Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi
Media Pengembangan Ilmu dan Praktek Administrasi
Volume 22 | Number 2 | December 2025

Vol. 22 No.2
pp 159-171 © 2025
ISSN 1829 - 8974
e-ISSN 2614-2597

E-GOVERNMENT TRANSFORMATION IN CENTRAL LOMBOK REGENCY: EVALUATION BASED ON THE CIPP MODEL

[1]Alih Aji Nugroho, [2]Agus Sudrajat, [3]Keisha Dinya Solihati, [4]Chang-Ahn Kwon

[1,2,3] *NIPA School of Administration Jakarta,* Indonesia
[4]*Daegu Metropolitan City Officer, Korea Selatan*
[1]alihnugroho@stialan.ac.id, [2]agus.euj@gmail.com, [3]keisha.dinya@gmail.com, [4]changkwon@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFORMATION

Article history :
Submit:
05-03-2025
First Revision:
05-06-2025
Accepted:
22-11-2025

Keywords *:*
e-government; evaluation; CIPP; digital transformation, central lombok regency

ABSTRACT

This study evaluates the implementation of e-government in Central Lombok Regency by examining the gap between planned objectives and actual outcomes, using the Context, Input, Process, and Product (CIPP) evaluation model introduced by Stufflebeam. While e-government is often framed as a national-level policy, this study focuses on a concrete, time-bound local initiative the 2017–2022 E-Government Development Master Plan of Central Lombok which functions as a structured implementation program suitable for programmatic evaluation. Using a qualitative case study approach, data were collected through interviews, observations, and document analysis involving key stakeholders, particularly the Central Lombok Communication and Information Office (Diskominfo). The context evaluation revealed a mismatch between the region digital goals and its limited institutional readiness, particularly in terms of infrastructure and public digital literacy. The input evaluation showed that while planning documents and budgets were prepared, gaps remained in human resources and training capacity, with only 18.75% of officials and 30.75% of staff familiar with basic ICT. The process evaluation highlighted inconsistencies between planned targets and implementation outcomes such as the low number of agencies connected to central servers and minimal public interaction with e-government platforms. Finally, the product evaluation indicated that the program's objectives were only partially met, with persistent challenges in system integration, inter-agency coordination, and citizen uptake of services. The study concludes that improving cross-agency collaboration, enhancing digital capacity through training and education, and promoting public awareness are essential for advancing e-government outcomes in the region. The use of the CIPP model in this context offers a systematic lens to diagnose programmatic shortcomings and generate actionable recommendations for future policy implementation.

A. INTRODUCTION

The era of globalization and modernization has implications for the rapid development of communication and information technology (Bartikowski et al., 2023; Kohli & Liang, 2021; Viale Pereira

et al., 2017; Zhang Luis Felipe Luna-Reyes Theresa Pardo, n.d.). Even globalization and technology support each other in almost all fields and have their own role in its development (Baygül, 2020). Along with the era of globalization and modernization, public sector organizations are required to carry out digital transformation (Yohanitas et al., 2023). The existence of digital transformation in public organizations is expected to accelerate the realization of the 2030 sustainable development agenda (Prasetyanti & Nugroho, 2019; Shcherbina & Gorbenkova, 2018; Streimikiene et al., 2021). In addition, digital transformation in public sector organizations can provide social value by offering agile and efficient services that focus on the needs of society (Lourenço Andrade & Cavalcante de Souza, 2020).

The manifestation of digital transformation in public organizations is the implementation of e-government. E-Government refers to the use of information technology by the government, especially the internet to support government administration, increase public participation and provide government services (Axelsson et al., 2010; Department of Economic and Social Affairs United Nations, 2022a; Farida et al., 2020; Kalesnikaite et al., 2022; Venkatesh et al., 2014; Zhang & Kimathi, 2022). Furthermore, e-government is considered capable of providing better services and empowering the community the community through access to information without bureaucracy (Carter & Bélanger, 2005); (Barman, 2015); (Manoharan & Ingrams, 2018). E-Government always involves balancing the seemingly enormous forces of change and continuity the domain (Nasim, 2011).

Every two years the UN releases an e-government survey. In 2022, this survey highlights the contribution of digital transformation and digital governance in accelerating the realization of the sustainable development agenda (Suryanto et al., 2022). The survey results show that digital transformation in public organizations has contributed to addressing the global health crisis and ensuring effective delivery of essential assistance to communities during periods of growing isolation, uncertainty and vulnerability (Department of Economic and Social Affairs United Nations, 2022b).

Based on UN Publications, in 2022, Indonesia is ranked 77 EGDI out of 193 countries. This position is quite a relief because it rose 10 places compared to 2020 (United Nations, 2020). But in ASEAN, Indonesia's ranking is still far from Singapore, Malaysia, Thailand, and Brunei Darussalam. Meanwhile, the first to fifth consecutive positions were won by Denmark, Finland, the republic of Korea, New Zealand, and Sweden. The e-government implementation rating is expected to increase awareness of the importance of e-government implementation, increase competence in the ICT field as well as infrastructure and regulations that support e-government. The dimensions in e-government ranking can be a reference to see an overview of the condition of e-government implementation and its influencing factors (Rahmadany, 2021).

