### e. The Steps of Combining Several Learning Methods

When combining learning methods, there are several steps that must be followed to achieve effective learning. Following are the steps:

- 1) Formulate learning indicators / objectives that are in accordance with basic competencies.
- 2) Explore learning methods and their features and choose features that will

be combined and used by the teacher in learning that is suitable with the learning objectives / infrastructure / learning time.

3) Write down the order of features that will be integrated as the core learning activities

#### f. The teaching Steps of Eclectic Method

In this study, researchers used four different methods namely cooperative learning, problem-based learning approach, guided-writing, and project-based method. The four methods or approaches were used to teach writing academic writing for eight meetings. The teaching steps of the eclectic method for teaching academic writing are as follows:

Table 1 Teaching Steps of Eclectic Method Teaching

The First Meeting	
Teaching Steps	Learning Activity
The First Step: Stating Objective and Motivating Students	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The teacher prepares students to take part in the learning process, checks mastery of competencies, delivers the learning objectives to be achieved.</li> <li>2. The teacher delivers learning materials, learning activities, methods to be used in learning (cooperative learning in the first and the second meeting is problem-based learning, in the third and fourth meeting is problem-based learning, guided writing is in the fifth and sixth meeting, and project-based approaches in the seventh and eighth meeting), forms and assessment techniques that will be used in learning.</li> <li>3. The teacher motivates students by showing videos of trends in consumption of Australian teenage fast food.</li> <li>4. The teacher asks students about the contents of the video.</li> </ol>
The Second Step: Presenting Information	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The teacher presents information to students with explanatory methods about trends in consumption of Australian teenage fast food.</li> <li>2. The teacher explains the types of diagrams.</li> <li>3. The teacher explains the tips for writing a report text.</li> <li>4. The teacher explains the language features, functional expressions, coherence and cohesion and vocabularies used in writing the report text</li> </ol>
The Third Step: Organizing Students into Groups Work	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The teacher explains to students at group distribution technique.</li> <li>2. The students form study groups based on teacher explanation</li> </ol>
The Fourth Step: Guiding Group Work and Studying	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Students with their groups gather to match vocabularies with pictures.</li> <li>2. Students with their groups gather to complete an incomplete text using the functional vocabularies and phrases provided.</li> <li>3. Students with their groups gather to compose random sentences into good text.</li> </ol>
The Fifth Step: Evaluating	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The teacher evaluates group learning outcomes.</li> <li>2. The teacher notifies the material to be taught at the next meeting.</li> </ol>



The Second Meeting	
Teaching Steps	Learning Activities
The First Step: Reviewing Materials in the Previous Meeting	1. The teacher asks students what they have learned in the previous meeting. 2. The teacher reviews the previous material. 3. The teacher motivates students by showing a video of the trend of the number of people who eat five servings of fruits and vegetables per day. 4. The teacher asks students about the contents of the video.
The Second Step: Presenting Information	1. The teacher presents information to students with the explanation method about the trend of the number of people who eat five servings of fruits and vegetables per day. 2. The teacher explains the organization of paragraphs. 3. The teacher explains how to write the opening paragraph.
The Third Step: Organizing Students into Groups Work	1. The teacher explains to students at group distribution technique. 2. The students form study groups based on teacher explanation
The Fourth Step: Guiding Group Work and Studying	1. Students with their groups gather to compose random sentences into paragraphs. 2. Students with their groups gather to write the opening paragraph framework according to the theme being discussed, namely the trend of the number of people who eat five servings of fruits and vegetables per day. 3. Students with their groups gather to write the opening paragraph.
The Fifth Step: Evaluating	1. The teacher evaluates group learning outcomes. 2. The teacher notifies the material to be taught at the next meeting.
The Third Meeting: Problem-based Learning Approach	
Teaching Steps	Learning Activities
The First Step: Problem Giving	1. The teacher divides students into several groups. 2. The teacher gives a theme of the problems that are happening in society today. The theme given is the consumption of four types of meat consumed by Europeans and what are the effects of consuming and not consuming the four types of meat
The Second Step: Reference Browsing	1. The teacher asks students to look for references or data, facts, evidence and examples on the internet in groups. 2. The teacher asks students to write what they get from the results of their browsing.
The Third Meeting: Presenting Information	1. The teacher explains how to write paragraphs of content / overview. 2. The teacher explains the trend of the fact that consumption of four types of meat consumed by Europeans 3. The teacher asks students to look at the trends depicted in the diagram. 4. The teacher asks students to write a draft of content / overview paragraph
The Fourth Meeting: Paragraph Constructing	1. The teacher checks the draft of content paragraphs that have been made by students. 2. The teacher asks students to write paragraphs of content.
The Fifth Step: Exposing	1. The teacher checks and gives feedback on the students' content paragraphs draft. 2. The teacher asks one or two groups to present the results of their writing. 3. Teacher or students can provide suggestions and feedback on student writing.
The Fourth Meeting: Problem-based Learning Approach	
Teaching Steps	Learning Activities
The First Step: Problem Giving	1. The teacher divides students into several groups.

