



IMPROVING STUDENTS' TOLERANCE THROUGH THE VCT LEARNING MODEL: A QUASI-EXPERIMENTAL STUDY

Wasis Suprpto¹, Abdul Ghofur², Delfia Ikhlasiah Rahman³, Ulfah Churiwiyah⁴, Dodik Kariadi⁵

State University of Surabaya, Surabaya, Indonesia^{1,2,3}, Pesantren Tebuireng, Mataram,
Indonesia⁴, Universitas Pendidikan Mandalika, Mataram, Indonesia⁵
wasissuprpto@unesa.ac.id¹, abdulghofur@unesa.ac.id², delfiarahman@unesa.ac.id³,
ulfah.churiwiyah99@gmail.com⁴, kariadidodik@gmail.com⁵

Keywords :

multicultural country, tolerance
knowledge, VCT model, quasi-
experimental study

ABSTRACT

Indonesia is a multicultural country. In a multicultural society, tolerance is a crucial aspect of fostering harmony and peace, so students must have a strong understanding of its values. However, the data indicate that intolerant behavior among the public remains significantly high. Inter-ethnic, racial, and tribal conflicts continue to be prevalent, according to the data. Therefore, the best way to overcome this obstacle is by organizing learning that can stimulate students to understand the values of tolerance. This is because students are the next generation, the spearhead in fostering tolerance in a multicultural nation. Consequently, this research aims to apply the VCT (Value Clarification Technique) model to assess its impact on students' knowledge achievement related to tolerance values. This study involved 37 students from one elementary school in Singkawang City, Kalimantan, comprising 20 students in class A (experimental group) and 17 in class B (control group), using a quasi-experimental research design. Data analysis was performed using the independent samples t-test. The research results indicate that the Sig. (2-tailed) value exceeds 0.05, so it can be understood that the VCT model influences students' acquisition of knowledge about tolerance values.

INTRODUCTION

To this day, conflict remains an issue that continues to capture attention, requires serious handling, and has not been fully resolved (Barth, 2021; Friend & Malhotra, 2019). On various occasions, conflict has always been difficult to avoid. This issue is inseparable from the highly diverse demographic context of Indonesia. The diversity that exists throughout the country indeed has a high potential to cause social conflict in society. Demographically, it is evident that the society is highly diverse in terms of race, ethnicity, religion, language, and culture (Anis et al., 2024; Sanjaya, 2022).

Since the reform, there have been 2,398 cases of violence and discrimination in Indonesia, 65% of which were due to religious background (Helmon & Rahardi, 2020; Umiarso & Asnawan, 2022), and the rest were related to ethnic, gender, and sexual violence (Bilven et al., 2022; Cole et al., 2024). Not only that, but in subsequent developments, the conflict also entered the realm of education. It is recorded that at least 251 children aged 6-12 years were victims of violence in schools in 2023 (Wismayanti et al., 2021). The findings have illustrated how acute the conflict is in the realm of education. Violence in the educational sphere can occur between students, between students and teachers, between teachers, and even between teachers and students' parents. This indicates that anyone has the potential to be both the perpetrator and the victim of conflictual actions occurring in schools.

Violence in education not only causes physical and emotional problems for students but also negatively impacts their character, mental health, and academic performance (Duru & Balkis, 2018; Khan et al., 2025; Strøm et al., 2013). As a result, education providers must be dedicated to fostering a child-friendly, safe, and tolerant learning environment. This is done to make the educational environment safer and more conducive to quality learning. Based on this, all education stakeholders must make violence prevention and management a top priority.

The violence present in the educational environment must be addressed immediately. One way is by increasing students' understanding of tolerance values (Jatiningsih et al., 2024; Suryaningrat et al., 2020). Meanwhile, in learning activities, the Value Clarification Technique (VCT) model is a learning model that can be used to increase students' knowledge about tolerance values (Lisievic & Andronie, 2016; Pramana et al., 2023). The explanation is that this learning model can guide students in gaining an understanding of multiculturalism, strengthening character, and increasing students' understanding of tolerance values (Anwar et al., 2023; Hatmono & Sutimin, 2025).

