

Using Canva to Increase Learning Motivation in Islamic Education SMA Muhammadiyah 1 Pare

Yasdan Ihza Mahendra¹, Mohamad Riza Zainuddin²

STAI Muhammadiyah Tulungagung,

*ihzayasdan@gmail.com

Abstract: *Learning innovation using the Canva application as a graphic design medium, has been proven to increase students' learning motivation in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) at SMA Muhammadiyah 1 Pare. This is based on researchers who conducted qualitative research with a case study approach, this revealed that the use of creative visual content in the form of da'wah posters and video quotes. This has been proven to strengthen the understanding of the material and foster active student engagement. Data analysis from observations, interviews, and documentation shows a surge in learning motivation from the low-middle category to higher levels, supported by adequate facilities, enthusiasm, learners, and ease of access to the platform. The technical obstacles and adaptation phases are their recording and implementation. These findings confirm that the integration of graphic design technology in PAI learning is not only effective but also in line with the needs of education in the 21st century, as well as opening opportunities for the development of other visual creative-based learning media.*

Keywords: *Canva, Digital media, Islamic Religious Education, Learning innovation, Learning motivation.*

Introduction

During the rapid flow of digitalization, information and communication technology (ICT) is the main driver of educational transformation that revolutionizes the conventional learning paradigm. The presence of ICT encourages the creation of an adaptive, open, and future-oriented educational ecosystem. Digital learning media is now

not just an aid, but a core component of modern learning strategies. Technology integration allows the curriculum to be designed more flexibly and tailored to individual students' needs, thus encouraging the emergence of a personalized and contextual learning approach.

Technological advances also open opportunities for cross-border collaboration through digital platforms, enabling interaction and exchange of knowledge between students and educators in different parts of the world. In this context, digital literacy is an essential competency of the 21st century which includes critical skills in managing information, using technology ethically, and adaptive ability to use digital learning media.

Innovations such as artificial intelligence (AI), virtual reality (VR), augmented reality (AR), and learning analytics are bringing education into a new era that is more personalized, interactive, and flexible. The boundaries of space and time in the learning process are increasingly fluid, allowing learning to take place anytime and anywhere. However, this development requires teachers to change the teaching methodology to be more dynamic, participatory, and in accordance with the characteristics of the digital native generation. This transformation is important so that education is not only relevant in terms of content, but also contextual in methodology, and able to prepare students to become lifelong learners in the era of disruption.

As a fundamental aspect of education, PAI has a strategic role in shaping the character, morals, and spirituality of students. According to Olfah, Virdayanti, and Kiftiyah (2024), religious education contributes greatly to forming a nation with noble character. The main challenge of PAI in the digital era is how to convey relevant, interesting, and contextual religious material without compromising the basic values of Islam.

Within the framework of Islamic pedagogy, motivation has a central position in the *tarbiyah process*. Al-Ghazali affirms that knowledge, charity, and intention are one unity; Knowledge will be of no use without charity, charity is worthless without intention, and intention will not be born without sincere encouragement. This means that spiritual and emotional motivation is at the core of the success of religious education. Ibn Khaldun in *Muqaddimah* said that teaching must be gradual according to the readiness of the intellect, because the soul will reject the knowledge given at once without context. This emphasizes the importance of interactive and contextual methods. Meanwhile, An-Nahlawi in *Ushul al-Tarbiyah al-Islamiyyah* emphasized that the use of modern media is permissible if it aims to instill Islamic values and form a perfect ummah.

Learning motivation is a determining factor for students' success in understanding the material. Jainiyah et al. (2023) state that teachers play a vital role in building student motivation through approaches and media that suit their characteristics. One effective innovation is the use of digital graphic design applications such as Canva. Canva provides interactive visual features that support the delivery of PAI materials in an engaging way. Research by Suryati et al. (2024) proves that the use of Canva can increase the learning interest of junior high school students in PAI subjects. Similar findings were also put forward by Syarifah Diadara and Putri Bagaskara Utama (2025), who found an improvement in PAI learning outcomes after using Canva.

Another study by Syahri et al. (2023) shows that Canva media can improve learning outcomes through visual and interactive approaches. Nurhidayah et al. (2023) emphasized that Canva in PAI learning is effective in strengthening students' understanding while increasing creativity. Kharissidqi and Firmansyah (2022) added that Canva's flexibility and ease of access make it a potential learning medium. From a psychological perspective, Harahap et al. (2021) stated that learning motivation functions to direct and maintain students' learning behavior, so that interactive visual media such as Canva can support the increase of intrinsic motivation.