			2. The teacher gives a theme of the problems that are happening in society today. The theme given is consumer expenditure on five different items.
The Second Step:	Reference Browsing		1. The teacher asks students to look for references or data, facts, evidence and examples on the internet in groups. 2. The teacher asks students to write what they get from the results of their browsing.
The Third Step:	Presenting Information		1. The teacher explains how to write paragraphs of content / overview. 2. The teacher explains the trends in consumer expenditure on five different items. 3. The teacher asks students to look at the trends depicted in the diagram. 4. The teacher asks students to write a draft of content paragraphs.
The Fourth Step:	Paragraph Constructing		1. The teacher checks the draft of content paragraphs that have been made by students. 2. The teacher asks students to write paragraphs of content.
The Fifth Step:	Exposing		1. The teacher checks and gives feedback on the students' content paragraphs draft. 2. The teacher asks one or two groups to present the results of their writing. 3. Teacher or students can provide suggestions and feedback on student writing.
The Fifth Meeting: Guided Writing			
Teaching Steps		Learning Activities	
The First Step:	Pre-Writing Activities		1. The teacher asks students to brainstorm everything they know about the topic given and write their response on a piece of paper. The teacher reminds students that there are no wrong ideas in brainstorming. The topic given at this meeting is digital games and their sales.
The Second Step:	Whilst-Writing Activities		1. The teacher shares the model report text with students. 2. The teacher asks students to identify the organization of the text. 3. The teacher gives the topic from the report text. 4. The teacher asks students to develop the topic. 5. Teachers and students study the opening paragraph / model. 6. The teacher asks students to write paragraphs of content / overview based on topics that have been developed.
The Third Step:	Post-Writing Activities		1. The teacher asks one or two students to present the results of their writing. 2. The teacher and other students give comments and suggestions to the presenter.
The Sixth Meeting: Guided Writing			
Teaching Steps		Learning Activities	
The First Step:		1. The teacher asks students to brainstorm everything they know about the topic given and write their response on a piece of paper. The teacher reminds students that there are no wrong ideas in brainstorming. The topic given at this meeting is duration of the teenagers time in carrying out certain activities.	
The Second Step:	Whilst-writing Activities		1. The teacher shares the model report text with students. 2. The teacher asks students to identify the organization of the text. 3. The teacher gives the topic from the report text. 4. The teacher asks students to develop the topic. 5. The teacher and students study the opening paragraph / model and content / overview paragraphs. 6. The teacher asks the students to write a closing paragraph.
The Third Step:	Post-Writing Activities		1. The teacher asks one or two students to present the results of their writing. 2. The teacher and other students give comments and suggestions to the presenter.



The Seventh and the Eighth Meeting: Project-based Learning	
Teaching Steps	Learning Activities
The First Step: Project Determination	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The teacher gives the theme of writing report text. Each group gets a theme that is different from the theme of the other groups.</li> <li>2. Students in groups according to the group that was made at the previous meeting.</li> <li>3. Students together with their groups determine the tasks of each group member. There are those who write the opening paragraph, there are paragraphs of contents and there are closing paragraphs.</li> </ol>
The Second Step: Project Realization	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Students together with their groups write texts according to the theme given by the teacher and according to the division of tasks.</li> <li>2. Students together with their groups gather together the draft of their writing.</li> </ol>
The Third Step: Completion of the Project with facilitation and monitoring of the Teacher	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The teacher asks each group to present their writing.</li> <li>2. The teacher gives comments, feedback and suggestions.</li> </ol>
The Fourth Step: Construction of Final Report Text	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The teacher asks each group to finalize their writing.</li> <li>2. Students write the report text completely and correctly.</li> </ol>
The Fifth Step: Evaluation on the Process and the Result of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The teacher and students at the end of the learning process reflect on the activities and results of the project assignments writing a report text.</li> <li>2. Students individually express their experiences during completing project tasks.</li> <li>3. The teacher provides general conclusions for the results of the student project assignments.</li> </ol>