In learning practice, VCT should be directed toward cultivating the value of tolerance within students. Our goal is to cultivate this value, which can foster mutual respect for differences by instilling relevant values, enabling students to act in accordance with existing norms (Sakti et al., 2024; Sitanggung, 2025). Through VCT learning, students not only master cognitive but also affective aspects, so they can train their social and emotional intelligence. This mastery is critical considering the diverse social conditions both in schools and in society. This is critical considering the diverse social conditions both in schools and in society. History reveals that the emergence of horizontal conflict in Indonesia has actually used diversity as a justification. Cases of violence, such as in Sambas between the Madurese and Malay tribes (Azeharie et al., 2023); in Lampung between the Lampung and Balinese tribes (Eko & Putranto, 2021); and in Sampit between the Madurese and Dayak tribes (Susanto & Puryanto, 2022), are real evidence of the importance of instilling the value of tolerance in students.

Tolerance should be a fundamental value that must be instilled in schools. The diversity that exists in Indonesia should be a valuable asset so that all its people can live in harmony and tolerance amidst differences. This idea is in accordance with the mandate of the third principle of Pancasila, which emphasizes the unity of Indonesia. Furthermore, the Youth Pledge event demonstrated the spirit of tolerance long before Indonesia's independence. Referring to these various factors, it is clear that the spirit of tolerance must remain on Indonesian soil. These efforts can be implemented starting at the elementary school level, prioritizing the VCT model.

METHOD

This study involved 37 students from one elementary school in Singkawang, Kalimantan, consisting of 20 students in class A as the experimental group and 17 students in class B as the control group. In this case, the research sample was randomly selected from one of the elementary schools in Singkawang City, West Kalimantan, Indonesia. The research design used is quasi-experimental. The data collection instrument is a knowledge test related to understanding the values of tolerance. The learning outcomes obtained were then analyzed using the independent samples t-test. This test requires the prerequisites

of normality and homogeneity. If the data is not normally distributed, then non-parametric statistical analysis using the Mann-Whitney U test is used. All statistical tests were performed using the SPSS 27.0 program, and the results of the analysis obtained were then described.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

The data obtained in this study were statistically tested to determine the effect of the VCT model on students' acquisition of knowledge about tolerance values. However, before conducting the statistical test, normality and homogeneity tests were first performed as prerequisites for parametric statistics. The results of the normality test are shown in Table 1, while the results of the homogeneity test are shown in Table 2.

Table 1. Normality Test Results

Class	Shapiro-Wilk Test			Description
	Data	Statistik	Sig.	
Experimental class	<i>Pre-test & Post-test</i>	0.934	0.184	Normally distributed
Control class	<i>Pre-test & Post-test</i>	0.930	0.222	Normally distributed

Table 2. Homogeneity Test Results

Class	Shapiro-Wilk Test		Description
	Data	Sig.	
Experimental and control groups	Pre-test & Post-test	0.133	Homogen

Based on the statistical test results shown in Tables 1 and 2, it can be seen that the data obtained have met the prerequisites for performing an independent samples t-test. Table 3 displays the results of this test.

Table 3. Independent Sample t-test Results

		F	Sig	T	Df	Sig.(2-tailed)
Tolerance Score Results	Equal variances assumed	2.370	0.133	2.123	35	0.041
	Equal variances not assumed			2.069	28.785	0.048

Table 3 shows that the Sig. (2-tailed) value exceeds 0.05, so it can be concluded that H_0 is rejected and H_a is accepted. The results of the analysis indicate that the VCT model influences students' tolerance values. These findings suggest that the VCT model has a positive impact on students' social tolerance values. This effect is because the VCT model contributes to boosting students' learning enthusiasm in the classroom. Additionally, VCT also contributes to increasing tolerance, peace-loving, and anti-discriminatory values among students. These values are important for students to possess, especially considering the diverse social conditions of Singkawang City's demographics (Chen, 2022). This diversity is evident in the race, religion, ethnicity, language, and culture inherent in the students.