Mensah Study shows that government capacity, positively influences e-government performance (Mensah, 2020). But the study of Pérez-Morote, Pontones-Rosa, and Núñez-Chicharro shows that citizen's use of e-government services is influenced by supply-side e-government evaluation, citizen's trust in government and the digital divide associated to income and education. This results study analysing panel data derived from 27 European Countries for the priod 2010-2018(Pérez-Morote et al., 2020). In Indonesia, performance expectancy, effort, expectancy, social influence, facilitating conditions and transparency are the critical factors for evaluating the adoption of e-Government from the perspective of citizens in Indonesia (Sabani, 2020).

Sundberg's research shows that some e-government initiatives fail to deliver promised benefits and attract citizen participation (Sundberg, 2019). In addition, the results of research conducted by Huda and Yunas show that currently sufficient funds are needed to meet various devices that support the implementation of e-governance, and in terms of human resources, there needs to be a government commitment in organizing informal education in the field of ICT (Huda & Yunas, 2016). Basically, there are several factors that influence the success of e-government implementation which are grouped into four components. First, resources component consists of: good and clear organization structure, strong leadership, available portal/application, training, international support, enough funding, highly demand of citizen, good team skills and expertise, supportive ICT infrastructure/service availability, awareness, legal framework and system security. Second, driver component which consist of supportive government policy, good partnership with other institution, good project management, good chance management, monitoring and evaluation, top management support, e-participation, good information quality, good outsourcing strategy, political support and stability and reward and recognition. Third, value component which consist of better business process, user/citizen computer/internet literacy, supportive cultural environment, trust, electronic transaction, good

governance, re-usable. Fourth, outcome component which consist of citizen relationship management, self-sustainable revenue, open government, user satisfaction and prototype (Napitupulu, 2017).

Central Lombok Regency Government is one of the local governments in Indonesia that implements e-government. The seriousness of the Lombok Regency Government in implementing e-government is manifested in the form of the E-Government Development Master Plan of Central Lombok Regency for 2017-2022. The vision of e-government Lombok Regency is "to realize a cyber & smart city that is excellent in the administration of government, public services (citizen) and purchasing power (business)". In general, through this Master Plan, the government hopes to realize an innovative and creative Central Lombok Regency through the use of information and communication technology. In particular, through this vision, the use of information and communication technology, especially the internet in governance, public services and the business world, is expected to meet the expectations of the government, public and private sector effectively, efficiently, fairly and transparently (Tengah, 2017).

The main objective of the master plan that has been prepared by the Central Lombok Regency Government is to improve the quality of public services through the use of information and communication technology in the process of organizing the Central Lombok Regency government, the establishment of a clean, transparent government that is able to respond to changes effectively, as well as to improve the organization, management system and government work processes (Tengah, 2017).

This objective is in line with the issuance of Presidential Regulation No. 95 of 2018 concerning Electronic-Based Government Systems (SPBE) in order to realize clean, executive, transparent, and accountable governance as well as quality and reliable public services and to improve the integration and efficiency of electronic-based government systems. In addition, in order to improve the quality of government administration that utilizes information and communication technology effectively, efficiently and continuously, thus it is necessary to evaluate SPBE.

The year 2022 is the last timeline in the implementation of the Master Plan that has been prepared. But unfortunately, when viewed from the results of the SPBE evaluation conducted by the Ministry of PAN-RB in the last 2 years, it shows that the results of the SPBE evaluation of the Central Lombok Regency Government have not shown satisfactory results, even in 2022 there has been a decrease in the index. In 2021 the SPBE index of the Central Lombok Regency government is 2.37 with the predicate 'Sufficient', however in 2022 the SPBE index of the Lombok Regency Government decreases to 2.08 with the predicate 'Sufficient' (Menteri PAN-RB, 2023). This decrease in the SPBE index shows that the implementation of e-government in Lombok Regency has not been optimal and this is not in line with the main objectives of the master plan that has been prepared by the Central Lombok Regency Government. Therefore, an evaluation of the E-Government Master Plan that has been implemented by the Central Lombok District Government is needed based on the objectives, planning, implementation and results.

Daniel L. Stufflebeam introduced one of the evaluation models that can be used to evaluate programs, projects, personnel, products, institutions and evaluation systems, namely the Context, Input, Process, Product (CIPP) evaluation model. (Stufflebeam, 2003) explains that the CIPP Model is oriented to administration, development, effective service, prevention of harm, accountability, dissemination, and research. Based on this model, evaluation is described as the process of describing, obtaining, providing and applying descriptive and judgmental information about the merits and value objectives, design, implementation and outcomes of multiple objects in guiding improvement decisions, providing accountability reports, informing institutionalization/dissemination decisions, and increasing understanding of the phenomena involved (Stufflebeam, 2003). Furthermore, (Stufflebeam, 2003) explains that the CIPP evaluation model is divided into three concentric circles. The inner circle represents the core values that provide the foundation for one's evaluations. The wheel surrounding the values is divided into four evaluative foci associated with any program or other endeavor: goals, plans, actions, and outcomes. The outer wheel denotes the type of evaluation that serves each of the four evaluative foci. These are context, input, process, and product evaluation". Therefore, in this study, the author wants to dig deeper regarding the expectations and realities in the implementation of e-government in Central Lombok Regency to see the gap between the plan and the results of e-government implementation based on the E-Government Development Master Plan (RIP) of Lombok Regency Government through the CIPP evaluation model introduced by Stufflebeam.