### Scientific Approach

There are five steps in applying a scientific approach:

#### a. Observing

There are two main activities that must be done to lead to the step of observing. First, teacher provides students with a broad opportunity to make observations. Observations can be made through reading, listening, or seeing objects. Second, the teacher facilitates students to make observations and trains students to observe important things from the object.

#### b. Questioning

Questioning is the step used to make students achieve encouragement and inspiration to actively learn and develop questions about and for themselves; to improve

students' skills in speaking, asking questions, and others can answer logically, systematically using appropriate and correct grammar; to encourage student participation in discussions, debate, develop the ability to think and draw conclusions; and to build an attitude of openness to give and receive opinions or ideas, enrich vocabulary, and develop social tolerance in gregarious ways.

#### c. Experimenting

In experimenting, the steps are preparation, work, and follow-up. There are five activities that can be carried out in the experiment, 1) Grouping students into groups, 2) asking students to discuss, 3) recording findings, 4) monitoring the learning process to ensure that all students are actively involved in the

discussion, and 5) directing groups who need help.

d. Associating

Associating is the ability to analyze and associate information that occurs in groups. Associating is the process of analyzing information to find relationships between one information and other information and to find patterns of information linkages so that one can draw conclusions from the patterns found.

e. Communicating

Communicating is the ability to deduce facts that have been observed and tried. There are four activities that can be done in communicating the steps, 1) asking students to read their work in class, 2) asking each group to listen well and providing additional input related to the work of each group, 3) giving explanations after the discussion group ends, and 4) arranges assignments and provides opportunities for students to demonstrate attitudes, skills, and understanding of the substance of the learning provided.

## METHODOLOGY

This study employed a quasi-experimental method with a post-test-only non-equivalent control group design. This is a research design where there are two groups studied which are randomly selected. The first group is called the experimental group which will be given treatment, while the second group is called the control group which is not treated.

This research was carried out in the bachelor of nursing study program. The subjects in this study were the eighth semester students who were attending English for Academic Purposes (English for

Nursing 4) course in the English language development program organized by the Language Development Center (P2B) of Harapan Bangsa University, Purwokerto. The objects of this research were the use of eclectic method and scientific approach to teach academic writing.

The population in this study was the eighth semester students of S1 Nursing Study Program at Harapan Bangsa University in Purwokerto who were attending the English for Academic Purpose (EFN 4) course in the academic year of 2018/2019. The total population in this study was 107 students divided into 6 classes: Upper Elementary 8A, Upper Intermediate 8A, Pre Advance 8A, Upper Elementary 8B, Upper Intermediate 8B, and Pre Advance 8B.

The samples of this study were Upper Intermediate 8B and Upper Intermediate 8A. Each class consisted of 21 students. The Upper Intermediate 8B was experimental class. In this class, the lecturer taught writing using eclectic method. The control group in this research was the Upper Intermediate 8A. In this class, the lecturer taught writing using the scientific approach.

In this study, the researchers used purposive sampling to determine the sample. Purposive sampling is a technique of determining samples with certain considerations.

In this study there was one dependent variable and one independent variable. The dependent variable was writing competence and the independent variable was the method and approach to teaching.

## FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

As mentioned in the third chapter, this study used data obtained from the score of students' writing in the experimental class who was

treated using eclectic method and in the control class with a scientific approach. The description of the data in this study was divided into the two sections described below:

### 1. Description of The Students' Writing Score Taught Using Eclectic Method.

Table 2. The students' writing score taught using Eclectic Method

Teaching Method	N	Mean	Median	Mode	S	Max	Min.
<i>Eclectic Method</i>	21	78.19	85.57	83.07	4.65	89	66

From the table 2, the mean score of the students' writing was 78.19, median was 85.57, mode was 83.07 and deviation standard was 4.65.