The research results above further confirm that the VCT model contributes to increasing tolerance values in students. This aligns with previous research stating that the VCT model has been proven effective in increasing tolerance values within students (Bhernama, 2021; Ulpa & Mislana, 2025). The improvement can be reviewed through various aspects, including the content of the lesson material, the scores from tolerance attitude assessments, and mastery of material competencies. Not only that, VCT can also be applied in Pancasila Education learning and has been proven effective in increasing students' tolerance values (Pramana et al., 2023). Referring to this research, it is evident that the VCT model has been proven to play an active role in increasing tolerance values in students.

One of the important values to emphasize when using the VCT model is tolerance. The model, discovered by Louis Rathes in the 1950s, was designed from the outset to help students determine values in depth (Suryani, 2010). In this context, students are trained to identify, select, analyze, decide, and take a stand on their desired values (Zakiyah & Rusdiana, 2014). As a nation, the value of tolerance is certainly considered important. History has recorded the extraordinary effects of the value of tolerance because it can unite the Indonesian people from various backgrounds, including religion, ethnicity, language, and so on. That great event is called the Youth Pledge, which was born on October 28, 1928.

The spirit of the Youth Pledge must certainly be maintained and preserved forever. This is very reasonable because Indonesia is home to a wide variety of diversity. A country with a diverse composition is certainly vulnerable to conflict. Even a large and powerful country like Yugoslavia could be destroyed by a civil war, causing it to break into 7 new countries such as Slovenia, Croatia, North Macedonia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Montenegro, Serbia, and Kosovo (Çınar, 2019). The division that occurred in Yugoslavia certainly should not happen in Indonesia, even though both countries have similar demographic characteristics.

The spirit of tolerance must be incorporated into the world of education in Indonesia. The results of a survey conducted by the Laelah et al. (2023) reveal that 70.2% of high school students in Indonesia are tolerant, 24.2% are passively intolerant, 5% are actively intolerant, and the remaining 0.6% have been exposed to violent extremist ideologies. The data presented by the SETARA Institute explains the fact that intolerance has emerged in the midst of Indonesian youth's social life. Therefore, intolerance must be prevented immediately because otherwise, it can lead to division in society (Munawaroh & Kudus, 2023). This division can occur because socially, every individual is different from each other, and this condition can become a gap for the emergence of division in a diverse society.

Whether consciously or not, the gap of division has begun to enter the realm of education. Martitah et al. (2024) reports that violence rates in Indonesia are still high. The data was taken from three sources: the online information system for the protection of women and children, which reached 1,993 cases in 2024; the National Commission for Child Protection (Komnas PA), which recorded 3,547 cases throughout 2023; and the Indonesian Child Protection Commission (KPAI), which reported 2,355 cases. Ironically, 861 cases occurred in educational institutions, including 487 of sexual violence, 236 of physical and psychological violence, 87 bullying cases, 27 victims of inadequate educational facilities, and 24 victims of policy. The high rate of violence in the education sector is a sign that schools are no longer safe places for students.

Observing the high rates of violence, the world of education must improve. The Republic of Indonesia's Ministry of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology (Kemendikbudristek, 2023) is responsible for these improvement efforts. They issued Kemendikbudristek Regulation Number 46 of 2023, which is about stopping and dealing with violence in schools. The policy aims to safeguard all students in the school from various forms of violence. The Ministry of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology in Indonesia focuses on preventing and addressing violence through three domains: governance, education, and infrastructure. Considering these three aspects, one thing that can be done is to focus on the educational aspect by using the Value Clarification Technique (VCT) model as the basis for learning in the classroom.

The use of the VCT model as a focus for learning aligns with three main theories. The first theory is the theory of value education, which originated from Rathes et al. (1978). Essentially, this theory is the core of the VCT model. Introducing the value of tolerance through the VCT model is not merely providing information from a conceptual perspective. The most important thing to teach elementary school students is to encourage them to participate directly in activities such as dialogue, discussion, and self-evaluation (Murad, 2014). The value of tolerance among students must be clarified through classroom learning activities. In class, students are encouraged to identify something that requires acceptance of differences, understand its impact, and thus build a positive commitment to actively participate in maintaining peace among themselves.