Despite its great potential, the use of Canva is still minimal in some schools, including SMA Muhammadiyah 1 Pare, especially in PAI learning. In fact, the visual-interactive approach is very relevant to increase students' motivation to learn in religious subjects. This study aims to explore the effectiveness of Canva as an innovative learning medium in increasing PAI learning motivation in class XI-1 of SMA Muhammadiyah 1 Pare. The research focuses not only on increasing interest, but also on how Canva's visual design is able to convey religious values dynamically, relevantly, and in accordance with the principles of Islamic tarbiyah.

With the framework of Islamic pedagogy, the use of Canva is not only seen as a technological innovation, but as a means of *tarbiyah* that combines intrinsic motivation, moral formation, and the integration of knowledge and charity. This is in line with the vision of Islamic education to form people who *are faqih fid-din*, have noble character, and are ready to face the challenges of the digital era with a solid spiritual foundation.

Method

This study applies a descriptive qualitative approach to comprehensively explore how the Canva application plays a role in

increasing students' learning motivation in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) subjects in grades XI-1 of high school Muhammadiyah 1 Pare. The choice of this approach refers to the view of Moleong (2005) that qualitative research aims to understand phenomena in depth in a natural context, so that researchers can capture the dynamics of interaction between teachers, students, and digital media in the learning process. This approach also allows for the analysis of the social, psychological, and perceptual factors that shape students' learning experiences. This is in line with the findings of Hasan Syahrizal and Syahran Jailani (2023) who emphasize the importance of understanding the social context and subjective experiences of students in seeing the impact of digital media on religious education.

Data collection was carried out through a triangulation method involving participatory observation, in-depth interviews, and document analysis. The research took place at SMA Muhammadiyah 1 Pare, Kediri, East Java, with the researcher acting as the main instrument as well as the observer of the participants (Abdussamad, 2021). This role provides an opportunity to be directly involved in the dynamics of learning so that the data obtained is authentic. Classroom observations were conducted to see student-teacher interactions while using Canva, while semi-structured interviews with teachers and students explored perceptions, challenges, and impacts of using this medium. Primary data such as field notes are combined with school documents, curricula, and literature such as Suriyati et al. (2024) and Syahrir et al. (2023) to enrich the analysis (Citriadin, 2020).

Data analysis uses the interactive model of Miles and Huberman (2007) which includes data reduction, presentation, and conclusion drawing with repeated verification. The FIRST (Focusing, Interacting, Reviewing, Sequencing, Transforming) framework from Gafriadi (2023) maintains the systematic analysis to remain comprehensive. Validity is strengthened through source triangulation, extension of observation, and consistency of data examination (Sugiyono, 2008; Mahmudah, 2021).

This approach is in line with the principles of Islamic pedagogy. Al-Ghazali in *Ihya' Ulumuddin* emphasized: "The purpose of knowledge is to improve the heart and charity, not just to increase memorization." This confirms that learning media like Canva should be geared towards shaping students' character through meaningful learning experiences. Ibn Khaldun in *Muqaddimah* stated: "Teaching must be in accordance with the readiness of the mind and soul, because knowledge that is forced at the same time will be rejected by the soul." This quote

reinforces the importance of visual-interactive methods like Canva that fit the learning style of the digital generation.

Meanwhile, An-Nahlawi in *Ushul al-Tarbiyah al-Islamiyyah* states: "Modern facilities are permissible as long as they support the cultivation of Islamic values and the formation of noble morals." This thinking gives sharia legitimacy to the use of Canva as a PAI learning medium. Contemporary views such as Syed Naquib al-Attas are also relevant, who emphasizes that Islamic education aims to "inculcate manners in the soul, not just fill the mind with information." This shows that the integration of technology must be oriented towards character building, not just the transfer of knowledge.

Thus, this study does not only view Canva as a technological innovation, but as part of the implementation of Islamic tarbiyah that combines intrinsic motivation, moral formation, and a balance between cognitive, affective, and psychomotor aspects. Canva is a means to present religious learning that is relevant to the times without losing the spiritual essence and Islamic values.