Table 3. Frequency Distribution of the Students' Score Taught Using Eclectic Method

Class Limit	Mid Point (Xi)	fi	Xifi	Xi <sup>2</sup>	fiXi <sup>2</sup>
65-69	67	5	335	11225	561125
70-74	72	2	144	20736	41472
75-79	77	2	154	23716	47432
80-84	82	7	574	329476	2306332
85-89	87	5	435	189225	946125
N=		21	1642		3902486
Mean=			78.1905		



Picture 1. Histogram and Polygon of the Students' Writing Score Taught Using Eclectic Method

### 2. Description of the Students' Writing Score Taught Using Scientific Approach

Table 4. The Students' Writing Score Taught Using Scientific Approach

Teaching Method	N	Mean	Median	Mode	S	Max	Min.
<i>Scientific Approach</i>	21	72.14	69.29	66.25	6.74	86	59

From the table 4, the mean score of the students' writing was 72.14,

median was 69.29, mode was 66.25 and deviation standard was 6.74.

Table 5. Frequency Distribution of the Students' Score Taught Using Scientific Approach

Class Limit	Mid Point (Xi)	fi	Xifi	Xi <sup>2</sup>	fiXi <sup>2</sup>
58-62	60	1	60	3600	3600
63-67	65	7	455	207025	1449175
68-72	70	5	350	122500	612500
73-77	75	0	0	0	0
78-82	80	6	480	230400	1382400
83-87	85	2	170	28900	57800
N=		21	1515		3505475
Mean=		72.1429			



Picture 2. Histogram and Polygon of the Students' Writing Score Taught Using Scientific Approach

### Hypothesis Testing (Independent t-test)

The researchers used the calculation of t-test to find out whether there was a difference between the score of the

experimental group and the score of the control group or not. From the computation of the data using independent t-test obtained the data as follows:

Table 6. Summary of Independent t-test Data

Summary	Experimental Class	Control Class
Mean Score	78.19	72.14
Variance	13.13	27.21
F count	2.59	
F table	3.49	
t count	2.39	
t table	2.02	
Conclusion	t count (2.39) > t table (2.02) H <sub>0</sub> rejected, H <sub>1</sub> accepted	

Independent t-tests could be used to analyze the data provided that the data came from two independent groups and first had to find out whether the data variant was equal (unequal variance) or not. Therefore, a variance homogeneity test was previously needed. Based on table

5.6, F count is less than F table where it meant that the data in this study were of the same variance (equal variance). Then after calculating the independent t-test, it was known that t count (2.39) > t table (2.02) which meant H<sub>0</sub> was rejected and H<sub>1</sub> was accepted. In other words, the eclectic

method was more effective in improving students' academic writing skills when compared to students taught using the scientific approach.

### **Discussion of the Results**

This research is an experimental study conducted to determine the effectiveness of the eclectic method to teach academic writing to the eighth semester students of Nursing Science, S1 Faculty of Health, Harapan Bangsa University in the 2018/2019 academic year. Based on the results of this study, it could be said that the eclectic method was more effective than the scientific approach to teach academic writing.

The Eclectic method is a teaching method that combines several methods, techniques, approaches and strategies. This combination is tailored to the needs of students and the learning objectives to be achieved. Eclectic method can also encourage student activity in learning and so that they are more enthusiastic in learning / not easily saturated. In addition, teachers / lecturers can be more confident and more convincing in teaching language skills. The eclectic method is also a method that encourages students to develop their ideas and then write their ideas well and effectively. The lecturer uses an eclectic method to teach students how to write academic writing correctly. Here the role of a lecturer is needed not only as a tutor but also as a facilitator. This is closely related to the ability of lecturers to facilitate group discussions, creating a healthy environment where all group members contribute to discussions

and lecturers also provide feedback and monitor the progress of student work groups. In addition to the ability of lecturers to provide a variety of methods and strategies in writing learning, the ability of students to create academic writing in the form of report text, using cooperative learning method, a problem-based approach, guided writing, and project-based approach is also needed especially in writing learning that requires intensive learning, long time and relevant exercises. In other words, students must be able to use various methods and strategies in learning to write academic writing. Eclectic method is a combination of various different methods and each method has its own advantages and disadvantages and by applying the eclectic method the teacher or lecturer can cover the shortcomings of certain methods and adopt and combine teaching methods according to the needs of students (Kumar, 2013: 1).