Second, the application of the VCT model aligns with Kohlberg's theory of moral development. From that theoretical perspective, elementary school students are already in the early conventional moral stage. At this stage, students have already learned three things: understanding rules, considering others' perspectives, and evaluating the rightness or wrongness of an action (Garrigan et al., 2018). In the context of social life in the classroom, students are already taught to live in harmony with diversity as a reflection of the value of tolerance (Ngangi et al., 2024). Integration in the classroom can be seen from (1) shared class duty, (2) sitting next to other students, (3) being able to communicate, socialize, and respect differences, (4) working on group assignments, and (5) being mindful of words, actions, and deeds so as not to offend others. Additionally, students can also be encouraged to observe and analyze the positive and negative impacts of diversity and to extract positive values from events in their local environment.

Thirdly, we introduce James Banks' theory of multiculturalism. This theory focuses on teaching students to accept the social diversity present among them. Knowledge of tolerance is important to be presented in classrooms. The main goal is to foster respect, fairness, and empathy among students (Thijs et al., 2025). To realize these three aspects, the school must be a safe and comfortable place for the diverse social backgrounds within it. Therefore, students need to be taught to get used to negotiating in diversity. This negotiation is necessary not to argue about diversity, but to build a culture of open dialog so that tolerance, non-discrimination, and empathy can be fostered among students (Afifuddin et al., 2025).

In principle, theories of value education, moral development, and multiculturalism are an integral part of this research. These three theories further strengthen the important role of the VCT model in instilling tolerance values in elementary school students. This research can serve as an initial barometer to see the effect of the VCT model in strengthening tolerance knowledge in elementary school students. Research on elementary school students can also be a good detector for continuously instilling tolerance values and appreciating differences (Hidayati & Minsih, 2023). These three values can be said to be the core values that must continue to be promoted amidst the diversity that exists in Indonesia.

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

The learning model of Value Clarification Technique (VCT) impacts the students' knowledge values regarding the aspect of tolerance. This implies that the acquired knowledge contributes to the enhancement of students' tolerance values. These values are important for students to possess, especially considering the very diverse social conditions where students live, in terms of race, religion, ethnicity, language, and culture. The results of this study indicate that the implementation of the VCT model can provide beneficial information about choosing the right learning model to instill tolerance values in students. Teachers can utilize this model, particularly in schools that foster a multicultural social environment.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The researchers would like to thank all parties who contributed to this study. The researcher's special thanks go to the research partner schools. Thank you for giving me the opportunity to conduct this research smoothly. Additionally, the researchers would like to express their gratitude to the beloved campus of Surabaya State University for facilitating this research. Hopefully, this research can benefit future researchers in conducting studies on similar topics.

REFERENCES

- Afifuddin, A., Amri, M., Latif, A., Rosmini, R., & Tahir, S. Z. bin. (2025). *Negotiating multicultural values within centralized education systems: a case study of Indonesia*. July, 1–13.