The novelty of this study lies in its integrated application of the CIPP evaluation model to assess the e-government transformation in a decentralized governance context such as Central Lombok

Regency. This research uniquely targets a regency level administration where institutional capacity, infrastructure disparity, and community readiness differ significantly from national averages. Central Lombok represents a strategic yet underexplored locale within Indonesia's e-government ecosystem. According to the SPBE (Electronic-Based Government System) evaluation results published by the Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform, Central Lombok's index declined from 2.37 in 2021 to 2.08 in 2022, indicating regression despite ongoing digital transformation efforts. This decline contradicts the expected progress outlined in the region's 2017–2022 Master Plan and reflects critical discrepancies between planned interventions and field level outcomes an issue that is insufficiently addressed in current policy and academic discourses.

Furthermore, this study contributes a granular, data-supported insight into the complex socio-technical dynamics shaping e-government in Central Lombok. With only 18.75% of government officials and 30.75% of staff reported as familiar with computer usage (and even fewer 10.75% and 20.75% respectively familiar with internet use), the study brings empirical evidence of digital literacy limitations often overlooked in higher level assessments. By positioning the regency as a case study, this paper emphasizes the role of institutional commitment, community engagement, and localized capacity building in the success or failure of digital government transformation. The novelty extends to the operationalization of the CIPP model in this setting, as it captures the misalignments between context specific goals and institutional realities, including HR shortages, low system integration, and weak inter agency coordination.

B. METHOD

This study adopts a qualitative descriptive approach using a case study design to evaluate the implementation of *e-government* in Central Lombok Regency. The research was conducted from January to August 2024 and involved three primary data sources: interviews, direct observations, and secondary documents. A total of eight key informants were selected purposively, including three officials from the Central Lombok Communication and Information Office (Diskominfo), two representatives from Regional Apparatus Organizations (SKPD) involved in IT service delivery, one staff member from the regional planning agency (Bappeda), and two IT support staff from sub district offices. The interviews explored institutional readiness, infrastructure availability, human resource competencies, inter agency coordination, and monitoring mechanisms in e-government implementation. Observations were conducted at the Diskominfo office and selected SKPDs, focusing on the use of ICT infrastructure such as internet connectivity, server equipment, and information systems in use, as well as daily operational practices related to e-government services. Secondary data were collected from various official documents including the 2017–2022 E-Government Development Master Plan (RIP) of Central Lombok, SPBE evaluation reports from 2019–2022, Diskominfo performance reports, and human resource inventories, complemented by data retrieved from government websites and public facing digital platforms. All collected data were analyzed using the Miles and Huberman interactive model, which includes four stages such as data collection, data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing. Data were first gathered and categorized according to the CIPP model (Context, Input, Process, Product), then reduced and organized into analytical summaries and tables to identify patterns. Conclusions were drawn through continuous comparison and verification, with triangulation used across interview, observational, and documentary data to ensure the credibility and consistency of the findings.

C. RESEARCH FINDING AND DISCUSSION

To guide the analysis, this study uses the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) evaluation model developed by Stufflebeam (2003), which is widely used for evaluating structured programs. In this study, the CIPP model is applied to evaluate the 2017–2022 E-Government Development Master Plan of Central Lombok Regency as a structured, multi phase implementation program. The model was adapted to suit the e-government setting by mapping each component of CIPP to the relevant stages, resources, and outcomes of the master plan. The framework below outlines how each component was defined and evaluated in this research.

Table 1. Conceptual Framework

CIPP Component	Definition in This Study	Data Sources
Context	Assessment of needs, problems, and opportunities that shaped the design of the e-government master plan	RIP 2017–2022, planning documents, interviews with planners
Input	Evaluation of the resources, human capital, budget, and planning used to implement e-government initiatives	HR data, budget documents, training plans, interview transcripts
Process	Assessment of implementation activities, project delivery, and operational procedures over the five-year plan	Performance reports (2019–2022), monitoring data, observations
Product	Evaluation of the outcomes, both expected and unintended, resulting from e-government implementation	SPBE index results, service usage data, citizen engagement stats

Based on the results of research and analysis through the Context, Input, Process, Product (CIPP) evaluation model, the expectations and realities in the implementation of e-government in Central Lombok Regency are as follows the first is **context.** In this study, the evaluation of the context in the implementation of e-government through E-Government Development Master Plan of Central Lombok district in 2017-2022 is seen by assessing the needs, problems and opportunities in the implementation of e-government in the Central Lombok Regency Government. So it is expected to help researchers to determine and assess the goals and needs of e-government. This is in accordance with what (Stufflebeam, 2003), that "Context evaluations assess needs, problems, and opportunities within a defined environment they aid evaluation users to define and assess goals and later reference assessed needs of targeted beneficiaries". The results showed that, based on the Central Lombok Regency E-Government Development Master Plan 2017-2022, the implementation of e-government has been carried out since 2010 and this is the initial stage of e-government in Central Lombok Regency. This was supported by the fact that there has been a development of information technology network infrastructure and the use of information system software and websites. The purpose of the e-government RIP is expected to improve the quality of public services through the use of ICT in the process of organizing the Central Lombok Regency government, to establish a clean, transparent government that is able to respond effectively to the demands of change and improvement of organizations, management systems and government work processes.