Result and Discussion

Motivation Level to Learn Before Using Canva

The results of the research conducted on May 7, 2025, at SMA Muhammadiyah 1 Pare revealed that the level of student motivation to learn in the Islamic Religious Education (PAI) course is generally in the middle to low category. These findings suggest that there are significant challenges in creating a learning atmosphere that can arouse students' interest and active engagement. One of the main factors that affect this condition is the use of conventional learning methods that are still dominant in the form of one-way lectures. This model tends to place teachers as the centre of information while students act as passive listeners, so opportunities to interact, ask questions, or relate material to personal experiences are limited.

The lecture method does have the advantage of delivering dense material in a short time, but in the context of PAI learning in the digital era, this approach is less able to answer the needs of today's generation of students who are more responsive to visual, interactive, and technology-based stimuli. The lack of use of digital and visual media in the learning process makes PAI material feel abstract and far from the reality of student life. In fact, religious education not only requires cognitive understanding, but also the formation of spiritual attitudes, behaviours, and values that require a contextual approach to be easily internalized.

Attempts to vary the actual methods have been made by teachers, such as the application of group discussions, questions and answers, and simple demonstrations. However, the results of the study show that the variation is not optimal because it is not balanced with the use of visually appealing media or relevance with the context of student life. For example, discussions often focus only on the text of a book without the support of digital illustrations, videos, or infographics that can enrich students' understanding. This causes learning to still lack a fun and challenging learning experience, so that student motivation does not increase significantly.

In addition, the affective and spiritual aspects of PAI learning have also not been worked on optimally. The material is more delivered in the form of cognitive concepts and memorization, while the emphasis on the appreciation of religious values in daily life is less considered. As a result, students have difficulty connecting religious teachings to the social realities they face. The learning process that emphasizes memorization rather than contextual understanding makes students less likely to feel the direct relevance between PAI material and the formation of their morals and behaviours.

These findings provide an idea that the main challenge is not only in the methods used, but also in the integration of media and learning approaches that are in accordance with the characteristics of the digital generation. This research emphasizes the importance of innovation in PAI learning design that not only focuses on the delivery of information, but also pays attention to emotional, spiritual, and meaningful learning experiences. By utilizing visual media and technology such as Canva or similar applications, PAI learning has greater potential to increase students' motivation to learn, help them understand the material more easily, and deeply internalize religious values in their daily lives.

Implementation of the Canva App in PAI

The use of Canva as a creative and interactive learning medium in Islamic Religious Education subjects is carried out through three main stages, namely planning, implementation, and evaluation, which are integrated with each other.

At the planning stage, teachers place Canva as an integral part of the Learning Implementation Plan (RPP). Materials that are usually delivered textually, such as the theme "Taking Care of the Body", are transformed into more attractive visual forms, such as infographics, da'wah posters, or interactive slides. Teachers also set up design templates and technical guides to make it easier for students to

understand the workflow in Canva. This stage emphasizes careful pedagogical planning so that digital media is not just a variation, but supports the achievement of PAI learning objectives, including the internalization of Islamic values.

The implementation stage is carried out with a project-based learning approach that actively involves students. Students are given the task of creating digital products such as da'wah posters or Islamic video excerpts that combine relevant Qur'anic verses and hadiths. This activity involves three Domains of competence at the same time: cognitive, because students must understand the teaching material; affective, because they internalize religious values through creative processes; and psychomotor, as it requires digital design skills. Canva provides ample space for students to be creative, choosing appropriate colours, typography, and illustrations, so that their work reflects their personal understanding and expression of PAI material.

At the evaluation stage, teachers use an authentic assessment approach that assesses not only the final product, but also the work process, collaboration, and student involvement in learning. The students' works are then displayed in the school environment as a form of direct appreciation and uploaded to the school's social media to provide public recognition. This strategy not only increases students' motivation and confidence but also fosters spiritual pride because their work contains the message of Islamic da'wah.

This gradual approach makes PAI learning more humanistic, because it combines aspects of knowledge, attitudes, skills, and religious values in one process that is fun and relevant to the digital world of students. Canva not only serves as a design tool, but also to integrate Islamic values into creative, collaborative, and meaningful learning experiences.

Supporting and Inhibiting Factors

The main supporting factors in the implementation of Canva as a learning medium at SMA Muhammadiyah 1 Pare lie in three important aspects. First, the availability of school facilities is the initial foundation that facilitates the implementation of digital-based learning. Access to internet networks, computer devices, projectors, and classrooms that support interactive learning allow teachers and students to experiment more freely with new media. The readiness of this infrastructure provides a strong basis for the technology integration process, so that teachers are not only fixated on conventional methods.