- <https://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2025.1620685>
- Anis, A., Miftah, M., Manshur, A., & Nadiyya, A. (2024). Interconnection of Religion and Culture in the Multicultural Education in Indonesia. *The Journal of Multikultural Education in Indonesia*, 7, 13–24.
- Anwar, C., Saregar, A., Fitri, M. R., Anugrah, A., & Yama, A. (2023). Folklore with Value Clarification Technique : Its Impact on Character Education of 8-9-Year-Old Students. *Journal of Innovation in Educational and Cultural Research*, 4(1), 44–55. <https://doi.org/10.46843/jiecr.v4i1.414>
- Azeharie, S., Bajari, A., & Sari, W. P. (2023). Mapping of Latent Conflict in Sambas to Identify Potential Tolerance Level. *International Journal of Application on Social Science and Humanities*, 1(1), 907–914.
- Barth, M. (2021). Resolving Conflicts Between People and Over Time in the Transformation Toward Sustainability : A Framework of Interdependent Conflicts. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 12(April). <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2021.623757>
- Bhernama, B. G. (2021). Analisis Air Boiler Dengan Parameter pH, Alkalinitas, TDS, Hardness dan Silika di PT. Beurata Subur Persada. *AMINA*, 3(2), 62–68. <https://doi.org/10.22373/amina.v3i2.2002>
- Bilven, B., Nyúl, B., & Kende, A. (2022). Exclusive victimhood, higher ethnic and lower national identities predict less support for reconciliation among native and Chinese Indonesians through mutual prejudice. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 91, 262–273. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijintrel.2022.10.011>
- Chen, J. (2022). Representing Chinese Indonesians : Pribumi Discourse and Regional Elections in Post- - Reform Indonesia. *Journal of Current Southeast Asian Affairs*, 41(1), 59–87. <https://doi.org/10.1177/18681034211036716>
- Çınar, K. (2019). Dismemberment of Yugoslavia: Lessons for the Ethnic Conflict Literature. *Balkan Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 8(12), 15–27.
- Cole, S., Tallman, P., Salmon-Mulanovich, G., & Rusyidi, B. (2024). Water insecurity is associated with gender-based violence: A mixed-methods study in Indonesia. *Social Science & Medicine*, 344, 116507. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2023.116507>
- Duru, E., & Balkis, M. (2018). Exposure to school violence at school and mental health of victimized adolescents: The mediation role of social support. *Child Abuse & Neglect*, 76, 342–352. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chiabu.2017.11.016>
- Eko, B. S., & Putranto, H. (2021). Face negotiation strategy based on local wisdom and intercultural competence to promote inter-ethnic conflict resolution: Case study of Balinuraga, Lampung. *Journal of Intercultural Communication Research*, 50(5), 506–540.
- Friend, W., & Malhotra, D. (2019). Psychological Barriers to Resolving Intergroup Conflict: An Extensive Review and Consolidation of the Literature. *Negotiation Journal*, 35(4), 407–442. <https://doi.org/10.1111/nejo.12299>
- Garrigan, B., Adlam, A. L. R., & Langdon, P. E. (2018). Moral decision-making and moral development : Toward an integrative framework. *Developmental Review*, 49(March), 80–100. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dr.2018.06.001>
- Hatmono, P. D., & Sutimin, L. A. (2025). Effectiveness of Value Clarification Technique (VCT) Based Teaching Materials on High School Students ' Understanding of Multiculturalism : Mixed Method Approach. *Educational Process: International Journal*, 15(e2025157).
- Helmon, S., & Rahardi, R. K. (2020). Integration of Solidarity Values in the Torok Oral Tradition of the Manggarai Society Through Multicultural Education An Ecolingustic Studies. *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research*, 509(Icollite), 695–701.
- Hidayati, B. N., & Minsih. (2023). *The Value Clarification Technique Learning Model Improves the Character of Elementary School Students*. 7(2), 319–327.
- Jatiningsih, O., Roro, R., & Setyowati, N. (2024). *Towards a School Without Violence : An Analysis of Teacher ' s Understanding of the Anti -Violence Education Policy Permendikbudristek no 46 of 2023* (Vol. 2024, Issue 46). Atlantis Press SARL. <https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-38476-317-7>
- Kemendikbudristek. (2023). *Permendikbudristek Nomor 46 Tahun 2023 tentang Pencegahan dan*