But unfortunately, there are several problems faced and identified at the beginning of the preparation of the e-government RIP for Central Lombok Regency. First, regarding human resources, at the beginning of the preparation of the e-government RIP, the percentage of mastery and use of information technology was still low. In addition, the frequency of HR technical guidance on information technology is also still low and unsustainable. Second, related to hardware, hard ware maintenance is less desirable, most agencies do not have a person in charge for service and maintenance, even hardware being used for leaders is not adequate. Third, regarding application software, some software development is still partially unintegrated and integrated. In addition, there is no priority order in application development, there is no single sign on system and existing program packages are still not legal/pirated. Fourth, network architecture, namely the lack of optimal use of networks and mastery of computers and the internet, both for leaders and staff are still low. Fifth, data/information, namely there is no integrated database, there are no standard procedures in handling data, the organization of data and completeness of data is still not good (still facing difficulty in finding necessary information), and it takes a long time to get an up-to-date online information. Sixth,

organization, management systems and work processes, namely the uneven availability of good quality equipment between fields, human resources and the unintegrated provision of funds for e-government. Seventh, community services, namely the Central Lombok Regency government website have not been optimally socialized, the length of response to incoming criticism and suggestions and ICT utilization at the village/kelurahan and sub-district levels is still low. Eighth, there is still a lack of guidelines for the implementation of e-government at the district government level.

Central Lombok District has opportunities in the implementation of e-government. First, related to human resources, the government has many resources and access to resource persons for the learning process in the ICT field and those who have competent experts with the development of e-government. Second, hardware, nowadays the price of hardware is relatively become cheaper so that it is easy to upgrade, it has become more sophisticated and complete, computers have also been considered a common need and are easily available in the market. Third, application software that is increasingly more user friendly, sophisticated, complete, with many choices and available through open source systems. Fourth, internet network architecture, namely the development of network applications, which has been easier and faster, there is also a centralized and distributed database that are very easy to implement. Fifth, data/information which related to the advancement of sophisticated and useful ICT, now there are many data processing service providers, and there is an integrated distributed or centralized database system. Sixth, organization, management systems and work processes, which refers to many experts who are persistent in developing e-government, many best practices that can be used as references, regional autonomy. Seventh, public services, namely e-government, can improve integrated service information. Eighth, regional autonomy regulations which allow the creation of regulations for the implementation of e-government at the district government level.

The second things to evaluate the e-government transformation process is **input.** In this study, input evaluation was carried out by reviewing procedural, staffing and budgeting plans to achieve the objectives of RIP e-government. The results showed that the e-government implementation plan was realized through the Central Lombok Regency E-Government RIP for 2017-2022. Based on the RIP document, it can be seen that the stages of e-government implementation have been systematically arranged based on the problems faced in Central Lombok Regency. The first stage is human resource development. The target for this first stage is that each agency has their own personnel for computer system, in order to be able to strengthens the competence of e-government and to manage all technological resources themselves. This stage focuses on the formation of ICT technical teams in order to improve the ability of human resources in the field of ICT (computer executant). At this stage the ICT technical team will transfer expertise and manage human resources in each section. Expertise transfer is carried out through training on agency website management, computer network management, database management and information technology maintenance. In addition, computer executants are also given insight into computer security systems, the application of SIN and the rules of functional positions for computer executants. Based on the plan, in 2017 there will be socialization of the master plan for the development of e-government, training on agency site management and training on network management. In 2018 there will be training on database management, training on agency site management, training on network management and socialization of functional positions of computer institutions. It is hoped that in 2018 each agency will have specific human resources capable of managing ICT in their respective agencies. In 2019, training will be carried out on information technology maintenance, database management and system security. In 2020 there will be training in information technology maintenance, database management and executive information systems. In 2021, information technology maintenance training, system security training and executive information system training will be carried out. The actions taken are organizing e-government services, preparing system for computer functional position, as well as training related to agency websites, networks, database management, information technology maintenance and system security. The benchmark for this stage is the formation of e-government services and their duties and responsibilities, the rules formulation for formation of computer functional position, a well-managed technological resource, and an increase in the ability of human resources in the ICT sector and improvement for the work of government apparatus.

The second stage is the development of application infrastructure. This stage begins with the identification of applications in each agency to find out the needs of data, networks and other related applications. Based on the planning in 2017, the activities carried out include mapping data, network and application needs related to data and application integration, identifying business processes that

exist in all agencies, sub-districts, villages and agencies related to data and applications, developing and improving agency sites and GIS development. In 2018, government administration in a form of SOPs will be determined to support the implementation of e-government.

In 2019, a data center will be prepared along with metadata that can be accessed by all parties who will develop the system, Integrated Database Creation, E-Government Application Web Service Development, Online Application Development and Data Warehouse Application Development. In 2020 there will be online application development, testing and utilization of system security and reliability as well as the construction of executive dashboard applications. In 2021, the target is to build an executive dashboard application. In 2022, it is expected that an IT center will be formed and various online application services will be used, including online regional elections. The target of this stage is the establishment of an electronic document management system in each agency and the establishment of communication and coordination between agencies through computer networks. The actions that will be taken are the creation of an electronic document management system, cultivate the use of email and VOIP as well as conduct training on electronic document management and the use of email and VOIP. The benchmarks for this stage are the establishment of an electronic document management system, increased coordination between agencies, increased human resource capabilities in the ICT field and improved performance of government apparatus.