Second, student enthusiasm is also a significant driver. Research shows that the current generation has a great interest in visual media

and interactive digital applications. Canva, as a simple yet creative design platform, can spark students' curiosity, increase active participation, and make the learning process more enjoyable. This interest demonstrates the compatibility between the characteristics of the media and the needs of the digital generation accustomed to dynamic visual displays.

Third, school policy support that encourages technology-based learning innovation also strengthens the success of implementation. The school provides a space for teachers to try out new methods, provide brief training, and ensure that the integration of digital media does not conflict with the values of Islamic education. The synergy between policies, facilities, and student enthusiasm creates a learning ecosystem that is conducive to the development of creativity in PAI learning.

However, behind this support, the research also found that there are obstacles that need to be anticipated. Technical issues such as unstable internet connections are a major obstacle, especially when learning requires simultaneous online access. In addition, not all student devices are in optimal condition to run design-based applications, so teachers must prepare alternatives to keep the learning process inclusive.

The variety of students' digital skills is also a challenge. Some students quickly adapt to using Canva, while others require intensive mentoring due to their lack of experience using design apps. This condition demands the active role of teachers not only as presenters, but also as technology facilitators who are able to compensate for differences in students' abilities.

Another factor that is no less important is the readiness of teachers to integrate technology into pedagogical approaches. Canva is not just a visual aid, but it requires proper learning planning so that it is not just a variety of views. The success of the implementation depends on the extent to which teachers can connect digital media with learning goals, religious values, and student needs. This requires teachers to develop TPACK (Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge) competencies so that technological integration does not lose its pedagogical essence.

Considering these supporting factors and barriers, the implementation of Canva in PAI learning can be a strategic step if done in a planned manner. Facility support, policies, and student enthusiasm are key assets, while technical and pedagogical challenges need to be addressed through teacher training, infrastructure improvements, and inclusive learning strategies.

Specific Analysis and Findings

The use of Canva in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning has a significant impact on classroom dynamics, especially in increasing students' intrinsic motivation. Before the use of digital media, the learning process tended to be passive, where students listened more to the teacher's lectures without many opportunities to be creative or express their understanding. With the Canva integration, the classroom atmosphere changes to be more active and interactive. Students are no longer just recipients of information but also play the role of creators of Islamic content that is in accordance with the digital context they face daily.

The visual works produced, such as da'wah posters or Islamic videos, provide a more personalized and meaningful learning experience. When these works are displayed in the school environment or uploaded to social media, students feel valued and recognized. This recognition fosters confidence increases emotional engagement and strengthens their bond with the subject matter. Public appreciation also encourages them to be more serious in their assignments, because their work is not only judged by teachers but also seen by the wider community.

In addition to influencing motivation, using Canva also enriches students' competencies beyond PAI material. Digital literacy increases as they learn to operate design applications, understand visual principles, and utilize social media positively. This shifts the paradigm of social media from just entertainment to a means of creative da'wah that spreads Islamic values. The project-based approach makes students more independent in managing tasks, learning to work together in teams, and honing communication skills to present their ideas.

The role of teachers in this context has undergone a transformation from just a material presenter to a facilitator who guides, directs, and supports students' creative processes. The integration of technology through Canva also helps balance the three main domains of Islamic education: the cognitive aspect through material understanding, the affective aspect through the internalization of values, and the psychomotor aspect through digital design skills. This approach is in line with the goals of Islamic education which emphasizes the integration of knowledge, charity, and morals. Thus, the use of Canva is not only technological innovation, but also a pedagogical strategy that reinforces the relevance of PAI learning in the digital age.

Conclusion

The results of research at SMA Muhammadiyah 1 Pare show that the Canva application can be used effectively in increasing students' learning motivation in Islamic Religious Education (PAI). A significant positive impact can be seen from the increase in student enthusiasm. This finding proves that the use of Canva-based digital media can create innovations in the PAI learning process that are more interesting and relevant to the needs of the times. Before using the Canva app, students' motivation to study was at a moderate to low level. This is due to the learning approach that is still conventional, dominant with lecture and recording methods without the support of interesting visual media. As a result, students are less enthusiastic, passive, and do not feel emotionally or cognitively involved in the PAI learning process. An unvaried and less responsive approach to students' learning styles is one of the main factors in this low motivation.