- Penanganan Kekerasan di Lingkungan Satuan Pendidikan*. Database Peraturan. <https://peraturan.bpk.go.id/Details/285721/permendikbudriset-no-46-tahun-2023>
- Khan, S., Fuadah, S., Ikram, N., Aljouny, E., Zubair, M. T. M., & Nisar, S. (2025). Exploring mental health challenges and violence risks in high school population. *Scientific Reports*, *15*(1), 22367. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-025-05367-5>
- Laelah, N. A., Insiyah, S., Halili, & Hasani, I. (2023). *Survey Report Tolerance of High School Student*. Jakarta: Pustaka Masyarakat Setara.
- Lisievi, P., & Andronie, M. (2016). Teachers Assessing the Effectiveness of Values Clarification Techniques in Moral Education. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *217*, 400–406. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2016.02.111>
- Martitah, M., Sulistianingsih, D., Mohd Yusoff, R., & Ismail, N. (2024). Insufficient criminal justice system response to the severity of domestic violence during the pandemic in Indonesia. *Heliyon*, *10*(14), e33719. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2024.e33719>
- Munawaroh, I., & Kudus, W. A. (2023). Intoleransi Agama Bagi Kehidupan Masyarakat Minoritas di Kota Cilegon-Banten. *Jurnal Pendidikan Sosiologi Undiksha*, *5*(3), 240–246.
- Murad, A. V. (2014). The Process of Values Clarification , Formation and Inculcation. *Pakistan Journal of Social and Clinical Psychology*, *12*(2).
- Ngangi, W. J., Nursikin, M., Zaman, B., & Muhammad, K. (2024). *Moral and Personality Development in the Perspective of the SDGs : A Critical Analysis of Kohlberg ' s Theory and Its Implementation in Junior High Schools*. *25*(2).
- Pramana, A., Sumarno, A., Khotimah, K., Mariono, A., Surabaya, U. N., & Author, C. (2023). The Impact of Learning Strategies (Values Clarification Technique and Social Science Inquiry) and Students ' Cognitive Style on Tolerance. *Indonesian Journal of Instructional Media and Model*, *5*(2), 69–84.
- Raths, L., Harmin, M., & Simon, S. (1978). *Values and teaching: Working with values in the classroom (2nd ed.)*. Charles E. Merrill Publishing Company.
- Sakti, S. A., Endraswara, S., & Rohman, A. (2024). Revitalizing local wisdom within character education through ethnopedagogy approach: A case study on a preschool in Yogyakarta. *Heliyon*, *10*(10), e31370. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2024.e31370>
- Sanjaya, M. R. (2022). New Evidence on Ethnic Diversity and Social Capital in Indonesia. *Jurnal Ekonomi & Studi Pembangunan*, *23*(1). <https://doi.org/10.18196/jesp.v23i1.13863>
- Sitanggang, A. O. (2025). A systematic literature review : Character education to build tolerance. *Multidisciplinary Reviews*, *8*(10), e2025201. <https://doi.org/https://10.31893/multirev.2025201>
- Strøm, I. F., Thoresen, S., Wentzel-Larsen, T., & Dyb, G. (2013). Violence, bullying and academic achievement: A study of 15-year-old adolescents and their school environment. *Child Abuse & Neglect*, *37*(4), 243–251. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chiabu.2012.10.010>
- Suryani, N. (2010). VCT (Value Clarification Technique) Learning Model Application to Improve Historical Value Understanding. *HISTORIA: International Journal of History Education*, *11*(2), 198–217.
- Suryaningrat, R. D., Mangunsong, F. M., & Riantoputra, C. D. (2020). Teachers' aggressive behaviors: what is considered acceptable and why? *Heliyon*, *6*(10), e05082. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2020.e05082>
- Susanto, D., & Puryanto, S. (2022). The Necessity of Implementation by Local Values: Historical Study of ethnics conflict in Sampit Central Kalimantan Indonesia. *Perspektif*, *11*(3), 878–883.
- Thijs, J., Krijnen, M., Vemde, L. Van, Hornstra, L., Mainhard, T., & Wansink, B. (2025). The diversity teaching beliefs scale : Addressing cultural diversity , communalities between cultures , and the national culture in the classroom. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *153*(November 2024), 104846. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2024.104846>
- Ulpa, M., & Mislan. (2025). Penggunaan Model Value Clarification Technique (VCT) Untuk Meningkatkan Sikap Toleransi Siswa Kelas V Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Swasta Nurul Ittihad Kota Jambi. *Inspirasi Edukatif: Jurnal Pembelajaran Aktif*, *6*(2), 413–430.
- Umiarso, & Asnawan, A. (2022). Social Conflict Resolution Among Islamic Ideologies in Puger, Jember, East Java. *Dialog*, *45*(1), 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.47655/dialog.v45i1.576>

- Wismayanti, Y. F., O’Leary, P., Tilbury, C., & Tjoe, Y. (2021). The problematization of child sexual abuse in policy and law: The Indonesian example. *Child Abuse & Neglect, 118*, 105157. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chiabu.2021.105157>
- Zakiah, Q. Y., & Rusdiana, A. (2014). *Pendidikan Nilai Kajian Teori dan Praktik di Sekolah*. CV. Pustaka Setia.