On the other way around, the scientific approach contributes to teaching and learning English, especially in writing. Scientific approach is an approach used in learning with emphasis on the use of scientific methods in teaching and learning activities. This is based on the essence of learning which is actually a scientific process carried out by students and teachers / lecturers. This scientific approach is expected to make students think scientifically, logically, critically and objectively in accordance with the facts. If it is associated with its use in academic writing teaching, the scientific approach requires several steps: observing, questioning, experimenting, associating and

communicating. However, students will not work productively and effectively if the scientific approach is used to teach academic writing because there are many students in the class and because it takes a long time to help them find theory or solve other problems. Scientific approach is more suitable for developing understanding, while developing aspects of concepts, skills and emotions as a whole is not getting enough attention. Sani (2014) states that the scientific approach is generally based on the presentation of data obtained through observation or experiment. Therefore, experiment can be replaced with activities to obtain information from various sources. In carrying out these activities, assistance or guidance from the teacher or lecturer is still needed.

Based on the explanation above, the characteristics of each teaching method, the eclectic method is more effective than the scientific approach for teaching academic writing to the eighth semester students of S1 Nursing Sciences in Bangsa University in the 2018/2019 academic year.

The answers for the questions mentioned previously in this paper about:

- a. How to differentiate between eclectic method and blended learning method?
  - b. How to ensure the quality of the students' writing?
  - c. Because it is an academic writing, how did you help the students generate their ideas academically?
- could be seen and read in the explanation below:
1. The difference between eclectic method and blended learning method

are that blended learning is mix of face-to-face teaching and the online approach. Students in such a course not only have the convenience of learning and revising at their individual pace but each student has the benefit of interacting in face-to-face sessions. Blended learning combines classroom learning with online learning, in which students can, in part, control the time, pace, and place of their learning. A teacher-designed blended learning model allows teachers to determine the combination that's right for them and their students. For example, a student might attend classes in a real-world classroom setting and then supplement the lesson plan by completing online multimedia coursework. As such, the student would only have to physically attend class once a week and would be free to go at their own pace (and without worrying about scheduling issues). It has also been suggested that students who complete online coursework followed by interactive, face-to-face class activities have richer educational experiences. Blended learning, therefore, provides the best of both worlds for students and lecturers alike as participants are granted the hands-on experience of the face-to-face class as well as the convenience and flexibility of the online environment.

Meanwhile, eclectic method is a method of language education that combines various approaches and methodologies to teach language depending on the aims of the lesson and the abilities of the learners. Different teaching methods are borrowed and adapted to suit the requirement of the learners. The



eclectic method allows the language teacher to use the techniques and activities drawn from a range of language teaching approaches and methodologies. It is the teacher who decides what method or approach to use depending on the aims of the lesson and the learners in the group. Eclectic method is a language teaching method that combines various approaches and methods to teach language depending on the objectives of the course and the abilities of the learners. It is also known as mixed- methods. This method was first used in 1920s-1930s by English linguists (Henry Sweet and Harold Palmer). The eclectic approach has several advantages. It connects classroom experiences to the daily life activities of the learners. This helps learners to understand new knowledge by drawing on what they already know. Thus, learning is not strange because the activities are life-like.

2. In ensuring the quality of the students' writing, the authors check the students' writing originality by using plagiarism checker in order to find out if the students copy and paste the text from their friends and or from internet. In addition to using the plagiarism checker, the authors gave the practice tests of writing in the classroom and had the students to collect their writing before leaving the classroom. In the following meeting the authors gave feedbacks to the students' writing and let them revise their writing until eventually produced a final composition.