The third stage is the development of data and information infrastructure which is realized by the construction of a data warehouse in 2022. This data warehouse can be used as a source of analysis, planning, and development evaluation. Based on the planning in 2017, identification on the type and quantity of support system needs were conducted, including: information infrastructure support system, application infrastructure, network infrastructure, HR support system, resource planning, and funding planning for the procurement of support systems and sustainability of funding procurement. In 2018 there will be preparation for the construction of a data warehouse, Procurement of support system 1. Information infrastructure, such as: means and methods of information backup, digital document archive systems; 2. Application infrastructure, such as: determining standards for outsourcing network infrastructure, for example purchasing backup facilities for power sources (generators). In 2019 will be carried out Support System Maintenance, Data warehouse construction. In 2020, the construction of a data warehouse was carried out, while in 2021 the utilization of data warehouses was carried out. The target of this stage is the creation of an integrated media for public complaint. Actions that can be taken are the development of web and android-based community complaint applications in each agency, socialization of online complaint systems and training on the use of online applications, and an integrated community complaint service. The benchmark for this stage is the formation of a web-based public complaint application that is integrated with SMS, increased coordination between agencies, creation of government transparency, Improved public service management and improved performance of government apparatus.

The fourth stage expected to be realized in 2022 is the development of computer network infrastructure and its security systems in all agencies. An increase in the number of computers connected to the network must be balanced with an increase in bandwidth. Therefore, every year additional access is carried out for the community and built in the most lacking community, namely Banjar-banjar. Based on the planning in 2017 will be carried out network infrastructure penetration (schools, public health center, tele centers), increased internet bandwidth, installation of security system and addition of access terminals for the public. In 2018 a Network Operation Center (NOC) was built which has a high level of security, the addition of access terms for the community and the security of the regional head elections (Pilkada) network infrastructure. In 2019 will be carried out workstation and server upgrades, bandwidth increases, security system strengthening, adding access terminals for the community and network support facilities. In 2020 there will be adjustments to technology, additional access terminals for the community. In 2021 there will be server updates, increased bandwidth, improved security systems and added terminals for public access. The target of this stage is to empower the community with easy access to information, improve people's ability to access information using computers and improve the community's economy through the use of ICT (Adam & Dzang Alhassan, 2020; Guma & Monstadt, 2021; Yeh, 2017). The hope is that the public will get the results of the vote count quickly and accurately, boost efficiency and good order in administrative and service activities, and increase public participation in regional elections. The action taken to achieve this target is the determination of the location information of Banjar-banjar, procurement of hardware and software, computer and internet training, analysis of information system needs, development of

information systems, and socialization. The benchmark for this stage is the formation of an online regional election application system, increased speed of information on the results of the vote count, shifting paper base to digital work patterns and increasing services to the community.

The fifth stage is policy development which is realized through the creation of various policies in terms of functional positions of computer executants and long-term masterplan. Based on the plan, in 2017 the e-government master plan will be ratified and socialized. In 2018 and 2019, rules for the functional position of computer executants will be prepared. In 2020, preparations will be made for the preparation of a 15- or 20-year long-term master plan. In 2021 there will be a long-term masterplan compilation and verification. The target of this stage is that leaders get information quickly and accurately, can monitor the progress of work programs and get the information necessary for decision making. The actions that will be carried out are analysis of information system needs, information system development, hardware and software procurement, regional election application training and socialization. The benchmarks in this stage are the formation of executive dashboard systems and applications, the speed and accuracy of the information generated and the speed of decision making.

Related to human resources, At the beginning of the preparation of the RIP e-government, the readiness of units and human resources showed that there were 4 agencies that had human resources in the IT field with education levels of diploma (D-III) to master degree (S2). In addition, the proportion of Central Lombok Regency government officials who are familiar with using computers is 18.75% and the internet is 10.75%. While the proportion of staff who are familiar with computers is 30.75% and internet 20.75% (see table 2).

Table 2. Proportion of Government Officials who familiar with computers

Category	Familiar with Computers (%)	Familiar with Internet (%)
Government Officials	18.75%	10.75%
Staff	30.75%	20.75%

Source: Central Lombok Regency E-Government Development Master Plan 2017-2022

This shows that in general the human resources owned by Central Lombok Regency are still lacking to support the implementation of e-government. Therefore, a blue print of e-government human resources was made for Central Lombok Regency government institutions. The purpose of making this blue print is as a guide in planning human resource development that manages e-government, as a guideline regarding the size or benchmark of knowledge and skills possessed by human resources who manage e-government and guidelines in managing the functional positions of computer executants. Meanwhile, in terms of budgeting based on E-Government RIP for Central Lombok Regency, budgeting is focused on the cost of building ICT networks for agencies in Central Lombok Regency starting from the procurement of servers, tower construction, and installation and network settings for offices/agencies. The total budget required is Rp. 217.808.650.