After implementing Canva, the learning process changes to be more creative, interactive, and meaningful. Through projects such as the creation of da'wah posters and Islamic video excerpts, students are actively involved in designing and visualizing religious materials. This not only increases students' cognitive, affective, and psychomotor engagement, but also provides space for them to express Islamic values in digital media that is close to their lives. Canva helps bridge the gap between abstract religious material and concrete, visual, and contextual delivery.

In its application, there are supporting and inhibiting factors. Supporting factors include the availability of infrastructure facilities such as LCDs, electronic devices, and adequate classrooms; high enthusiasm from students towards visual and digital approaches; support for school policies on the use of technology; and Canva's free, user-friendly access across multiple devices. Meanwhile, the bottlenecks include technical constraints such as internet connection disruptions and device malfunctions, students' lack of digital literacy in operating Canva optimally, and feature limitations in the free version of Canva that limit the use of premium elements such as exclusive audio and templates. However, these obstacles are technical and can be overcome through training, mentoring, and infrastructure improvements in stages.

Overall, the implementation of Canva in PAI learning has been shown to increase student learning motivation by creating a more participatory, relevant, and fun learning atmosphere. The learning process no longer focuses on one-way knowledge transfer but emphasizes the formation of understanding and value through active

and meaningful learning experiences. Canva is an effective means to bring religious materials closer to students' real worlds through inspiring and actionable digital media.

Thus, it can be concluded that Canva is not only a graphic design application, but also a transformative learning medium. He bridges the world of education with students' digital lives, unites Islamic values in a modern and interesting way of delivery, and revives the spirit of learning that has begun to dim. In the future, strategies like this need to be further developed, not only in PAI subjects, but also in various other fields of study, to create relevant, fun, and meaningful education for today's digital generation.

Acknowledgments

Thank you to all parties who have provided support, contributions, and cooperation in the implementation and completion of this research. The author specifically expresses his highest appreciation to the Principal of SMA Muhammadiyah 1 Pare and the teachers' council, especially Islamic Religious Education teachers, for the permission, opportunity, and full support given during the research process. Not to forget, the same award is given to students who have actively participated, provided relevant data, and showed high enthusiasm in participating in this research activity. Their involvement is an important and invaluable part of producing meaningful findings.

The author also expressed his deep gratitude to the supervisor for his consistent direction, constructive criticism, and academic assistance from the planning stage to the preparation of this scientific article. The guidance provided not only strengthens the theoretical and methodological framework of the research, but also encourages the author to maintain scientific integrity and writing quality.

Sincere gratitude is also expressed to the academic community of the Islamic Religious College (STAI) Muhammadiyah Tulungagung who have provided various forms of support, both directly and indirectly. A conducive academic environment, access to literature resources, and a collaborative spirit built in a campus environment are helpful in developing critical, solution-oriented scientific thinking. The institutional contribution of STAI Muhammadiyah Tulungagung is an important foundation in strengthening the academic capacity of writers during this research process.

The author also expresses his appreciation to all the other parties who cannot be mentioned individually, but have contributed in the form of valuable input, motivation, and technical assistance in completing this article. Through synergy and collaboration from various

parties, it is hoped that the results of this research can make a real contribution to the development of science, especially in enriching the discourse and learning practices of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) that are more innovative, transformative, and responsive to educational challenges in the current global era.

Bibliography

Book:

A.M, S. (2020). *Interaksi dan motivasi belajar mengajar*. Jakarta: Rajawali Press.

Abdussamad, Z. H. (2021). *Metode penelitian kualitatif*. Makassar: Syakir Media Press.

Al-Attas, S. M. N. (1999). *The concept of education in Islam: A framework for an Islamic philosophy of education*. Kuala Lumpur: International Institute of Islamic Thought and Civilization (ISTAC).

Al-Ghazali, A. H. (2005). *Ihya' Ulum al-Din* (Vol. 1). Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah.

Al-Nahlawi, A. R. (1983). *Ushul al-Tarbiyah al-Islamiyyah wa Asalibuhu fi al-Bait wa al-Madrasah wa al-Mujtama'*. Damaskus: Dar al-Fikr.

Citriadin, Y. (2020). *Metodologi penelitian: Pendekatan multidisipliner*. Gorontalo: Idea Publishing.