Another online application that can be implemented in checking the quality of writing is Grammarly. This is such a tool to improve the

students' writing by recommending some revisions such as comma splice, comma usage, missing articles, misspelled articles, misspelled words, outdated spelling, repetitive words, weak adjectives and etc. In our research, the students were requested to write their academic writing text either writing on a piece of paper or in a laptop. When utilizing the laptop, they could connect to the internet to assist them in composing the text using Grammarly.

3. In assisting the students to generate their ideas academically, the researchers applied three simple strategies like talk it out, brainstorm, and free write. Besides, the students were encouraged not to feel that they needed to work logically. The students had to work from general to specific, maintain momentum, let ideas go, choose a topic that interests you, keep a notepad close, write out ideas, research support, and write a draft. Moreover, the students were encouraged to use more academic words (vocabularies) to enrich their academic writing as well as the appropriate use of conjunctions, tenses, other grammar, coherence and cohesion.

### **Acknowledgement**

The researchers vastly feel gratitude to Harapan Bangsa University for granting us the opportunity to conduct this research. We thank our colleagues from Harapan Bangsa University for giving us support and encouragement to finish this research. Besides, the expressions of gratitude are given to Prof. Rifda for her assistance with particular technique and methodology and for comments that greatly improved this research.

## CONCLUSION

Based on the result of hypothesis testing, the finding of this research is that the eclectic method is more effective than scientific approach to teach academic writing.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Al-Jarrah, J. M., dkk. (2018). The Eclectic Approach as a Therapy for Teaching English as a Foreign Language to the Arab Students. *IJARPED*, 8 (1), 100-113
- Al-Mamun, Md, Jakir. Advocacy of the Eclectic Approach to ESL/EFL Teaching in Bangladesh. *Jagannath University Journal of Arts*.
- Ary, D., Jacobs, L. C., Sorensen, C. K., Walker, D. (2007). *Introduction to research in education*. Florida: Cengage Learning.
- Brown, D.H. (2000). *Principle of Language Learning and Teaching (fourth edition)*. New York: Longman.
- Jebiwot, K. A. (2014). *The Use of Eclectic Method in Teaching and Learning of English in Primary Schools: A Case of Selected Schools in Eldore East District, Kenya*. (Unpublished thesis). MOI University, Kenya.
- Kumar, C. P. (2013). The Eclectic Method-Theory and Its Application to the Learning of English. *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications*, 3(6). Retrieved from [http://scholar.google.com/scholar?](http://scholar.google.com/scholar?hl=en&q=The+Eclectic+Method+Theory+and+Its+Application+to+the+Learning+of+English&btnG=&as_sdt=1%2C5&as_sdt)
- Larsen-Freeman, D. (2004). *A Non Hierarchical Relationship between Grammar and Communication, Part 1*. In. J.E. Alids (ed). *George Town University Round Table on Language and Linguistics*, pp.158-165. Washington DC: George Town University Press.
- \_\_\_\_\_. (2000). *Techniques and Principles in Language Teaching*. With M. Anderson. Third Edition. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Mellow, J.D (2002) Towards Principled Eclecticism in Language Teaching: The Two Dimensional Model and Centring Principle. *Teaching English as a Second Language Journal*, 5 (4): A-1.
- Mwanza, D. S. (2016). The Eclectic Approach to language Teaching: Its Conceptionalisation and Misconceptions. *IJHSSE*, 4 (2), 53-67
- Rismiati, K. A., & Mulandari, N. (2004). Efektivitas membaca cerita fiksi terhadap peningkatan kreativitas verbal pada masa anak sekolah. *Jurnal Insight*, 01, 3-18.
- Sani, R. A. (2014). *Pembelajaran Saintifik untuk Implementasi Kurikulum 2013*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Suparman. (2017). The Effectiveness of Eclectic Method in Teaching Writing English of Recount Text for the Eight Grade

- Students of SMPN 1 Keruak. Palapa: *Jurnal Studi Keislaman dan Ilmu Pendidikan*, 5 (1): 44-60
- Ula, M. Z. (2018). The Implementation of Eclectic Method in Teaching Writing Recount Text of the Eight Graders. *RETAIN*, 6 (2), 126-134.
- Ullah, N., Tabassum, R., & Ullah, I. (2018). Effect of the Eclectic Approach of Teaching on English Communication Skills at Elementary Level. *MJLTM*, 8(6), 138-146.