The next evaluation is about process the e-government transformation in Central Lombok Regency. Process evaluation in (Stufflebeam, 2003) is monitoring, documenting, and assessing activities. Process evaluation helps make improvement efforts and maintains accountability records for the implementation of action plans. The results showed that in monitoring the implementation of RIP, one of them was carried out through making accountability reports on the performance of government agencies. In 2019, 2020, and 2021, the results showed that based on the accountability report on the performance of government agencies, especially for result of Diskominfo Central Lombok Regency in 2019, it was as follows: a. The target number of SKPD served by internet connection is 41 SKPD, but only 6 SKPD have been realized; b. The target of fulfilling the number of SKPD connected to the Diskominfo server is 46 packages and the realized is 46 packages; c. The target number of website visitors is 350,000 but the realization is as much as 153,580; d. the target of fulfilling IT facilities and infrastructure is 1 package with the realization of 1 package and e. The availability of human resources who master the ICT field is 36 people and the realization is as many as 10 people.

Table 3. Comparation ICT's Target and Realization

No	Target Description	2019		2020		2021	
		Target	Realized	Target	Realized	Target	Realized
1	SKPD served by internet connection	41 SKPD	6 SKPD	39 SKPD	12 SKPD	44 SKPD	12 SKPD

2	SKPD connected to Diskominfo server	46 packages	46 packages	46 packages	32 packages	44 packages	27 packages
3	Website visitors	350,000	153,580	190,000	11,064	150,000	134,617
4	IT facilities and infrastructure fulfillment	1 package	1 package	1 package	1 package	1 package	1 package
5	Human resources mastering ICT	36 people	10 people	2 people	2 people	15 people	15 people

Source: Accountability Report on the Performance of Government Agencies (LKjIP) of Diskominfo Central Lombok

In 2020 it is as follows: a. The target number of SKPD served by internet connection is 39 SKPD, but only 12 SKPD have been realized; b. The target of fulfilling the number of SKPD connected to the Diskominfo server is 46 packages but the realized is 32 packages; c. The target number of website visitors is 190,000 but the realization is as many as 11,064; d. the target of fulfilling IT facilities and infrastructure is 1 package with the realization of 1 package and e. the availability of human resources who master the ICT field is 2 people and the realization is 2 people. In 2021 it is as follows: a. The target number of SKPD served by internet connection is 44 SKPD, but only 12 SKPD or 25% are realized; b. the target of fulfilling the number of SKPD connected to the Diskominfo server is 44 packages but the realized is 27 packages or 61.7%; c. The target number of website visitors is 150,000 but the realization is as many as 134,617 or 89.74%; d. the target of fulfilling IT facilities and infrastructure is 1 package with the realization of 1 package and e. the availability of human resources who master the ICT field is 15 people and the realization is as many as 15 people. This shows that when viewed from the evaluation of the process within three years there are performance indicators that are not achieved in every year. This shows that through the evaluation of this process it can be seen that the Lombok Regency government has been trying to improve the achievement of performance indicators every year, however some can be achieved and some cannot be achieved.

The last is about **product.** Product evaluation in (Stufflebeam, 2003) is identifying and assessing short-term, long-term, expected and unexpected results. Through this model, the reality of the expectations to be achieved will be known and the successes in achieving these expectations can be seen. It can also identify desirable and unintended impacts and can provide recommendations on whether a plan is appropriate to continue, or needs to be stopped or improved. First, the results showed that the availability of infrastructure was inadequate: In 2021, Diskominfo Central Lombok targets the number of SKPD served by internet connection to be 44 SKPD, but only 12 SKPD or 25% of the target are realized. The reason for not achieving this target is that some SKPD and sub-districts already have their own internet network. In addition, in the same year, Diskominfo Central Lombok targeted 44 SKPD connected to the Diskominfo server, but only 27 SKPD or 61.37% of the target were realized.

Second, related to human resources. Human resource development is the first stage in the E-Government RIP of Central Lombok Regency year 2017-2022. The target of this first phase is that each agency has computer system personnel, strengthens the competence of e-government services and all technological resources can be managed by themselves. This stage focuses on the formation of ICT technical teams in order to improve the ability of human resources in the field of ICT (computer executants). The Central Lombok Regency Government also has an e-government human resource blue print for Central Lombok Regency government institutions. The purpose of making this blue print is as a guide in planning human resource development that manages e-government, as a guideline regarding the size or benchmark of knowledge and skills possessed by human resources who manage e-government and guidelines in managing the functional positions of computer executants. But unfortunately, The results showed that the availability of IT human resources was inadequate. BBased on the 2021 Central Lombok Regency HR inventory data in each SKPD, not all SKPD have employees who have ICT education/skills/expertise backgrounds. Among 45 SKPD, only 15 SKPD have human resources with ICT backgrounds.

Third, related to coordination between government agencies in the development of e-government supporting infrastructure. Based on the RIP, infrastructure development is included in phases two, three, and four. The second stage is the development of application infrastructure. This stage begins with the identification of applications in each agency to find out the needs of data, networks and other related applications. The target of this stage is the establishment of an electronic document management

system in each agency and the establishment of communication and coordination between agencies through computer networks. The third stage is the development of data and information infrastructure which is realized by the construction of a data warehouse in 2022. The target of this stage is to create an integrated community complaint media. The fourth stage is the development of computer network infrastructure and its security systems in all agencies and is expected to be realized in 2022. But unfortunately, the results of the study show that there is a lack of coordination between government agencies in building networks, especially the internet. This is shown by the lack of coordination between SKPD and sub-districts with *Diskominfo* in building internet networks, so that the target set by Diskominfo was not achieved. In addition, the results of the study also show that people are less aware of the importance of e-government. This is shown by the large number of people who do not take advantage of available e-government services. This is shown by failing achievement of the targeted number of website visitors of 150,000 people. Where the realization is only 134,617 people or 89.74% who visit the website.