Ibn Khaldun. (2004). *Al-Muqaddimah*. Kairo: Dar al-Fikr.

Mahmudah, F. N. (2021). *Analisis data penelitian kualitatif manajemen pendidikan berbantuan software Atlas.TI 8*. Yogyakarta: UAD Press.

Milles, M. B., & Huberman, M. (2007). *Analisis data kualitatif*. Jakarta: Universitas Indonesia Press.

Moleong, L. J. (2005). *Metodologi penelitian kualitatif*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.

Sugiyono. (2008). *Metode penelitian pendidikan: Pendekatan kuantitatif, kualitatif dan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta

Journal Papers:

Jurnal QOSIM: Jurnal Pendidikan Sosial & Humaniora, 1(1), 13-23.
<https://doi.org/10.61104/jq.v1i1.49>

Journal Papers:

Nurhidayah, C., dkk. (2023). Pengembangan media pembelajaran berbasis aplikasi Canva pada mata pelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam (PAI) di MIN 1 Rejang Lebong. *PT. Media Akademik Publisher*, 1.

Diadara, S., & Utama, P. B. (2025). Pemanfaatan aplikasi Canva dalam meningkatkan hasil belajar Pendidikan Agama Islam kelas IV SD Al Qur'an Wahdah Islamiyah Bontang tahun pelajaran 2023/2024. *Jurnal Pendidikan*, 3.

Gafriadi, R. (2023). Focusing, interacting, reviewing, sequencing, transforming (FIRST) framework studi implement di SMPIT Ummur Quro Bogor. *Jurnal Teknologi Pendidikan*, 12.

Harahap, N. F., Anjani, D., & Sabrina, N. (2021). Analisis artikel metode motivasi dan fungsi motivasi belajar siswa. *Indonesian Journal of Intellectual Publication*, 1(3), 198–203. <https://doi.org/10.51577/ijipublication.v1i3.121>

Jainiyah, J., Fahrudin, F., Ismiasih, I., & Ulfah, M. (2023). Peranan guru dalam meningkatkan motivasi belajar siswa. *Jurnal Multidisiplin Indonesia*, 2(6), 1304–1309. <https://doi.org/10.58344/jmi.v2i6.284>

Kharissidqi, M. T., & Firmansyah, V. W. (2022). Aplikasi Canva sebagai media pembelajaran yang efektif. *Jurnal Pendidikan*, 2(4).

Olfah, M. L., Virdayanti, N., & Kiftiyah, F. (2024). Peran Pendidikan Agama Islam dalam membentuk karakter bangsa. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 3(2).

Suriyati, S., Abubakar, A., Nur, T., Swito, A., & Nuraeni, N. (2024). Pemanfaatan media Canva pada mata pelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam di Sekolah Menengah Pertama. *AlQalam: Jurnal Kajian Islam dan Pendidikan*, 16(1), 55–62. <https://doi.org/10.47435/alqalam.v16i1.2529>

Syahrir, A. P., Zahrah, S. P., & Salamah, U. (2023). Pemanfaatan aplikasi desain grafis Canva dalam pembelajaran multimedia di SMA Negeri 1 Taman. *Jurnal Pendidikan Multimedia*.

Syahrizal, H., & Jailani, M. S. (2023). Jenis-jenis penelitian dalam penelitian kuantitatif dan kualitatif. *Jurnal QOSIM: Jurnal Pendidikan Sosial & Humaniora*, 1(1), 13–23. <https://doi.org/10.61104/jq.v1i1.49>

Chapters in the book:

Abdussamad, Z. H. (2021). *Metode penelitian kualitatif*. Makassar: Syakir Media Press. 141.

Citriadin, Y. (2020). *Metodologi penelitian: Pendekatan multidisipliner*. Gorontalo: Idea Publishing. 205.

Mahmudah, F. N. (2021). *Analisis data penelitian kualitatif manajemen pendidikan berbantuan software Atlas.TI 8*. Yogyakarta: UAD Press.

Milles, M. B., & Huberman, M. (2007). *Analisis data kualitatif*. Jakarta: Universitas Indonesia Press. 16.

Moleong, L. J. (2005). *Metodologi penelitian kualitatif*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya. 37.

Sugiyono. (2008). *Metode penelitian pendidikan: Pendekatan kuantitatif, kualitatif dan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta 271 - 272.