The evaluation of this product shows that E-government RIP is the government's expectation to be achieved in implementing e-government. However, in reality, in every stage of e-government development carried out, there are still targets that are not achieved. ranging from the availability of inadequate infrastructure, the availability of inadequate IT human resources, lack of coordination between government agencies which made the target in building infrastructure, especially networks, has not been achieved and there is also still low public awareness of the importance of e-government (Ciesielska et al., 2022; Pina et al., 2010). This product evaluation sees thoroughly that there are still many hopes in the implementation of e-government in Central Lombok Regency that have not been achieved in reality. Even based on the results of the *SPBE* evaluation in 2022, Central Lombok Regency received a sufficient predicate with a value of 2.08.

D. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

The evaluation of e-government implementation in Central Lombok Regency using the CIPP model reveals a gap between the strategic objectives outlined in the 2017–2022 E-Government Development Master Plan and the actual outcomes in the field. From the context perspective, institutional readiness remains limited, particularly in terms of ICT infrastructure and public digital literacy. The input evaluation indicates inadequate human resource capacity and insufficient budgetary support for technology development and technical training. In the process dimension, program implementation was inconsistent with the planned stages, as reflected in the low achievement of key indicators such as SKPD connectivity and citizen engagement with digital services. Meanwhile, the product evaluation shows that the outcomes have not fully met the intended targets and have had limited impact on improving the overall quality of public services. Therefore, there is a need to strengthen inter-agency coordination, enhance digital competencies among civil servants through continuous training, and intensify public outreach efforts to raise awareness and encourage the use of e-government services, both through direct engagement and via the official digital platforms managed by local government institutions.

REFERENCE

Adam, I. O., & Dzang Alhassan, M. (2020). Bridging the global digital divide through digital inclusion: the role of ICT access and ICT use. *Transforming Government: People, Process and Policy*, *15*(4), 580–596. https://doi.org/10.1108/TG-06-2020-0114

Axelsson, K., Melin, U., & Lindgren, I. (2010). Exploring the importance of citizen participation and involvement in e-government projects: Practice, incentives, and organization. *Transforming Government: People, Process and Policy*, *4*(4), 299–321. https://doi.org/10.1108/17506161011081309

Barman, R. (2015). E-Government and E-Governance: A Conceptual Framework. *International Journal of Social Science and Interdisciplinary Research*.

Bartikowski, B., Laroche, M., & Kizgin, H. (2023). Introduction to the Special Issue: Information Communication Technology (ICT): People, culture, and globalization. *International Journal of*

Information Management, *70*, 102591. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijinfomgt.2022.102591

Baygül, S. (2020). Küreselleşme ve Teknoloji Üzerine Bir Değerlendirme. *International Journal of Humanities and Education*, *6*(13), 395–411.

Carter, L., & Bélanger, F. (2005). The utilization of e-government services: Citizen trust, innovation and acceptance factors. *Information Systems Journal*, *15*(1), 5–25. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2575.2005.00183.x

Ciesielska, M., Rizun, N., & Chabik, J. (2022). Assessment of E-government inclusion policies toward seniors: A framework and case study. *Telecommunications Policy*, *46*(7). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.telpol.2022.102316

Department of Economic and Social Affairs United Nations. (2022a). *E-Government Survey 2022, The Future of Digital Government*.

Department of Economic and Social Affairs United Nations. (2022b). *E-Government Survey 2022, The Future of Digital Government*.

Farida, I., Setiawan, R., Maryatmi, A. S., & Juwita, N. (2020). The Implementation of E-Government in the Industrial Revolution Era 4.0 in Indonesia. *International Journal of Progressive Sciences and Technologies (IJPSAT)*, *22*(2), 340–346.

Guma, P. K., & Monstadt, J. (2021). Smart city making? The spread of ICT-driven plans and infrastructures in Nairobi. *Urban Geography*. https://doi.org/10.1080/02723638.2020.1715050

Huda, M., & Yunas, N. S. (2016). The Development of E-Goverment In Indonesia. *Jurnal Bina Praja*, *8*(735), 97–108.

Kalesnikaite, V., Neshkova, M. I., & Ganapati, S. (2022). Parsing the impact of E-government on bureaucratic corruption. *Governance*. https://doi.org/10.1111/GOVE.12707

Kohli, R., & Liang, T. P. (2021). Special Section: Strategic Integration of Blockchain Technology into Organizations. *Journal of Management Information Systems*, *38*(2), 282–287. https://doi.org/10.1080/07421222.2021.1912910

Lourenço Andrade, C. W., & Cavalcante de Souza, R. A. (2020). Transformação Digital No Governo. *Anais Do X Congresso Internacional de Conhecimento e Inovação (CiKi)*, *1*(Dc). https://doi.org/10.48090/ciki.v1i1.863

Manoharan, A. P., & Ingrams, A. (2018). Conceptualizing e-government from local government perspectives. *State and Local Government …*. https://doi.org/10.1177/0160323X18763964

Mensah, I. K. (2020). Impact of Government Capacity and E-Government Performance on the Adoption of E-Government Services. *International Journal of Public Administration*, *43*(4), 303–311. https://doi.org/10.1080/01900692.2019.1628059

Menteri PAN-RB. (2023). *PERMEN PAN-RB No 108 2023 HASIL PEMANTAUAN DAN EVALUASI SISTEM PEMERINTAHAN BERBASIS ELEKTRONIK PADA INSTANSI PUSAT DAN PEMERINTAH DAERAH TAHUN 2022*. 1–23.

Miles, Matthew B dan Huberman, A. M. (1994). Qualitative Data Analysis. In *CEUR Workshop Proceedings*.

Napitupulu, D. (2017). Empirical Study of Critical Success Factors for E-Government Implementation in Indonesia Based on Factor Analysis Approach. *Jurnal Bina Praja*, *9*(1), 83–99. https://doi.org/10.21787/jbp.09.2017.83-99

Nasim, S. (2011). Total interpretive structural modeling of continuity and change forces in e-Government. *Journal of Enterprise Transformation*, *1*(2), 147–168. https://doi.org/10.1080/19488289.2011.579229

Pérez-Morote, R., Pontones-Rosa, C., & Núñez-Chicharro, M. (2020). The effects of e-government evaluation, trust and the digital divide in the levels of e-government use in European countries. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, *154*(January), 119973. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2020.119973

Pina, V., Torres, L., & Royo, S. (2010). Is e-government promoting convergence towards more accountable local governments? *International Public Management Journal*, *13*(4), 350–380. https://doi.org/10.1080/10967494.2010.524834

Prasetyanti, R., & Nugroho, A. A. (2019). Governance Network in Sustainable Tourism Development: A case of thematic kampung tourism in Malang, Indonesia. *Proceedings of the Annual International Conference of Business and Public Administration (AICoBPA 2018)*. https://doi.org/10.2991/aicobpa-18.2019.42

Rahmadany, A. F. (2021). Literature Study of Electronic Government Implementation in the Perspective of Indonesia's Electronic Government Ranking Dimensions. *Jurnal Bina Praja*, *13*(2), 281–292. https://doi.org/10.21787/jbp.13.2021.281-292

Sabani, A. (2020). Investigating the influence of transparency on the adoption of e-Government in Indonesia. *Journal of Science and Technology Policy Management*, *12*(2), 236–255. https://doi.org/10.1108/JSTPM-03-2020-0046

Shcherbina, E., & Gorbenkova, E. (2018). Smart city technologies for sustainable rural development. *IOP Conference Series: Materials …*. https://doi.org/10.1088/1757-899X/365/2/022039

Streimikiene, D., Svagzdiene, B., Jasinskas, E., & Simanavicius, A. (2021). Sustainable tourism development and competitiveness: The systematic literature review. *Sustainable Development*, *29*(1), 259–271. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1002/sd.2133

Stufflebeam, D. L. (2003). The CIPP Model for Evaluation. *International Handbook of Educational Evaluation*, 31–62. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-010-0309-4_4

Sundberg, L. (2019). Electronic government: Towards e-democracy or democracy at risk? *Safety Science*, *118*(September 2018), 22–32. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssci.2019.04.030

Suryanto, A., Fitriati, R., Natalia, S. I., Oktariani, A., Munawaroh, M., Nurdin, N., & AHN, Y. hoon. (2022). Study of working from home: the impact of ICT anxiety and smartphone addiction on lecturers at NIPA School of Administration on job performance. *Heliyon*, *8*(12), e11980. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2022.e11980

Tengah, D. K. dan I. K. L. (2017). *Rencana Induk Pengembangan E-Government Kabupaten Lombok Tengah Tahun 2017-2022*.

United Nations. (2020). E-Government Survey 2020 - Digital Government in the Decade of Action for Sustainable Development: With addendum on COVID-19 Response. In *United Nations E-Government Surveys* (Vol. 1, Issue 1).

Venkatesh, V., Sykes, T. A., & Venkatraman, S. (2014). Understanding e-Government portal use in rural India: Role of demographic and personality characteristics. *Information Systems Journal*. https://doi.org/10.1111/isj.12008

Viale Pereira, G., Cunha, M. A., Lampoltshammer, T. J., Parycek, P., & Testa, M. G. (2017). Increasing collaboration and participation in smart city governance: a cross-case analysis of smart city

initiatives. *Information Technology for Development*, *23*(3), 526–553. https://doi.org/10.1080/02681102.2017.1353946

Yeh, H. (2017). The effects of successful ICT-based smart city services: From citizens' perspectives. *Government Information Quarterly*. https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0740624X16300521

Yohanitas, W. A., Ramadhan, A., Pribadi, M. A., Fahrani, N. S., Syah, R. F., Andreani, S., Sudardi, Aji Nugroho, A., Fitri Azmi, I., Nurjannah, A., Nuryono, R., Supratikta, H., Saputro, T. H., Sipahutar, H., Suripto, & Marsono. (2023). The Development of Innovation Knowledge Management System in Tangerang Regency. *Lex Localis*, *21*(3), 637–664. https://doi.org/10.4335/21.3.637-664(2023)

Zhang Luis Felipe Luna-Reyes Theresa Pardo, J. A. (n.d.). *Public Administration and Information Technology 20 Information, Models, and Sustainability Policy Informatics in the Age of Big Data and Open Government*.

Zhang, Y., & Kimathi, F. A. (2022). Exploring the stages of E-government development from public value perspective. *Technology in Society*, *69*, 101942. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.TECHSOC.2022.101942